

WOMEN ART EDUCATION IN PAKISTAN UNIVERSITIES: BASED UPON THE INTERVIEWS OF FACULTY MEMBERS

Farhana Altaf Qureshi.

PhD Candidate, Xiamen University, Xiamen, Fujian 361005, China.

Jiao Yicheng.

Faculty member, Institute of Education, Qingdao University, Shandong 266071,
China.

Saira Kanwal

Faculty member, College of Art & Design, IUB, Pakistan.

ABSTRACT: *Art education has brought in significant changes in the field of art in Pakistan. However, there has been limited research concerning the extent to which women reached their goals in the art industry after graduation. Fifteen female teachers from three universities in Pakistan were used as the sample. The semi-structured interview was conducted to collect data in which the qualitative analysis of the interview protocols resulted in a codebook. Results from the study show that the teaching profession is the most preferable profession which suits Pakistan's social, traditional, and religious values. Over recent years, the rising of many institutions that also offer art education has triggered the need for the services of an art teacher.*

KEYWORDS: art education, teachers, female, university, Pakistan

INTRODUCTION

Unlike the other parts of the world, Pakistan exhibits an interesting, unusual, and grim situation regarding the role of women in art education. The department of art at the university level is supervised mostly by female teachers. This situation was more evident during the regime of the 80s and 90s (Hashmi, 2018). Anna Molka Ahmad is one of the pioneers in art education in Pakistan who introduced it during the period of the 1940s in Punjab University, Lahore. There exists a connection between teaching students' behavior and personality, especially, an art teacher can change the behavior and attitude of the young generation (Hansen, 2005). Therefore, a teacher in Pakistani culture is seen as the one who plays a vital role as a teacher on one hand, and the other hand as a parent in one's whole life.

Art as a subject encompasses specifically painting, drawing, sculpture, architecture, photography, interior designing, exterior designing, textile designing, graphics designing, drama, dance, and music faculties (Dewey, 1934). However, among these

areas, painting is the most communicative and comprehensive form of fine art. Similarly, designing is usually focused to depict the practical aspect of fine art. The students learn new ideas through art education which subsequently represents their daily life experiences (Dewey, 1934).

The daily assignments pose new challenges to the students through which they discover new horizons of knowledge in resolving different problems (Mari Beth Coleman & Joan Grim). Also, participation in the art activities, the cordial and congenial environment, competitive trends, peace of mind, creativity through imagination are such important elements that are the basis to form one's personality (Sterpetti & Ventura, 2017). An artist feels a unique pleasure and delight when an artist produces a painting on paper, prepares a piece of art with plain clay, and when words are composed of ink. It gives him/ her a unique sense of inspiration towards progress in this field. This creative activity makes him unaware of the agonies of the tiring world and hence express himself in the most reliable and free mode to communicate with the world. Therefore, through art, one can depict the tiresome attitude of society in un-ending words.

Khan (2013) states that in the 1950s, art education experienced a rich decade only in Lahore-Pakistan. However, after the 1960s there was a pleasant and visible change in art education also in Karachi-Pakistan (Mughees, 2014). In the past years, Lahore and Karachi have always been the hub of art and culture in Pakistan. However, recently art Colleges and Universities are functioning throughout the country with good quality of Art education (Khan 2013). Also, there is a need for Art education in Pakistan at the schools' level. This is highly demanded in government schools. In this regard, several educationists especially art educationists have been frequently pointing out the need for the addition of art education as a fundamental part of the school's syllabi (Vandal 2004). However, art education is imparting in some private schools and higher education level with great zeal (Vandal 2004). Although Art and craft have been confined to the cottage industry and the majority of the people have been attached to this faculty, they have got such skills from their forefathers and they have become the breadwinners for their families (Khan, 2013). Therefore, art and craft education has become the window of success for the majority of the people. Looking at the development of art education in Pakistan, therefore, becomes pertinent to note that, the whole family had been involved in these art activities and the role of women had great significance in this regard (Khan, 2013).

The trend in Art and Pakistani women

Women are inclined and have an interest in nature and therefore, they possess sensitive and aesthetic feelings. Art education suited feminine nature and assist women in fulfilling their sphere in life (Stankiewicz, 1982). Educational and artistic trends are changing rapidly and its strong feelings are being realized. During the

19th century, art education was more than a polite pursuit for women (Soucy, 1989). In the subsequent period, it has been observed that girls get married at their early age in Pakistan since the parents feel that it is their prime obligation to marry their daughters at that age (Salik & Zhiyong, 2014). Therefore, due to inadequate resources for enrolling in higher institutions, the girls prefer to join diploma courses for art after passing their matriculation (grade 10). Basing on this setup, it becomes possible that within a short period, they become technically master in their respective field of art.

The teaching profession attracts great respect from all segments of society. In this respect, the teaching profession can be viewed as a good profession by Pakistani Women. It is the most preferable profession which suits their traditional and religious values. As stated earlier in addition to private institutions are on the rise and many institutions are imparting art education. So the need for the services of an art teacher is increasing tremendously. Furthermore, ample job opportunities for art graduates are available in fields such as textile designing, fashion designing, interior designing, graphics designing, color consultancy (for companies manufacturing paints), stage decorator on the occasion of marriage ceremonies and festivals, boutiques, selling of artworks has increased the need for art education. Various reasons such as household responsibility, no permission by parents to move outside of the house make the women at home to enjoy the art activities such as paintings, hand-made greeting cards, knitting and weaving, cloth designing, jewelry designing, become self-employed by opening at the home boutique and also get appreciation through their skills. The women are also encouraged by the exhibitions that are usually organized in remarkable venues to display their masterpieces. It is an interesting fact that sometimes women belonging to rich families, enroll themselves for art education to show their superior social status and such ladies are status conscious and for the execution of their taste, they adopt it and continue it. These kinds of women often join the fashion industry, TV Channels, and open art galleries, etc.

Looking at the above observations in Pakistan and reports in the literature, this study was conducted to explore the important factors that drive women to Art education and much they have succeeded in attaining their set objectives in the area. The benefits of women were also examined especially those who have qualified themselves as skilled in the art subject.

ART SCENE IN PAKISTAN

The research results from all the papers under the study were largely published to spread the information regarding art education in the country. These papers were mostly published between 2014 and 2018. Of interest is the fact that all of the papers found were written on visual art, visual art experience, and visual artist as well.

In a study carried out in 2014 researchers found that the cubism movement has its impact on the young artists of Pakistan and the movement has proved a sole source of

art propagation and it was leading for initiating new trends of art in Pakistan. As a final thought cubism art, such a launching pad for artists, who were struggling and trying to create a new horizon of knowledge and are in a position to depict in their form. No doubt Shakir Ali is regarded as the first courageous artist for introducing cubism in Pakistan (Mughees, 2014). In a different study by (Imran, 2017). it is observed that the sensitive artist community always express their innersole with the help of meaningful objects and symbols in artworks. This sort of artistic work is produced with a clear message for the Government and Society. The artistic community, especially the female artists speaks out their recognition and it is highlighted the wide scope of unfairness that the military government inflicted through their artworks (Imran, 2017).

The researcher found that there was a significant contribution of two female contemporary painters of Pakistan. The internationally recognized two women artists, Meher Afroz and Nahid Raza expressed the social history of their era through color, texture, and metaphors on the canvas and paper. They did a lot in the Art field and earned a name in the whole world. In addition to the above, it was examined that, the political Art scene was growing and it was completely changed aftermath of 9/11. The trend of art education got tremendous changes in the Pakistani Art scenario, some of the artists used their creative energy within the set parameters and rules of the government, while others, violated (Ali, 2012). While, the young authors are of the view that “the ubiquity and variance of contemporary art since 1989 challenges art historians, curators, and critics attempting to account for works of art created in a truly global context” some artists observed it in the global context and described it as a sensitive segment of the society which depicts political changes in their way. This means and artists their brush made it clear for the whole society of Pakistan (Khan M. S., 2013).

With a different view is a research done by (Alexandra, 2010) in which she explained that women in Pakistan has made outstanding efforts and they proved themselves in Pakistan art scene, even in the international art landscape also. She mentioned that, “Women also hold a prime position to influence Pakistan’s art system, running influential art galleries in Karachi, Lahore, and Islamabad. Salima Hashmi played a significant role to promote art in Pakistan” (Alexandra, 2010).

In another study, some scholars such as Nazish Ataulah, Farida, and Batool explained that women in Art education were greater than in another period in 1980. The women were successful to depict and they conveyed their sentiments to the world. In Islamabad, the Asian Group (ASG) invited and Pakistani renowned Artist, Professor Salima Hashmi to talk about contemporary art in light of her recently published book titled: titled ‘The Eye Still Seeks: Pakistani Contemporary Art’. She declared:

“Today I am looking primarily at the social and political concerns that have engaged Pakistani artists and explore the process through which this has come about. Pakistan’s contemporary art scene, arguably the most exciting in South Asia, has grabbed international attention in recent years.”

Also speaking at the event was Dr. Brigitta-Blaha, Ambassador of Austria and ASG Patron. She stated:

“The art scene in Pakistan is very exciting. In my own country, we have two art galleries that represent Pakistani artists who have gained international renown. Now you come across Pakistani artists in most European countries and in Pakistan itself, I don’t think I have been in any house, except in the very rural areas, where there is no Pakistani contemporary art on the walls,” (Kazim, 2016).

METHODOLOGY

The study was exploratory qualitative in nature which utilized a case study design in which three institutions were selected through purposive sampling technique; two from Bahawalpur and one from Lahore. One of the universities chosen was Sadiq girls women University Bahawalpur which is a prominent educational institution of Bahawalpur where art education is being provided through its fine art department since 1964. It is also the leading art education department in women's institute in Pakistan. The other institution chosen was the College of Art & Design, The Islamia University of Bahawalpur which is offering art education since 2005. The Institute of Art and Design, Lahore College Women University, Lahore was the 3rd institution chosen. This is because, the city of Lahore is itself a legendary nature, known for its art institutions and art activities throughout the world. Also, the Institute of Arts and Design, Lahore College Women University offers a broad range of disciplines in art education equipped with highly qualified, trained, result-oriented, unique in their approaches, and above all they have excellent experience in the field of art education. The sample consisted of Female art teachers who are employed to teach in art institutions who were selected using a purposive sampling technique. The interviews were conducted at length from fifteen teachers who were selected purposively from three institutions in which the data was collected using a semi-structured interview. The teachers had plenty of experience in their field which ranged from 4 to 39 years. They also belonged to the age group of 30 to 62 years. In this context, teachers were contacted and were explained the purpose of the study. Subsequently, most of the teachers agreed to participate except for two teachers. A detailed review of the sample is shown in table 1.

Table 1. Details of the participating Teachers

3.1 Instruments

| Institution | No. of teachers | Designation | Imparted Educational stage. |
|---|-----------------|---------------------|--|
| Institute of Design and visual arts, Lahore college Women University Lahore | 5 | Assistant professor | Bachelor of fine art/ Masters of Fine Arts |
| | 2 | Associate professor | Masters of Fine Arts/ Ph.D |
| | 1 | Professor | Masters of Fine Arts/ Ph.D |
| Department of fine arts Sadiq women university Bahawalpur | 4 | Lecturers | Bachelor of fine art |
| College of art & design Islamia University | 2 | Lecturers | Bachelor of fine art |
| | 1 | Professor | Masters of art |

To acquire the data, the mobile phones and emails which are the latest tools of communications of the present era were. A questionnaire was sent by email to the concerned teachers. The questions were asked about their experience in art studies and proficiency in life. Before the interview participants received a concise introduction to the study and an overview of the interview questions. Moreover, during questioning, the intention was to get the exact information about the subject. Table 2 shows the interview questions that were asked.

Table 2: Interview Questions were conducted with female art teachers.

| Interview Questions | Reason |
|--|--|
| | Personal |
| Why are you interested in Art Education? | Social Family Other None |
| Purpose of acquiring an art degree? | Aesthetic Financial Other Financial Assistance |
| The advantage of getting an art degree? | Status-Conscious Art-loving Other Social advantages |
| Why art education suits women? | Self-satisfaction Free atmosphere Other Good |
| Your experience? | Bad Other |

Procedure

Conducting interviews via phone calls and emails, were beneficial to acquire more perspective and insight into the relevant personalities. After some introductory questions about their teaching and professional experience, the respondents were led through the interview questions. A detailed description of the interview is shown in table 4.

Table 3: Detail description of the interview

| Participants | Age (years) | Teaching experience (years) | Q:Why you are interested in Art Education? | Q:Purpose of acquiring an Arts Degree? | Q:Advantage for getting an Arts Degree? | Q:Why Art Education suits women? | Q:Suggestion For girls | Q:Experience Good /bad |
|--------------|-------------|-----------------------------|--|--|---|--|---|---------------------------------|
| AT- 1 | 62 | 32 | Personal Interest | Satisfaction of Aesthetics | Can express feeling through Artwork/ They can create a pleasant and comfortable environment in their abodes | Due to the sensitive and aesthetic nature of work | Much better for women than men | Good |
| AT- 2 | 52 | 27 | Own choice | Self-satisfaction | Status-conscious/ interacting with all segments of the society | Sometimes women get Art education only to impress others | Introduction of Art is important in early education | Good, Student life and teaching |

| | | | | | | | | |
|------|----|----|--------------|------------------------|-----------------------|---|---|----------------------------------|
| AT-3 | 42 | 15 | Own choice | Self-satisfaction | Intellectual grooming | Earning hand | If they are really planned to become practicing Artist or utilize their aesthetics, then chose this field | Best for a job for women |
| AT-4 | 46 | 15 | | Degree | Self-satisfaction | Good for women rather than men | If interested, they think they are creative then, take this field | Never had the worst experience |
| AT-5 | 55 | 20 | Own interest | Aesthetic satisfaction | Related to daily life | Art education is, for women is a blessing in this age of misery | Good for home decoration and self-grooming | To learn about nature and beauty |

| | | | | | | | | |
|-------|----|----|------------------|---|-------------------------------------|--|---|---|
| AT-6 | 60 | 15 | Own interest | Seek a better environment | To get a sense of good behaviour | For women, Art is the best option to build up a new generation | Self-Grooming and broad-minded | Both very much pleasant |
| AT-7 | 40 | 15 | Social influence | Just For degree | Status-conscious | Women empowerment | For self-expression | Exhibitions & |
| AT-8 | 38 | 10 | Social influence | None availability of admission in science subject | To get a job easily | Good for domestic | Art education good for social and economic future | Pleasure teach to students |
| AT-9 | 34 | 8 | Own interest | Self-satisfaction | Related to everyday life | Creative & change behaviour about things | For social atmosphere change | Excellent experience in studies & teaching both |
| AT-10 | 33 | 6 | Own interest | For aesthetic satisfaction | Good for household and earning both | For job and the decoration of house | For change in society | More satisfied to teach the student |

| | | | | | | | | |
|-------|----|----------|------------------|------------------------------|------------------------------|--|---|---|
| AT-11 | 41 | 15 | Family influence | Aesthetic satisfaction | Becoming earning hand easily | becoming earning hand | | Best experience of my exhibitions |
| AT-12 | 40 | 13 years | Family influence | Becoming earning hand easily | Becoming technical hand | Not suitable hard work for girls, that's why art education is better for girls | For grooming | Feel good when students won a prize in competitions |
| AT-13 | 38 | 8 | Own interest | Becoming technical hand | Self-Expression | For Creativity in everything | should compulsory | When students show interest then feel pleasure |
| AT-14 | 35 | 5 | Social influence | Self-Expression | Earning hand | Aesthetic work | Course in school and college | Sometimes none cooperative behavior of family, and sometimes financial issue |
| AT-15 | 30 | 4 | Own interest | Earning hand | for a job | for the decoration of house and creativity | Suitable for women because sensitive nature | Sometimes facing problem for none cooperation family about outdoor activities (in student life) |

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

From the interview, most of the teachers belong to the middle class while few of them represented the privileged class. Moreover, out of the 15 teachers, 14 were urban-based and one teacher from a rural area. All the teachers had a solid academic background and the majority of them considered art education as a useful subject for women. Answers from the respondents are shown in table 4.

Table 4: Answers from the respondents

| Question | Reason | No. of answers |
|--|-------------------------------------|----------------|
| Why are you interested in Art Education? | Personal | 9 |
| | Social | 4 |
| | Family | 2 |
| | Other | 0 |
| Purpose of acquiring art degree? | Not admissible on other discipline. | 3 |
| | Aesthetic | 10 |
| | Only to acquire degree | 2 |
| | Other | 0 |
| The advantage for getting an art degree? | Financial Assistance | 4 |
| | Status-Conscious | 1 |
| | Art-loving | 8 |
| | Other | 2 |
| Why art education suits to women? | Social Advantages | 3 |
| | Self-satisfaction | 6 |
| | Free atmosphere | 4 |
| | Other | 2 |
| Your experience? | Good | 9 |
| | Bad | 0 |
| | Other | 6 |

To explain the responses from these constructs, the interview questions were divided into three categories such that elaborations can be made. These are as follows.

Reason: to get the Art subject

On this question, the researcher wanted to investigate the views of the participants on, why are women interested in Art education? The responses from the participants in table 4 shows, nine teachers stated that they joined art education because of personal interest, according to 4 participants they joined art institute because of social influence. And other 2 agreed with the statement that they joined art education because of family influence.

Personal interest

On this construct, the researcher wanted to look at the personal reasons which derive a person into art education. These are decisions made by a person without many of the external factors, below are 2 excerpts taken from the interviews;

‘I joined art school because of personal interest, I wanted to become an artist. Methods of art are so interesting and easy to learn; it is the reason why there are large numbers of girls that apply for it.’ A-T 1

On the same construct, another respondent stated the following,

“I chose fine arts at my own choice because I liked the jobs which are close to my nature, practical and hands-on. I was not good at mathematics and not interested in science subjects so decided to carry out the art education” A-T 8

Looking at the above two excerpts from the interviews, one may state that the respondents were interested in art education due to their motives. It is also shown that women are likely to join art education not only because it is relatively easy but because it is close to their nature.

Family Influence

This is a construct that was shown in the responses. The data collected showed that the family had a bearing on the subject selection for students. In most cases, the young students will not be conversant with the subject selection hence they are likely to be driven by the family desires. In support of this, the researcher took an excerpt from one of the respondents and it is shown below.

“My family always wanted me to be an artist because my mother is an artist and operating a successful art gallery in Lahore. This was far from my goals but the pressure on me to do arts kept on increasing when I finished high school, however now I am satisfied as a practicing artist and an art teacher” A-T 11.

“I belong to a rich family; my main goal was to become a mechanical engineer. However, as I grew up the family was discouraging me from engineering and they thought it was supposed to be a male job. There was pressure forcing me to do art because I was good at drawing also” AT 12

Based on the above responses, there is evidence that some women choose art education because of its appreciation by the family. The satisfaction gained in art education can be said to be emanating from the family.

Social influence

As mentioned in the literature review section, society had a bearing on the careers take by students especially the female ones. In this extract, the researcher wanted to evaluate the extent to which women choose art education as a response to the society from which they come from. In their explanation, the respondents stated that social influence was playing a role in their career selection. One of the extracts from the interviews is given below.

‘I opted for art education because of social influence. I skilled myself in this discipline and now enjoying a comfortable job in addition to having busy conducting art exhibitions hence interacts with all segments of society in a better way’ A-T 2

‘I belong from a well-off family and I was a bit status-conscious also. I liked the interaction with well-educated people, especially with the artist community. Exhibitions of artworks best way to express me and communicate with society A-T 7

The concepts of exhibitions have been seen to be one of the eye-catching factors in the selection of art subjects by women. It is also noted that some students are from well off families are likely to join art education so that they gain access to the whole community through their artworks. In the analysis, the well-off families can be linked to the fact that they can afford to pay the higher expenses involved in the buying of art materials required to complete the art projects.

Advantage: for getting an Arts degree

On this question, the researcher wanted to examine the views of the stakeholders on, why art education suits women, and what is an advantage for getting an art degree? The responses from the participants in table 3 show most of the teachers indicated that the first advantage as a woman becoming an earning hand after having adorned with the art education and it creates a pleasant and comfortable environment in their abodes also. When women equip themselves with the art field, they use their leisure time not only for themselves but also for their loved ones. This situation enhances their self-confidence and they become more self-reliant which boosts themselves. Also, they become a more powerful, result-oriented entity and a beneficial society emerges. Participants also indicated that, in the existing era of violence, conflict, unrest, haphazard situation, a desire for hankering after money, and tension, relatively a peaceful and better atmosphere is possible through the adherence of art education.

One of the extracts from the participants is given below.

“Of late many students have realized the opportunities offered by art education. There are a lot of good jobs which give high income after graduation, I am enjoying the good life as an art teacher and practicing artist” A-T 3

“I chose fine arts at my own choice because I liked the jobs which were practical and hands-on. Firstly, I applied for medical but I didn’t have admission, So I decided to carry out the art subject in university hence I am very much satisfied with my decision.”-A-T 8

“I perceive art education to be very beneficial to my life because of the brighter future I see in the Art field, I have 32 years of teaching experience in university. Most people are earning high through exhibitions and as a designer in the textile industry, and also have many opportunities in schools and institutes as an Art teacher these days in Pakistan.” A-T 1

“Women attract by beautiful colors, flowers, birds, trees, mountains, meadows and even the melody of rain impress them to a great extent. Painting gives me pleasure when I paint, no doubt fine arts suites feminine nature.” A-T 5

“Art education is women-oriented. Doing art allows me to tell my story to the world through Artwork. I am interested in painting and I like the different colors when expressing my idea. I agreed that the women adorned with art education are not only self-groomed but also broad-minded.” A-T 6

The responses given above shows those attaining a qualification in art education come along with benefits. The initial respondent mainly highlighted the financial benefits and stated that most of the art graduates will have better lives when they start work in the Art field. The second respondent showed that she did art education due to the love of it. This response was in line with the one in the first construct in which women chose art education because of the good earning and self-satisfaction. The second extract above goes well in hand with the third response in the sense that she perceived art education to be very beneficial to her life. The other 2 respondents mainly highlighted that Art is feminine and Art projects allow them to tell their stories to the society and world through creative works.

Experience

On this question, the researcher wanted to investigate the views on, participants' experience in student life and as an art teacher: The responses from the participants in table 4 shows that all teachers have overall good experience as an art teacher, practicing artist and in students' life also. However, some of them faced some difficulties in student life and professional life also, such as time management issues, the rude attitude of the society. Two teachers faced a financial problem with their student life.

None cooperative behavior of family and society

Two teachers showed their reservations about the non-cooperative behavior of their families during student life. Respondents expressed their concerns in these words

“In my student life when I was not allowed to go outside alone of the houses to proceed outdoor projects (landscape or photography of the people in different places and to purchase art material. In this way, sometimes the behavior of my family members was so futile and created constraints before their commitments. A-T 14, 15

In this context, 10 other teachers were not happy with the attitude of the society during their student life. Also, even today, free mobilization of females is not considered appropriate in society. In the same way, society has still apprehensions about their interaction with their male colleagues.

Financial Problem

Two Art teachers faced problems due to financial issue during their student life. Also, the art material is not available in small towns. Moreover, if the required material is available, then the prices were very high and also the quality is not up to the mark.

‘I faced financial problems in my student life since the quality art materials were very expensive and sometimes the same material was not available in the local market. AT 10

“Art projects require art materials from time to time. In most cases, my parents find it difficult to buy them...” A-T 14

Time management issue

Seven other teachers indicated the issue of time management in their student life and practical life as well. The teachers were of the view that art education is a time-consuming subject that mostly engages them and they remain busy all day and night. Therefore, due to this tight schedule, they were unable to find time for domestic chores during their student lives which bring a lot of challenges in family life.

CONCLUSION

The goal of the paper was to investigate the involvement of women in art education in Pakistan. The researcher wanted to establish the main motivating factors of the involvement of women in art education. The study was also aimed at finding out the challenges which are experienced by Art teachers when they join art institutes.

Data constructs from the interviews indicate that women have immense potential and talents towards science subjects and they gained distinction positions which are dominated by men. Results also show that there are social and cultural constraints which causes some girls not to apply for science subjects while they also get involved in early marriages. Results indicate that the ratio of women employed in the fields of administration, laboratories, and banking is quite meager. It was also found out that, the women adorned with art education are not only self-groomed but also cautious and broad-minded.

Research shows a diversity of results and there was an analysis of the motivating factors as well as the challenges which are also encountered. Firstly, the study revealed that women join art education due to personal decisions. The decisions which are made by the women upon joining higher education are however mainly

decided by the person's family background. Most of the respondents showed that they preferred art education because they liked the subject due to personal interest. The main issue was that they become financially independent, this gives them a sense of fulfillment. The second finding of the study is that of social influence, the society in which the women come from is inclined to the love of art to prove themselves through their Artworks and interacts with the Artist community. However, in some cases family had been seen to be also playing a crucial role in motivating women into art education, if the family was highlighted educated and well-off. Two respondents showed that they chose art subjects because of the positive recommendations they received from their families. The research also established that the love for art education would gradually develop as the family kept on influencing them. Lastly, the majority of the respondents showed that they had a very good experience after getting an Arts degree.

In conclusion, there is sufficient evidence to state that the involvement of women in art education is increasing in Pakistan, and a gap is being filled which existed for some decades. There is needing however to increase the participation of women in the decision-making boards. Recommendations were also made that art education should be part of the curriculum at the lower levels of education. Also, there was needed to establish a department of fine arts at each college and university. Dewey said; "Arts education was a foundational part of the curriculum because it developed creativity, self-expression, and an appreciation of the expression of others" (Dewey, 1934, 1919).

Limitation of the study

The study was carried out within a very short period. This made it hard for the researcher to carry out a longitudinal study which would give a relatively detailed analysis of the research phenomena. Secondly, the research sample was small with only fifteen female teachers from the selected three universities. This was due to both financial and time constraints. To counter the limitations, the researcher decided to use the qualitative method of data analysis to have in-depth knowledge of the research phenomena. However, there were limitations on the current study due to the relatively small number of teachers that participated. However, a little number of women interviewed, sufficient enough to strikeout the required facts and reasons was found.

References

- Alexandra, S. (2010). Linda Nochlin in her landmark essay of 1971: women, art and power and other essays, Harper & Row, 1988,145-178. new york. Retrieved 2 1, 2019, from <https://www.newsweek.com/pakistans-female-artists-take-art-world-storm-71377>
- Ali, A. (2012). 'Critical Spaces as Spaces of Discontent'. Nukta Art; London Vol. 7,

- Iss. 2, (Dec 31, 2012):, 1-8.
- Blaikie, F. (2018). “Beauty and Callousness: The World of Drone Art. “Thoughts Concerning a Feminist Emphasis in Art Education” 45 (2):, 49–52.
- Collins, G. ((2018).). “National Art Education Association Explanations Owed My Sister: A Reconsideration of Feminism in Art Education Author (s): Georgia Collins Source: Studies in Art Education, Vol. 36, No . 2 (Winter, 1995), Pp. 69-83.
- Dewey, J. 1919. *Imagination and expression*. Teachers College Bulletin, 10(10):7–15. —. 1934. *Art as experience*. New York: Penguin. —. 1938. *Experience and education*. New York: Macmillan
- Dumbadze, A, and Suzanne Hudson. (2013). “Contemporary Art: 1989 to the Present,” no. 2: 512.
http://www.amazon.com/Contemporary-Art-Present-Alexander-Dumbadze/dp/1444338668/ref=pd_sim_b_2?ie=UTF8&refRID=0PJT8N071K83KF3_9PA26.
- Eder, W. ((1995).). “Engineering Design — Art, Science, and Relationships.”. *Design Studies* 16 (1): 117–27. [https://doi.org/10.1016/0142-694X\(95\)90650-5](https://doi.org/10.1016/0142-694X(95)90650-5).
- Eldridge, L. ((2016)). “National Art Education Association Dorothy Dunn and the Art Education of Native Americans: Continuing the Dialogue Author (s): Laurie Eldridge Source: Studies in Art Education, Vol. 42, No . 4 (Summer, 2001), Pp. 318-3.
- Elinor, Gillian, and Erica Matlow. (2018). “Art Education Author (s): Gillian Elinor and Erica Matlow Source: Feminist Review, No. 18, Cultural Politics (Winter, 1984), Pp. 127-128 Published by Palgrave Macmillan Journals Stable URL: <https://www.jstor.org/stable/1394869> Art Education,” no. 18: 127–28.
- Garber, E. ((2016)). “National Art Education Association Feminism, Aesthetics, and Art Education. Source : Studies in Art Education, Vol. 33, No . 4 (Summer, 1992), Published by National Art Educ, Pp. 210-225.
- Hafeli, M. (2017). “National Art Education Association Angels, Wings, and Hester Prynne : The Place of Content in Teaching Adolescent Artists. Source: Studies in Art Education, Vol. 44, No . 1 (Autumn, 2002), Pp. 28-4.
- Hansen, D. T. (2005). *Creativity in Teaching and Building a Meaningful Life as a Teacher*. *The Journal of Aesthetic Education*, 39(2), 57-68.
- Hashmi, S. ((2018)). *Guerrilla Girls: Feminist Art, Then and Now*. Retrieved 3, 12, 2018, from [artnowpakistan:](http://www.artnowpakistan.com) Retrieved, from <http://www..com/guerrilla-girls-feminist-art-then-and-now/>
- Hatfield, C. V. (2006). “Artist/Art Educator: Making Sense of Identity. Issues.” *Art Education*, 59 (3): 42–47.
- Imran, M. M. (2017). “A HISTORY OF VISUAL ART IN PAKISTAN. : STUDYING THE RESISTANCE AGAINST ZIA-UL- HAQ ’ S MILITARY”, 2 (54): 225–39.
- Jude, A. (. (2016). *Gendering, Careers and the Art School Curriculum*. South Australian School of Art, University of South Australia.

- Keifer-Boyd, K. (2003). "A Pedagogy to Expose and Critique Gender Cultural Stereotypes Embedded in Art Inter. " *Art Education National Art Education Association A Journal of Issues and Research*, 44 (444): 315–34.
- Khan, M. S. (2013). *The Changing Perspective of Art Education in Pakistan*. Paper presented at the Role of Academic Staff Association in the Promotion of Higher Education, Bara Gali Summer Campus, Peshawar University.
- Khan, M. S. (2014). *The Changing Perspective of Art Education in Pakistan 'Art Education in Pakistan*. Retrieved 2, 1, 2019, from <https://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/ED555254.pdf>
- Mughees, S. (2014). "CUBISM IN PAKISTAN: ' AN EVOLUTIONARY GLANCE '. *Sunway Academic Journal* Volume 10, 1" 10: 1–22.
- PEPIN-WAKEFIELD., Y. ((2010)). ' Beyond the Veil: Learning to Teach Fine Arts in a Muslim Culture'. Source: *Art Education*, Vol. 63, No. 6 (November 2010), Published by National Art Education Association, pp. 13-18.
- Sajida, Vandal. (2004). . "Art Education in Pakistan: A Case Study of Bringing Art to School Children at the Informal Level 1–6. *Hongkong*.
- Salik, M. & Zhiyong (2014). *Gender Discrimination and Inequalities in Higher Education: A Case Study of Rural Areas of Pakistan*. *Academic Research International*, 5(2).
- Smith, P. (. (1988). "The Role of Gender in the History of Art Education: Questioning Some Explanations. ' *National Art Education Association: Studies in Art Education*, Vol. 29, No . 4 (Summer, 1988), Published by National A." 2018 2, Pp. 232-240.
- Soucy, D. (1989). *More Than a Polite Pursuit. Art College Education for Women in Nova Scotia, 1887-1930s*. *JSTOR*, , 42(2), 23-40.
- Stankiewicz, M. A. (1982). *The Creative Sister: An Historical Look at Women, the Arts, and Higher Education*. *Studies in Art Education*, 24(1), 48-56.
- Sterpetti, A. &. (2017)). *The study of art and its influence on the education of surgeons*. *RESEARCH PeerRev*: 10.1308/rcsbull.2017.
- Syeda, S. K. (2016). *Pakistan's contemporary art scene most exciting one in South Asia*'. Retrieved 8, 2, 2018, from <https://www.dawn.com/news/1285801>.
- Thurber, F. (2017). "National Art Education Association An Evolving Feminist Leadership Model for Art Education Author (s): Frances Thurber and Enid Zimmerman. *Studies in Art Education*, Vol. 44, No . 1 (Autumn, 2002), Pp. 5-27 Public.
- Whitehead, J. (1999). "Feminism and Ethnicity and Selected Women Artists of Color. *Working Papers in Art Education* ISSN: 2326-7070 (Print) ISSN: 2326-7062 (Online) Volume 15|Issue 1 1999, p 24–32.
- Whitehead, J. L. (2008). *Theorizing Experience: Four Women Artists of Color. ."* *Studies in Art Education: A Journal of Issues and Research in Art Education* 50 (1: 22–35.
- YVONNE PEPIN-WAKEFIELD.(2010)' *Beyond the Veil: Learning to Teach Fine Arts*

in a Muslim Culture’ Source: Art Education, Vol. 63, No. 6 (November 2010), pp. 13-18 Published by National Art Education Association

Zitzewitz, K. (2015). “Life in Ruins: Materiality, the City, and the Production of Critique in the Art of Naiza Khan. .” *Journal of Asian Studies* 74 (2), 323–46.

Zimmerman, T. (2002). An Evolving Feminist Leadership Model for Art Education. Source: *Studies in Art Education*, Vol. 44, No. 1 (Autumn, 2002), Published by National Art Education Association,5-27.