

Vastness of Higher Education Development Programme on Enhancing Quality and Sustainable Service Delivery by University Graduates in the Northern Zone Tanzania

Fortunatus Michael Mbuu, Rev. Dr. Victorini Salema & Dr. Timothy Mandila
Mwenge Catholic University, P.O. Box 1226, Moshi – Tanzania

Citation: Mbuu F.M., Salema V., & Mandila T. (2022) Vastness of Higher Education Development Programme on Enhancing Quality and Sustainable Service Delivery by University Graduates in the Northern Zone Tanzania, *British Journal of Education*, Vol.10, Issue 14, 30-54

ABSTRACT: *Quality, resilience, commitment and sustainable delivery of services has increasingly being a demand for every community in the world. The 21st century has identified the kind of skills that need to be embraced by every individual for one to deliver quality, sustainable and decent work. In response, Tanzania launched the Higher education Development Programme (HEDP) to ensure the attainment of this fundamental objective. This study therefore investigated the vastness of HEDP on enabling quality and sustainable service delivery among university graduates. The study tested two hypotheses. The CIP₁P₂I evaluation model guide this study. The study employed Convergent design under mixed research approach. The target population for this evaluation study was 18,601 respondents selected from eight (8) Universities in the Northern Zone Tanzania. The target population comprised of 5,118 final year bachelor degree students, 483 lecturers, 8 DVC-academics, 12,292 alumni and 100 employers. The sample was 697 which comprised of 511 final year Bachelor degree students; 48 lecturers; 4 DVC academics; 124 alumni and 10 employers. The sampling techniques included stratified random, purposive sampling techniques and automatic inclusion. Data was collected by using questionnaires, indepth interview guides and document analysis guides. Quantitative data was analyzed by using descriptive statistics where frequencies, percentages, and means were determined. Qualitative data was analyzed through transcription of the texts, generate themes, interpreting, discussion and making conclusions. The study found that, most alumni couldn't deliver quality and sustainable service as needed by their community. The study concluded that, HEDP has not adequately brought about tangible implications on the quality and sustainability of graduates and thus quality of higher education system is questionable. It was recommended that, universities should reform curriculums that emphasize on acquisition of soft-skills that may enable graduates deliver quality and sustainable services rather than traditional emphasis on academic achievement.*

KEY WORDS: HEDP, quality and sustainable service, decent work, soft skills, 21st century

INTRODUCTION

One of the most recognized trigger for development of any kind is productive work. Actually, work is perceived differently from place to place depending on cultural and technological advancement. The European Commission (EC, 2018) reported on promoting employment and descent work in Development Cooperation, one of the biggest challenge for developing countries is the creation of sufficient and quality employment. This entails that the challenge of creating work and descent work that can sustainably bring about development among developing countries is an acute challenge. The EC (2018) quoting from ILO defines descent work as; productive work for women and men in conditions of freedom, equity, security and human dignity. One among the groups that were expected to work under prescribed conditions are university graduates since they are enlightened with skills, values and competences. However, the situation in most developing countries is the vice versa, Tanzania is inclusive (EC, 2018). Furthermore, the situation acutely alarming and with time becoming worsening since not only the issue of lacking descent work, but access to the work itself is becoming a challenge to among youths in the world and Tanzania in particular (ILO, 2020; NBS, 2021).

In response to the issue of accessible work and enhance quality and sustainable service delivery, the Tanzanian government formulated the National Higher Educational Policy (NHEP, 1999) to instruct the implementation of the Higher Education Development Programme (HEDP, 2010-2015) which was put under close monitoring of the Higher Education Accreditation Council (HEAC) of 1995 which changed to the Tanzania Commission for Universities (TCU). Effectiveness of the implementation of the HEDP was expected to be observed through noticeable and acceptable indicators for quality and sustainable entire education system that was to be emancipation to Tanzanian societies. Among the indicators of quality that was expected to be revealed after the programme's lifespan is completed was quality and sustainable service delivery inculcated from relevant university curriculums (URT, 2010). In this case, this impact evaluation study made its focus on the quality of university graduates in terms of services they deliver to the society.

In pointing unemployment as a major drawback to personal and economic development than even accessibility to descent work, the survey report by ILO (2020) indicated that unemployment is increasing globally. The report concurred to that of the National Bureau of Statistics (2018; 2019) that indicated in the same alignment that unemployment in Tanzania has drastically increased between 2018 up 2021. In addition, the Survey report by ILO (2020) revealed that an overwhelming 267 million young people aged 15 to 24 worldwide (22% of youths) are not in any form of employment, education or training. Conversely, the reports by WEF (2017) and UNDP (2015) indicated that, the 21st century demands for employees equipped with relevant soft skills. Worse enough, evidence from literature show that: many young people who are in paid jobs face barriers to decent work. The question that remain unanswered is that: if all the claims from the National Bureaus of Statistics (NBS) that unemployment rates are periodically decreasing are certain, then why graduates from various universities and colleges are wandering around unemployed, and for those who get to be employed fail to deliver due services? (Wilson, 2018; Kalufya & Mwakajinga, 2017;

Mwanyika et al. 2020). It is in this sense, this impact evaluation study deepens its roots to determine the vastness to which Higher Education Programme has enabled quality and sustainable service delivery among university graduates in the Northern Zone Tanzania.

Statement of the Problem

Low quality and unsustainable service delivery by university graduates across the world has been condemned to be overwhelmingly caused by the lack of adequate skills demanded for the 21st century. Youths have been the victims of the circumstance of not being entrusted for new job posts (ILO, 2020); EC, 2018). The study by Sumberg et al. (2021) upholds that Africa's youth employment crisis is actually a missing jobs and lacking descent jobs. The study found that the dominant narrative about Africa's youth employment crisis foregrounds young people themselves, and strongly suggests that the crisis is all (and often only) about them. The matter pending is whether higher education institutions have done their job in a manner that enable youths fit for the job vacancies on one hand while employers complain for the lack of employees who can deliver quality and sustainable services they are entrusted on the other hand. Other studies such as that of Mgaiwa (2021); Kalufya and Mwakajinga (2017) and Munishi (2022) revealed that university graduates are lacking acceptable skills demanded for the growth of industrial economy and technological advancement for the current social needs. This in return limits them from delivering quality and sustainable services they are entrusted to. As a global concern, Goal number 4 of the United Nations Sustainable Development Goal (SDG) calls to ensure inclusive and equitable quality education and promote life-long learning opportunities for all. Despite local and international initiatives, especially the implemented HEDP for the case of Tanzania, there are still complaints from stakeholders for low quality of service delivered by university graduates who are not resilient at work, embrace inadequate skills, incompetent and unsustainable in service they deliver. This renders graduate youths jobless. Therefore, this impact evaluation study was carried out investigate the vastness to which Higher Education Development Programme has enabled quality and sustainable service delivery among university graduates in Northern Zone of Tanzania.

Research Question

To what is the vastness of Higher Education Development Programme on enhancing quality and sustainable service delivery among university graduates in Northern Zone of Tanzania?

Hypothesis Testing

H_{a1}- There is a significant association between faculties from which final year bachelor students belong and their perceptions that Quality and Sustainable Service Delivery is the result of poor programs offered in universities.

H_{a2}: - There is a significant association between faculty from which alumni belong and perceptions that Quality and Sustainable Service delivery is the result of poor programs offered in universities.

Theoretical Framework

The CIPP evaluation Model (Daniel Stufflebeam)

This impact evaluation study was anchored to the CIP₁P₂I model as conceived by an evaluator (2022) as adapted from Daniel Stufflebeam's CIPP model of Programme Evaluation. The model had four (4)

major components of focus namely: Context (C); Input (I); Process (P) and Product (P) hence CIPP. Later on in 2016, the model was modified by Ogula who added the follow-up stage Impact (I); thus the model came to be known as CIPPI (Ogula, 2016). The Management Oriented Model (CIPP) was developed by Daniel Stufflebeam (1971) with the focus of evaluating each step of the project as the process of delineating, obtaining and providing useful information for judging decision alternatives. The forms of evaluation include; context evaluation- to serve planning decisions. Determining what needs to be addressed by a programme helps in defining objectives for the programme; input evaluation- to serve structuring decisions. Determining what resources are available; process evaluation- To serve implementing decisions; product evaluation – which calls for evaluation of the quality of the outcomes of nearly to the end or immediately after the intervention; and impact evaluation- simply a follow up study on the lifelong effects of the intervention. Normally conducted five years after the intervention has lapsed its span.

The CIP₁P₂I model was highly applicable in this study since it consisted of some potential components such as product and impact components which gave the researcher legibility to anchor the findings of the study. Moreover, the product and impact were not studied in isolation but also checking other preceding components such as context, input and process that might have affected the product and impacts positively or negatively. Among other objectives, the HEDP was put into implementation from 2010 to 2015 for the intention of gathering information about the quality and stability of university graduates whom are the products of HEIs which operated under TCU and IUCEA standards and guidelines which were all encompassed in the national Higher Education Policy (NHEP, 1999).

REVIEW OF EMPIRICAL STUDIES

Vastness of Higher Education Development Programme on Enhancing Quality and Sustainable Service Delivery by University Graduates

In Europe, the qualitative study was carried out by Wong, et al. (2021) on higher education market as driven universities to justify their value and worth of community services they can offer especially to prospect students and graduates. The study investigated the value and worthiness of universities in Australia, New Zealand and the UK. The attributes put under investigation included: self-awareness and lifelong learning; employability and professional development; global citizenship and engagement and academic and finally research literacy. The study used the specific software; the NVivo and its NCapture function to record online contents for inductive thematic analysis. The contents collected from these 76 university websites which were thematically coded. The study revealed that, graduate attributes illustrate the visions that universities aspire for their students, irrespective of their degree discipline. However, accessing university websites to capture the content was not the best way since self-evaluation and self-monitoring is exposed to biasness. Other techniques such as “Survey Monkey”, Google sheet or any other online survey could capture more authentic data. Survey Monkey is the survey process considerably to be used by many respondents. It can generate frequencies for each question and allow the researcher to export data into programs like SPSS for more complex analysis.

In Asia, the study carried by Aviso, et al. (2021) investigated the role played by universities in developing new technologies that could be fundamental for economic development through quality and sustainable services as well as improved quality of life among students, and reduced environmental impacts. The trends in the developing countries show accelerated efforts to transform teaching-oriented higher education institutions into research-intensive universities. The study used the hyper box machine learning technique, which was capable of generating classification models in the form of if/then rules as applied in developing and evaluating the logical frameworks and project documents. The analysis of data focused on the Southeast Asian universities listed in the 2020 Quacquarelli Symonds Asian University Rankings and used the normalized scores across the different ranking criteria. Five plausible rule-based classifiers were derived and validated. The results showed distinguished association between research and internationalization metrics with employability and quality and sustainability of services among university graduates. Conversely, the study in some ways treated human behaviour as something that can be studied simply by using computing machines. It should be noticed that, human behaviour is not statics, it always changes with circumstances. Thus, the study findings are doubtful of being generalized or transferable since human behaviour was treated by machine and not as something to be observed in its natural settings (in situ). This is unlike the current study that aimed at seeking to adequately create more logical evidences to affirm or disaffirm the attainments made by the HEDP towards enhancement of quality and sustainable services offered by university graduates as one of indicators for quality of higher education system.

In the EU, Navarro-Espinosa et al. (2021) carried out the study to observe the position of Information and Communication Technologies (ICTs) as backbone to sustainable higher education institutions (HEIs) on enabling graduates with adequate skills for quality and sustainable services which can bring about immediate solutions to the community especially during global pandemic COVID-19. Despite the fact that most of statistical data were still embryonic, the current researchers focused on the students' perspective, especially during the online teaching caused as far as the COVID-19 pandemic is concerned. The research based on a comparative study through an online qualitative survey focused on the inclusion and use of ICTs in two HEIs in two different instants (pre- and post-lockdowns). The study found that, there were differences regarding country and working experience ($p < 0.001$), being linked to the ICTs use, evaluation of obstacles, and the role given to ICTs ($p < 0.05$). The COVID-19 caused modifications of the teachers' perspectives, including an improvement of the opinion of older teachers regarding the essentialness of ICTs in the teaching process ($p < 0.001$) and worsening their perception about their ICT skills ($p < 0.05$). Additionally, an initial model focused only on the university teachers and their use of ICTs has been proposed. Despite worthy observations made, the study seems to mislead the reality that only with the use of ICT quality in provision of higher education will be revealed especially on enabling university graduates deliver quality and sustainable services. This is actually oversimplification since it is clear that HE needs multifaceted aspects to accomplish its goals and objectives at international standards. It is also doubtful to simply address the issue of quality in a manner that it can be brought about by implementing ICT in universities. The current evaluation study will go beyond ICT as one of the tools for quality education but not necessarily the only guaranteed tool for quality of graduates that are well linked to the world.

The study by Orozco-Messana et al. (2021) presented the research results of an online pedagogical experience in collaborative academic research for analyzing good practice in Technology Enhanced Learning (TEL) supported higher education development. The project aimed at enhancing higher education institutions engage in preparing suitable graduates with adequate skills to offer services to the community. The results obtained through a pilot implementation providing supportive data on TEL competency's development of faculty skills and analysis of developing sustainable higher education degrees through TEL cooperation, for capacity building. Given the increased volume and complexity of the knowledge to be delivered, and the exponential growth of the need for skilled workers in emerging economies, online training is the most effective way of delivering a sustainable higher education. The results of the PETRA Erasmus+ capacity-building project provided evidence of a successful implementation of a TEL-supported methodology for collaborative faculty development focused on future online degrees built collaboratively and applied locally. However, the study findings focused on pedagogical skills that result from a quantitative comparative study that assessed the implication of ICT pre and post lockdown. Again, the findings may not be generalizable since the data was collected from pilot implementation to a smaller group and not the actual implementation of project. This is unlike the implementation of the HEDP which was actual and covered the whole country.

The study by Salami and Tiamiyu (2019) in Nigeria examined the influence of the emergence of private universities in educational revolution as well-intentioned to enhance graduate with skills to offer quality and sustainable services. The study aimed at identifying and justifying the quality of Higher Education Institutions as private universities emerged compared to the time when of public institutions were operating in isolation. The gaps found include; uncertainty of the academic calendar due to strikes; inadequate, outdated (out-fashioned) destroyed infrastructure; lack of will power to enforce discipline and working habits. The study found that, private universities have widened the gap in quality and sustainability of services offered by graduates. Also, PHEs have been condemned to produce low quality graduates which cannot offer reliable services. Actually, the study enlightened a serious issue that IUCEA (2010); TCU (2019); Kalufya and Mwakajinga (2017); and Scott and Willison (2021) earmarked by criticizing quality of education provided by private universities. However, the researchers have brought about the findings that are likely to raise more conflicts rather than typically addressing the issue of low quality of graduates. The study seemingly inclined on one side in the sense that it made a belief that public universities produce quality graduates but not private universities. In addition, there were no clear methodology shown to have been followed nor sample and sampling procedures that brought the researcher into conclusions and recommendations made. When the study lacks clear methodology particularly sample and sampling procedures, readers fail to understand whether the findings are trustworthy or not and whether the target population was adequately represented (Ogula et al. 2018; Creswell & Creswell, 2018).

In Tanzania, the study by Munishi (2022) investigated the factors contributing to the lack of soft skills among Tanzanian Higher learning graduates. The study declared that, despite the roles played by soft skills on ensuring employability, career development among graduates as well as quality of services they are to deliver, evidence suggests a huge lack of soft skills among university graduates in

Tanzania. The study explored the factors contributing to the lack of soft skills among higher learning graduates in the country and recommended effective strategies of ensuring acquisition of soft skills by the graduates. The study critically reviewed documents related to factors contributing to the lack of soft skills among university graduates in Tanzania. The study found that, lack of soft skills among graduates fundamentally emanates from poor curriculum which does not consider soft skills right from primary schools to higher level, ineffective educational policies and reforms that do not give emphasize on soft skill, incompetent trainers, inadequate teaching and learning facilities as well as lack of career guidance programs in academic institutions. The study recommended that, in order to ensure all factors are embraced, they should be holistically addressed in a bid to equip graduates with soft skills necessary for employability. To ensure effective acquisition of soft skills by graduates, there should be regular curriculum and educational policy reviews to include aspects of soft skills, allocating adequate budget for teaching and learning infrastructure, empowering higher education with soft skills and ensuring relevant teaching methodologies to enable educators equip students with soft skills.

The study by Munishi (2022) investigated a very potential aspect of the 21st century, soft skills which are largely demanded by the technological world. However, the researcher confined to the review of various documents depicting the role of soft skills, the use of documents only gives indicates that the findings are certainly accepted since second hand information is prone to distortion. Also, the study did not show clearly whether there was some specific interventions made by universities to inculcate soft skills that could enable graduates offer service in quality and sustainable manner.

The study by Magasi (2022) in Dodoma Tanzania assessed the effect of service quality satisfaction in Tanzanians Higher education by re-examination of the SERVQUAL model through testing five existing dimensions namely; tangible, reliability, responsiveness, empathy, and assurance and the new one which is compliance. The study was carried out in the higher education institutions situated in Dodoma city. The study employed stratified random sampling techniques to select students' sample. The study adopted a cross-sectional research design whereas a questionnaire survey was used for collection of quantitative data from a sample of 326 students from higher learning institutions. Descriptive statistics were used to compute the quality of services using perceived quality (P) and expected quality (E) Inferential statistics involved a binary logic regression model to estimate the effect of service quality dimensions and compliance on customer satisfaction. The findings showed that, service quality in higher education was perceived by students to be below their expectations. The findings from logic model revealed that, tangible, reliability, responsiveness, empathy and compliance were important variables in predicting students' satisfaction in Higher education. Despite the fact that the study revealed fundamental findings, the findings are hesitantly trusted since the study employed only one instrument (questionnaire). This may compromise the validity of information gathered since there were no triangulation of information. Also, the study narrowly selected the sample for the study that is students. Inclusion of students only couldn't give a bigger picture of satisfaction level over services provided by higher learning institutions. Other potential stakeholders such as lecturers, industries as well as employers of various government and non-government institutions were excluded.

Summary and Demonstration of Knowledge Gap

The studies by Wong, et al. (2021); Aviso, et al. (2021); Navarro-Espinosa et al. (2021); Orozco-Messana et al. (2021); Salami and Tiamiyu (2019) Munishi (2022) and Magasi (2022) aimed at revealing various critical factors for poor quality and unsustainable services offered by university graduates. The studies pointed out inadequate or irrelevant skills embraced by most university graduates as the reason for the situation. Some studies suggested to the universities on investment on ICT and online teaching, having collaboration between public and private universities, establish and run programme which are market driven and ensuring HEIs inculcate soft skills among students. However, none of the study was conducted as a follow-up study to investigate whether the programmes established brought about the expected impacts to the target group of individuals. Again, other studies employed only one data collection technique which makes the findings uncertainly agreed due to the lack of triangulation of the findings as suggested by Ogula et al. (2018) and; Ogula (2009). Due to cultural, technological and economic differences, findings from qualitative studies cannot be generalized to the Northern Zone Tanzania. Thus, this study sought to fill the gap by merging qualitative and quantitative data sets to find out the vastness of HEDP on enhancing quality and sustainable service delivery among university graduates in the northern zone Tanzania.

EVALUATION DESIGN AND METHODOLOGY

The study employed convergent research design under mixed research approach since the intention was to gather quantitative and qualitative data sets as suggested by Creswell and Creswell (2018), Creswell and Plano (2018), Okendo et al (2020) and Ogula et al. (2018). The target population for this evaluation study was 18,601 respondents from eight (8) Universities in the Northern Zone of Tanzania as per TCU (2020). This comprises of 5,118 final year bachelor degree students, 483 lecturers, 8 DVC-academics, 12,292 alumni in five consecutive years (2016-2020) and 100 employers. The study sample was obtained through probability and non-probability sampling whereby the study sample was 697 in which 511 were final year Bachelor degree students selected through stratified random sampling technique; 48 lecturers selected through stratified random sampling technique; 4 DVC academics were included in the study; 124 alumni were selected conveniently through an online Google form (eQuestionnaire) and 10 employers selected purposively.

The study employed questionnaires for final year bachelor degree students, lecturers, and alumni to gather quantitative data whereas for qualitative data in-depth interview guide for DVC-academics and employers were engaged. Validity of quantitative research instruments was estimated by research experts from Mwenge Catholic University in which content and face validation was made. Validation of qualitative data collection instruments was estimated through explanation of the purpose of the study to the participants and giving equal time interval for interviews (45 minutes per interview). Pilot study was conducted between 1st April and 30th May 2022, followed by estimation of reliability of questionnaires (Likert scales and Rating scales for 12 items). The reliability of quantitative data collection instruments was estimated through Cronbach alpha where the estimated reliability coefficient value found was .78. Thus, questionnaire was acceptable for the study (Cohen et al. 2018;

Ogula, 2009). Dependability of qualitative data collection instruments was conducted through member checking and triangulation. Quantitative data was analyzed through descriptive statistics where by frequencies, mean scores and standard deviations were computed. Qualitative data analysis was analyzed by transcribing raw field data, coding, generating themes, interrelating and interpreting the meaning of themes.

Data analysis, Discussion and Interpretation of the Findings

This study intended to reveal the nexus of the High Education Development Program (HEDP) implemented under close monitoring of the Tanzania Commission for Universities (TCU) and the anticipated impacts to the university graduates which enabled personnel to deliver quality and sustainable services entrusted to them by employers and the community. Data for the study was gathered through questionnaires from final year bachelor students to investigate their preparedness to offer quality and sustainable services. Also questionnaire was engaged to study the alumni of various universities in the direction of founding out the confidence they have in the field in which they deliver formal or informal service to the community. Lecturers who are the implementers of programmes operated under the HEDP were also studied by means of questionnaire. Indepth interview guides were employed to gather information form Deputy Vice Chancellors (DVC) – Academics, employers and selected the alumni. The researcher soug in the first hand collected information from final year bachelor degree students by inquiring then through questionnaire to indicate the levels of agreement on various statements pertaining quality and sustainability of services they deliver to the work places (for employed personnel) and acceptability of service in the community (self-employed personnel) among university graduates in the Northern Zone Tanzania in relationship to HEDP objectives. The information gathered from final year bachelor students are presented in summary form in Table 1:

Table 1: Extent of preparedness of students on programmes they pursued as enabled them to offer quality and sustainable services (n=509)

Statements	VLE	LE	ME	HE	VHE	M
	%	%	%	%	%	
1. The programmes offered do not prepare students to deliver QAS services	3.9	0.4	3.0	43.0	49.7	4.34
2. It is Difficult for universities to impart life skills due to poor education background	8.8	10.6	6.1	41.7	32.8	3.79
3. Participation during learning enable students become competent for work	5.5	2.6	8.1	41.8	42.0	4.12
4. Unemployment is the result of laziness	26.1	14.5	5.9	31.6	21.8	3.08
5. TCU SAG are adhered to by the university to enable delivery of QAS service	5.9	5.1	13.4	40.9	34.8	3.94
6. Programmes offered prepare graduates to be job seeker than job creators	4.1	2.6	3.1	33.7	56.5	4.36
7. Graduates roam around the streets jobless due to inadequate skills	5.7	3.3	2.6	32.8	55.6	4.29
8. Lecturers imparted entrepreneurial skills that prepared me to be self-reliant	9.4	11.0	3.7	38.1	37.7	3.84
9. Programmes offered do not meet the demands for economic and industrial world	8.3	10.5	8.1	42.1	31.0	3.77
10. It is the role of the government to employ all university graduates	17.5	24.4	10.0	28.5	19.6	3.08
11. Preparing ethical and professional graduates to offer QAS services they are entrusted with	4.7	3.1	1.2	46.2	44.8	4.23
12. Lecturers put much efforts on academic excellence with little life skills	6.1	10.6	0.8	47.7	34.8	4.68

Source: Field data (2022)

[Keys: 5=Very High Extent (VHE); 4=High Extent (HE); 3=Moderate Extent (ME); 2=Low Extent (LE); 1=Strongly Very Low Extent (VLE), %=Percentage, QAS= Quality and Sustainable, SAG= Standards and guidelines]

Table 1 depicts the response from final year bachelor students indicated the extent to which the HEDP has enhanced preparedness to deliver quality and sustainable services to the community as demanded by the industrial economy. Thus, Table 1 displayed data with intention of assuring whether final year bachelor students are assured to have acquired reasonable skills that enabled them become part and parcel of competitive personnel in offering quality and reasonable qualities as anticipated by employers and the entire community in the 21st century. In this regard, students were required to rate various statements that aimed at finding out the extent of preparedness to offer quality and sustainable services (QAS) as the ultimate goal of schooling from various universities in the Northern Zone Tanzania.

The data in Table 1 indicate that, very high majority (92.7%) of final year students high extent and very high extent that the most of programmes offered in universities do not prepare students to deliver quality and sustainable services to the community while overwhelming minority (4.3%) rated very low and low extent on the statement. The statement was coined with the possibility of schooling background among bachelor degree students as might be the factor that has resulted to the current situation of failing to deliver quality and sustainable services. Response displayed in Table 1 revealed

that, majority (74.5%) students rated very high extent and high extent with the statement that it is difficult for students to acquire life skills that could enable them deliver quality and sustainable service due to poor education background in secondary schools. However, minority (19.4%) rated very low extent and low extent while overwhelming minority (6.1%) remained neutral. The data indicates that, most of the final year students in universities are not comfortable with programmes offered in universities this is probably because they proceed to recycle the same problems that were inborn from lower and higher secondary school system.

The information in Table 1 also display that, overwhelming minority students (4.3%) do not blame the programs but they think that there must be something else to be revealed instead of blaming the university programs as well as education background students went through especially in secondary schools. The findings suggests that, HEDP has not brought about positive changes through programs offered in various universities. This implies that, the quality of students and the entire higher education systems are questionable, the circumstance that makes the acceptability of university graduates to offer quality and sustainable services at local and international standards remain uncertain. The findings are in line of those of the study by Chikazhe et al. (2022) in Zimbabwe who found out that there is a wide gap between anticipated services among university graduates and quality, loyalty and satisfaction. The findings infer that universities have been operating traditionally as we said they are running behind global changes that demand for personnel that are sharp in innovation that can offer quality and sustainable services.

In the same line, Tanzania has made initiatives to implement the HEDP in order to narrow the gap between learned skills from various programs and the ability to apply them in offering quality and sustainable service. Data in Table 1 indicates that the objectives are deflected to the negative side that the programs in universities do not prepare students for that fundamental task in the community as also indicated that this habit is inherited from secondary schools. But this may not be the case for all universities. The findings which were different from what students aired out about programs were contradicting the argument of one of the DVC-academic through face-to-face interview when responded on quality and sustainability of services offered by university graduates and shared that:

The response we get from community after being hired for job is that our graduates are committed and this is very important and we are very proud of this. It has also being revealed that our students are hired as they graduate by reputable institutions public and private. I can honestly declare that, our programs and the entire pedagogy prepare them for quality service delivery. However, when it comes to content in terms of knowledge and skills, our students are taught per curriculum which is accredited by TCU. But teaching in classes is one thing, extra reading can make students more and more competent in the area of specialization. But this comes to an individual if a person is born committed or lazy (*Personal interview with senior DVC-Academic, Institution "A" on 4th May, 2022*).

The information from DVC-Academic demonstrates that, university "A" has been receiving positive feedback from consumers of their products such as employers and the community. The finding may also imply that, to some extent, universities are doing what they are obliged to do depending by the

nature of programs offered. For the case of institution “A”, the programs seem to be suitable and directly consumed by their customers without any doubt. On the issue raised by students that the quality is affected by background education system, the DVC-academic in university “A” attested the argument when aired out that:

The whole thing is rotten from the grassroots. The government has to take initiative to bring about changes starting from the grass roots because the rote is there especially from secondary schools. And critical issue here is to make sure that they have got the right and qualified teachers so that the students come with adequate content and skills. The situation became worse after starting Ward secondary schools “shule za kata”, education has been compromised, we have students but no enough teachers and when teachers are there, they are of low quality and not motivated. If you want somebody to deliver, motivate him or her (*Personal interview with senior DVC-Academic, Institution “A” on 4th May, 2022*).

The information from the DVC-academics indicate that, the root cause of all challenges university graduates face are inherited from secondary school where students are packed with merely bookish knowledge which is typically theoretical. The response from the DVC-academic in university “A” concurs with the data displayed in Table 1 which indicates that, it is difficult to impart life skills to students who have poor education background particularly secondary schools. Generally, the subject of weaknesses in curriculums as affirmed by students was admitted by Pandya et al. (2022) in India who studied on the readiness of workforce for the world of work in 2030. The study revealed that, new set of knowledge, skills, abilities and other (KSAO) characteristics will be required to be successful within the workforce of the future. The findings are in agreement with European Commission (EC, 2018) report on promoting employment and decent work in development cooperation which indicated that, among the biggest challenges that accelerates graduates failure to get into decent work which are productive in conditions of freedom, equity, security and human dignity is inadequacy of skills resulted from the programs offered and educational background. Therefore, the findings communicate that, there must be mega reforms in the entire system of education so as to enable students develop their career from lower secondary schools as the fundamental stage where universities are to furnish students with relevant and adequate skills to perform the tasks entrusted at reasonable quality and consistently.

Furthermore, data in Table 1 presented the instance that, failure to deliver quality and sustainable service which renders graduates unemployed is the lack of commitment and laziness. The intention was to gather evidence from final year bachelor students on an alarming and critical issue of commitment and laziness condemned by employers and community at large. Respondents appeared to be divided in their opinions when tried to give out their view on a subject of discussion. The data from Table 1 shows that; moderate (53.4%) rated very high extent and high extent on the statement that failure to deliver quality and sustainable service is the result of lacking commitment and laziness while low moderate students (41.0%) rated low extent and very low extent. Very low minority (5.6%) student respondents remained neutral with no suggestion on the same. This indicates that, lack of working habits and commitment is a serious challenge that remains under stiff debate among

stakeholders. The finding establishes that, the issues of laziness and lacking commitment at work one assigned is a tremendous issues that need to be addressed so that youths can be entrusted for the tasks by the means of changing their mind-set and create positive attitudes towards quality and sustainable delivery of services they are assigned. But then again teaching in classes is one thing while extra reading can make students more and more competent in the area of specialization. These findings were affirmed by one of the DVC-academic during a face-to face interview that: *Delivering quality and sustainable service comes from an individual if is born committed or lazy (Personal interview with senior DVC-Academic, Institution "A" on 4th May, 2022)*. The statement implies that, the universities have their roles to play on ensuring students get adequate knowledge that makes one skilled in his or her area of specialization. But when it comes to the application of skills remains personal of whether one is committed or lazy. An interview with one employer who is the Human Resource Manager of institution "B" during a face-to face interview on matters pertaining commitment for one to deliver quality and sustainable service disclosed that:

Of course, we do get surprised when we receive applicants with very good CV and academic credentials that attract us call them for interviews. To be realistic, in my opinions, there is a loophole that the higher education system has not discovered yet. There is a wide gap between academic credentials as I said attract us to call applicants for interviews, but when it comes to the actual job performance, ooooooh!, they tend to fail in just some few days. We sometimes hire diploma and certificate applicants from technical colleges because it has proved that they have relevant skills, resilient, committed and I can confidently dare to say that the ones graduating from universities suits to be managers but not workers whom we need them most (*Personal interview by the employer from institution "B" on 3rd May, 2022*).

Information from interview by the employer of institution "B" proves that there is a wide gap between what is learnt in universities and reality in actual world of work. The response from the employer clearly indicate that, there are narrow chances of many university graduates to be accommodated in the job opportunities since the programs learnt prepared them to be managers and not worker who are demanded in lager numbers. Also, the response from the interview depicts that, the habit of new employees lack perseverance, creativity and hardworking spirit kills most of the institutions that demands for commitment and sustainability in service delivered.

Information from interviews as well as that of Table 1 concurs with the findings of studies such as Wong et al. (2021) in Europe on preparation of market-driven graduates, Aviso eta al. (2021) in Asia on participation of graduates in development of new technology, Magiwa (2021) and Mutalemwa (2021) in Tanzania on the gap between skills acquired and actual demands for one to be employable. The studies generally found out that, there are still a mismatch between knowledge acquired through various programmes offered in the universities and actual skills demanded in the 21st century. The findings denote that, there are must be immediate role of universities to find a turning point to rescue the youths from a continuous viscous cycle of being incompetent, unemployable, incompetent in delivering services to the community and falling into conducting indecent jobs in the sense of self-employment. This is in line with suggestion of the CIP₁P₂I which advocates that, there should be

periodic review, monitoring and evaluation of all phases of the programme implementation in order to make checks and balance before the programmes end with unexpected outcomes.

The findings additionally concur with what was suggested by the Value- Added Theory (VAT) from which we can inculcate the fact that, the current world of stiff competitive economy and technological advancement for the 21st century, certificates are insufficient to indicate one's ability to work. Thus, VAT suggests for graduates to add value by having; norms, resilience, commitment, curiosity, problem solving and self-reliant spirits for individual development and institution they are working for. And all these should not come surprisingly rather through monitoring and evaluation of programme operations as in CIP₁P₂I model. Therefore, the study findings imply that, backwardness in development of most organization is the result of poor and irrelevant skills acquired by university graduates which do not fit to the world that demands for committed and innovative personnel to deliver high-quality and sustainable service to the fast technological world. It also imply that, if universities will not take immediate measures to help students change their mindset as recommended by Salami and Siamiyu (2019) in Nigeria and Pandya et al. (2022) in India, universities and the communities will keep running behind the world of competitive economy as consumers of technology rather than being innovators of new technology and job opportunities.

Generally, Table 1 displayed a number of statements that were in agreement with the findings from studies, interviews and the CIP₁P₂I model by showing high mean scores of more than 4.0. On the other hand, final year students were hesitant and negatively replied to statement related to the truth that students are prepared to be competitive in the technological, and industrial economy ($m=3.77$) and the argument that it is the role of the government to employ all university graduates ($m=3.08$). The argument was supported by the findings of the study of Tamrat et al. (2022) in Ethiopia who supports that it is not the role of the government to employ all university graduates but they should be self-reliant and problem solvers that the entire community should depend on due to quality and sustainable service they offer. The situation in definitely not different from Tanzania where universities produce a number of graduands every year but few who get formal or employ themselves are blamed by employers as they offer low quality services. Finally, the information that deflected negatively to most student disagreement was that TCU standards and guidelines are well adhered to by universities. In response, the mean score moderate (3.94) found which displays that, majority agrees with the fact that TCU standards and guidelines are adhered to by universities while many are also have conflicting ideas. This implies that, universities have to rethink on the relevance of the programs they offer to the current 21st century generation. Therefore, the study findings portray that, TCU standards and guidelines are clearly articulated as also addressing the demand for every university graduate to acquire adequate skills that can enable to fit in job at reasonable standards. The study tested whether they had different opinions on matters related to quality and sustainability of Service University graduates deliver. Therefore, the study aimed at finding whether there was a significant association between faculty from which students belong and gender towards opinions over statements related to quality and sustainability of services they deliver after completion their studies.

Hypothesis Testing for H₀1

The study aimed at finding out whether there is an association between the faculty from which students belong and their opinions towards preparedness to provide quality and reliable service. The independent Chi-square test was computed to establish the association. The hypothesis stated was:

H₀ 1: There is no significant relationship between faculty from which final year students belong and opinions that QAS is the result of poor programs offered in universities.

The information from students’ response on about the variables under the association was established and summarized in Table 2:

Table 2. Association between students’ faculties and opinions that QAS service is affected by programs offered (n=509)

		Failure to deliver QAS service is related to university programs										Total
		SD	%	D	%	U	%	A	%	SA	%	
Faculty students belong	Business	53	25.5	33	15.9	7	3.3	71	34.1	44	21.2	208
	Education	24	19.8	11	9.1	14	11.6	44	36.4	28	23.1	121
	Laws	11	36.7	5	16.7	1	3.3	7	23.3	6	20.0	30
	Tourism	37	27.4	25	18.5	8	5.9	34	25.2	31	23.0	135
	Music	8	53.3	0	0.0	0	0.0	5	33.3	2	13.3	15
Total		133		74		30		161		111		509

Source, Field data, (2022)

Table 2 displays the responses of students belonging from various faculties on the aspect that failure to deliver QAS is related to the programs they pursue. Information from Table 2 indicates that, most of moderate students (53.4%) rated very high and high extent on the statement while low moderate (40.9%) indicated low moderate on the statement and overwhelming minority (5.9%) students were undecided. Again, data in Table 2 indicates the difference in response depending on the faculty students belong. Majority students rated very high and high extent that belonged from faculties of business and education, while majority who rated very low and low extent belonged from faculties of tourism, laws and music. Therefore, the findings communicate that, there are might be different modalities employed by lectures that depict this difference.

Testing hypothesis for H₀1: To test whether the difference was merely a coincidence or was significant, the researcher computed Chi-Square test for independent categories (faculties). On Chi Square test it was assumed that: the expected cells counts all greater than or equal to 5, the groups are independent and are randomly sampled, the independent variable is the frequency of subjects belong to each category, the independent variable is categorical (nominal) and the sample size was assumed to be relatively large. The decision rule made was that: “If the p-value is equal or less than the significance level ($p \leq \alpha$), reject H₀ and if the p-value is greater than the significance level, fails to reject H₀. [$\alpha=.05$]”. The Chi-Square Output was computed through the statistical package for social science (SPSS) version 26. Independent Chi-square correlation test computed and the output was summarized in the Table 3:

Table 3. *Chi-Square Tests (n=509)*

	Value	df	Asymptotic Significance (2-sided)
Pearson Chi-Square	28.502^a	16	.028
Likelihood Ratio	30.094	16	.018
Linear-by-Linear Association	2.128	1	.145
N of Valid Cases	509		

a. 7 cells (28.0%) have expected count less than 5. The minimum expected count is .88.

A Chi-Square Test of independence was performed to find out the relationship between faculty from which final year students belong and opinions that failure to deliver quality and sustainable service is the result of poor university programs. The results obtained from Chi-square test: $X^2(16,509) = 28.502, p = .028$ indicated that p -value (.028) is less than alpha value (.05), hence the null hypothesis (H_0) is rejected and thus there was a significant relationship between the two variables. The information from hypothesis test entail that, there is a definite difference in opinions on matters pertaining quality and sustainability of services expected to be delivered by students after completion their studies. Therefore, final year bachelor degree students perceive negatively that poor programs offered by their universities have led to poor deliver of Quality and Sustainable (QAS) services they are entrusted to. This has resulted led them to continuously roam from office to office seeking for jobs but are not trusted due to inadequate skills they possess.

This detail is exposed in Table 3 where by moderate students (55.3%) from the faculty of business very high extent and high extent on the statement that programmes offered do not prepare students to deliver QAS services while the minority students (41.9%) very low extent and low extent that programmes offered do not prepare students deliver QAS services. Similarly, students in the faculty of business majority (59.5%) agreed and strongly agreed on the statement and low minority (28.9%) very low extent and low extent. Unlike the faculty of business who indicated to have been equipped with entrepreneurial skills and education who are assured of being employed, the faculty of laws, tourism and music moderate (53.4%, 45.9%, and 53.4%) consecutively rated low extent and very low extent on the argument. On the other hand, minority (43.3%, 48.2% and 46.6%) consecutively rated very high and high extent. The findings deduce that, there are differences in opinions from students in different faculties on the issues related to quality and sustainability of service. Therefore, universities have to put initiatives to narrow the gap between university students in different faculties so that each student has to be equipped with relevant skills that can enable him/her to deliver services. Furthermore, the study aimed at seeking opinions from university graduates (alumni) on matters related to quality and sustainable service they are entrusted to deliver in formal or informal jobs. The aims of alumni inclusion in this study was to find out the level of confidence they have on the quality of job they offer to the institution or the community as entrepreneurs. The essence of including this potential group in the study was to get their feelings and opinions in relation to university education which act as a scaffold for their current handovers and life situations. The information from alumni's responses is summarizing in Table 4:

Table 4: *Extent to which university alumni perceive whether HEDP has enabled them to offer quality and sustainable services (n=124)*

Statements	VLE	LE	ME	HE	VHE	M
	%	%	%	%	%	
1. The programmes offered do not prepare students to deliver QAS services	0.0	0.0	9.7	42.7	47.6	4.38
2. It is Difficult for universities to impart life skills due to poor education background	15.3	47.6	27.4	9.7	0.0	2.31
3. Participation during learning enable students become competent for work	0.0	0.0	28.2	59.7	12.1	3.84
4. Unemployment is the result of laziness	28.2	27.4	0.0	12.1	32.3	2.93
5. TCU SAG are adhered to by the university to enable delivery of QAS service	60.5	27.4	2.4	9.7	0.0	1.61
6. Programmes offered prepare graduates to be job seeker than job creators	20.2	58.1	9.7	12.1	0.0	2.14
7. Graduates roam around the streets jobless due to inadequate skills	43.5	29.8	9.7	0.0	16.9	2.17
8. Lecturers imparted entrepreneurial skills that prepared me to be self-reliant	0.0	0.0	25.0	47.6	27.4	4.02
9. Programmes offered do not meet the demands for economic and industrial world	0.0	0.0	26.6	45.2	28.2	4.02
10. It is the role of the government to employ all university graduates	0.0	0.0	9.7	20.2	70.2	4.60
11. Preparing ethical and professional graduates to offer QAS services they are entrusted with	0.0	12.1	0.0	48.4	39.5	4.15
12. Lecturers put much efforts on academic excellence with little life skills	27.4	14.6	0.0	14.5	43.5	3.81

Source: Field data (2022)

[Keys: 5=Very High Extent (**VHE**); 4=High Extent (**HE**); 3=Moderate Extent (**ME**); 2=Low Extent (**LE**); 1=Strongly Very Low Extent (**VLE**), %=Percentage, QAS= Quality and Sustainable, SAG= Standards and guidelines]

Information from Table 4 shows the responses that concur with that of final year bachelor degree students. Data from the table shows that, extreme majority (90.3%) alumni rated very high extent and high extent on the statement that programmes offered do not prepare students to offer quality and sustainable services. The remaining extreme minority alumni (9.7%) were undecided. Unlike the response from university final students, no single alumni (0.0%) who rated the statement put forward. This implies that, life experience after graduation is totally different from their expectations. Other statements that emerged to have the same direction as that of final year university students include that fact that unemployment is the result of laziness among students. Information from alumni indicated that, moderate (55.6%) rated very low extent and low extent while the rest of the percent (44.4%) rated very high and high extent. The data portrays the similar responses from final year bachelor students and university graduates which are independent groups.

Also, other statements alumni rated very high extent and high extent that displayed the highest mean scores include: disappointment when their fellows roam in street jobless (75.0%; $m=4.02$), alumni are not equipped with entrepreneurial skills that prepare them to be self-reliant (90.4; $m=4.60$), alumni are ethically and professionally prepared to offer quality and sustainable services they are entrusted (87.9%; $m=4.15$) and the opinion that lecturers put much efforts on academic excellence but not life skills (58.0%; $m=3.81$). This indicates that, universities still have a lot to do to rescue the situation. Alumni seem to have lost trust on the university education since it has failed to clear a way for their life standards. Table 4 also shows the statements that alumni replied differently from final year students as a proof of the lost hopes as they have entered into actual life experience. Majority alumni (87.9% $m=1.61$) rated low extent and very low extent that TCU standards and guidelines are adhered to by universities to enable students offer quality and sustainable services. The statement is attested when alumni replied on the statement that graduates fit in the competitive economic and industrial world due to relevant programs offered in universities where the responses indicated majority (73.3%; $m=2.17$) very low extent and low extent on the statement.

This implies that, university graduates (alumni) do not agree with the conception that the university programs have helped them to deliver quality and sustainable service. In testing whether there was a significant relationship between faculty from which students belong and opinions on the statement related to quality and sustainability of services, the Chi-square correlation test was computed.

Hypothesis Testing for H₀2: The study under this aspect intended to find out whether there is an association of faculty from which alumni belonged in relation to the Quality and sustainable services they offer or plan to offer. The hypothesis under investigation assumed that: H₀2: There is no significant association between faculty from which alumni belong and opinions that QAS is the result of poor programs offered in universities. The assumptions made for independent Chi-Square test included the following: the expected cells counts all greater than or equal to 5, the groups are independent and are randomly sampled, the independent variable is the frequency of subjects belong to each category, the independent variable is categorical (nominal) and the sample size was assumed to be relatively large. The decision rule was: “If the p-value is equal or less than the significance level ($p \leq \alpha$), reject H₀ and if the p-value is greater than the significance level, fails to reject H₀. [$\alpha=.05$]”. Chi-Square was computed through SPSS version 26 and the output was summarized in the Table 6:

Table 5. Chi-Square Tests summary ($n=124$)

	Value	df	Asymptotic Significance (2-sided)
Pearson Chi-Square	90.941^a	8	.000
Likelihood Ratio	99.778	8	.000
Linear-by-Linear Association	.028	1	.866
N of Valid Cases	124		

a. 6 cells (40.0%) have expected count less than 5. The minimum expected count is 1.09.

A Chi-Square Test of independence was performed to find out the association between faculty from which final year students belong and opinions that failure to deliver quality and sustainable service is the result of poor university programs. The results obtained from Chi-square test: $X^2(8,124) =$

90.941, $p=.000$ indicated that p -value (.000) is less than alpha value (.05), hence the null hypothesis (H_0) is rejected and thus there was a significant association between the two variables. The information from hypothesis test indicate that, there is a definite difference in opinions on matters related to quality and sustainability of services expected to be delivered by university graduates. Therefore, university graduates perceive positively that poor deliver of Quality and Sustainable (QAS) service is the result of poor programs offered by universities. Therefore, the findings imply that, complaints from employers and the community at large that university graduates cannot deliver quality and sustainable services is realistic as also attested by Munishi (2022); Magisa (2022) and Mgaiwa (2021). Therefore, the findings indicate that, preparedness to offer quality and sustainable service depends on the faculty from which students and alumni belong. Findings depicts that, students who pursue business and education moderate (55.3% and 59.4% respectively) strongly agree and agree that, failure to deliver quality and sustainable service is the results of poor quality of programmes they pursued. However, moderate (53.3% and 53.4%) students from faculty of music and laws respectively, disagreed and strongly disagreed that failure to deliver quality and sustainable services as the result of poor programs. Therefore, it is definitely clear that, there is significant association between faculty from which students and alumni belong and opinions on the quality and sustainability of services.

Moreover, the study was extended to investigate the confidence of lecturers over preparedness of final year students to deliver quality and sustainable service. The aim of including lecturers is the fact that they participated in the whole process of implementing the HEDP in various stages and therefore, they are responsible in the inculcation of skills that can enable them put in practice by delivering reasonable and acceptable services. The summary of lecturers' opinions given in Table 6.

Table 6: Lecturers' responses on the extent to which students' preparedness to deliver quality and sustainable community services (n=48)

Statements	VLE	LE	ME	HE	VHE	M
	%	%	%	%	%	
1. Programmes offered do not prepare students to offer QAS services	0.0	4.2	0.0	87.5	8.3	4.00
2. Difficult to impart life skills due to poor education background	45.4	27.1	22.9	2.5	2.1	2.19
3. Participation during learning makes students competent for work	10.4	2.1	2.1	37.5	47.9	4.10
4. Unemployment is the result of laziness among students	31.2	35.4	18.8	4.2	10.4	2.27
5. TCU SAG are adhered to by HEIs to enable students exercise QAS life skills	0.0	6.2	16.7	62.5	14.6	3.85
6. Most of students perceived as job seekers and not job creators	52.2	18.8	8.3	19.2	18.8	2.98
7. It is my fault when graduates fail to offer quality and sustainable service to the community	43.8	33.3	4.2	18.8	0.0	1.98
8. I try to equip students with entrepreneurial skills that prepare them to be self-reliant	18.8	8.3	12.5	41.7	18.8	3.33
9. Students do not fit in the EAI world due to weak programs offered	0.0	0.0	0.0	87.5	12.5	4.13
10. The government is obliged to employ all university graduates	35.4	31.2	22.9	10.4	0.0	2.08
11. Our students are Ethical and professional to offer QAS services entrusted to	0.0	0.0	0.0	50.0	50.0	4.50
12. Curriculum force lecturers to put much efforts on academic excellence but not life skills	37.5	6.25	4.2	31.3	20.8	3.32

Source: Field data (2022)

[Keys: 5=Very High Extent (VHE); 4=High Extent (HE); 3=Moderate Extent (ME); 2=Low Extent (LE); 1=Strongly Very Low Extent (VLE), %=Percentage, QAS= Quality and Sustainable, SAG= Standards and guidelines]

Data in Table 6 indicates that just like the response from final year students and alumni that extreme majority (95.8%) lecturer rated very high and high extent that programmes offered in universities do not prepare students to offer quality and sustainable services to the institutions or community they save while extreme minority (4.2%) rated low extent on the statement. This data informs that, universities are blamed to have been offering programmes which are practically not targeted to equip graduates with reasonable skills that could enable them deliver quality and sustainable services. The findings entail that, having the right personnel graduated from universities is in dilemma since employers complain for lacking skilled and committed people, on the other hands graduates complain for the lack of opportunities to offer services.

In trying to attest the argument, an interview with the employer of institution “A” was conducted to find out the reasons for their complaints over quality and sustainability of services graduates deliver. The employer shared that:

For sure, to some extent, some of them they appear to have a very good deliverance of the service that was expected. And as I have said earlier, most of these have good certificates and that we assume as they have performed very well. But the when it comes to the actual sense, majority of these graduates fail to deliver because of the nature of service or responsibilities that they are given once they are employed. For me I think, this is the result of poor university curriculums and what is taking place in the labour market is rendering them jobless. What is taught in the universities, is to the larger extent not revealed and becomes useless in the labour market. This is due to the mismatched between what is taking place in the labour market and what is taught in universities (*Face-to-face interview by Employer of Institution "A" on 5th May 2022*).

The information from an interview depicts that, there is a clear mismatch between curriculums in various programmes in universities do not match with skills needed for one to be able to deliver quality and sustainable services. The findings comply with what is insisted in the Value Added Theory that skills are the fundamental over knowledge and other cognitive abilities that majority graduate may claim to have as they are depicted in their certificates. The study findings are in agreement with that of Scurry and Renaud (2022) in the UK revealed that 21st century careers professionals should be comfortably talking to students about self-employment and freelancing, and flagging to relevant resources according to the needs of the client – a pre-packaged module will not suit everyone. This implies that, there is a mismatch between what is taught in universities in most of university is questionable in terms of relevance of programs offered in Tanzanian universities particularly in the Northern Zone Tanzania in which the study was contextualized.

Nevertheless, several other statements in which lecturers were required to give their opinions on confident they have over QAS of serveries offered. Table 6 indicates that, for the statement about Participation during learning makes students competent for work which had a mean score of 4.10; Students do not fit in the economic and industrial world due to weak programs offered ($m=4.13$) and the notion that, students are ethical and professional prepared to offer QAS services entrusted to. This implies that, universities from time to time have to ensure they inculcate relevant programs for successfully and high acceptable personnel due to the QAS services they deliver. On the other wing of the discussion, data in Table 6 indicates statements that were disagree and strongly disagreed such as, majority (66.6%; $m=2.27$) disagreed and strongly disagreed that Unemployment is the result of laziness among students, majority (69.0%) students and alumni perceived as job seekers and not job creators ($m=2.98$), majority (87.1%) strongly disagreed that, it is the lecturers failure when students fail to offer quality and sustainable service to the community ($m=1.98$). The statements affirm that, there are lot of gaps caused by universities being running programs traditionally with little innovative and creative ideas related to technological advancements that demands for soft skills that are suitable for the 21st century world of competitive economy. Aviso et al. (2021); Mwanyika et al. (2021); Munishi (2022) that, there numerous attempts and initiatives taken to ensure that higher education restore its dignity and for its graduates through imparting relevant and adequate skills that promote employability. Therefore, despite fundamental steps achieved by universities to promote provision of QAS services, universities still have a long way to go in order to enable graduates participate fully in

creating jobs rather than waiting for being employed which has recently increase the burden and dependency ration to the country's budget and delay personal and national development.

Summary of the Findings

The evaluation study found that, HEDP has not adequately brought about positive changes through programs offered in various universities on enhancing delivery of quality and sustainable services. This implies that, the quality of students and the entire higher education systems are questionable, the circumstance that makes the acceptability of university graduates to offer quality and sustainable services at local and international standards remain uncertain. This calls for major reforms in the entire system of education so as to enable students develop their career from lower secondary schools as the fundamental stage where universities are to indoctrinate and furnish adequate skills to perform the tasks entrusted at reasonable quality and consistently. Also, the study found that, backwardness in development of most organizations is the result of poor and irrelevant skills acquired by university graduates which do not fit to the job descriptions that demands committed and innovative personnel to deliver high-quality and sustainable service to the fast technological world. Additionally, the study exposed that, TCU standards and guidelines are clearly articulated as also addressing the demand for every university graduate to acquire adequate skills that can enable to fit in job at reasonable standards. However, little has been practically inculcated to students as they pursue various programmes.

The findings from hypothesis test revealed a definite association between faculty from which students and alumni belong and opinions that programmes offered do not enable them deliver quality and sustainable services. There independent Chi Square test showed difference in opinions on matters pertaining quality and sustainability of services expected to be expected to be delivered by students and alumni after completing their studies. Generally, the hypothesis test indicated that, final year bachelor degree students and university alumni perceive positively that poor programs offered by their universities have led to poor deliver of Quality and Sustainable (QAS) services they are entrusted to. Therefore, there is a mismatch between what is taught in universities in most of university and thus the quest for quality and sustainable services is questionable in terms of relevance of programs offered in Tanzanian universities particularly in the Northern Zone Tanzania in which the study was contextualized.

STUDY CONCLUSIONS

Based on the findings, the study concludes that, HEDP has not adequately brought about positive changes through programs offered in various universities. The study also concludes that backwardness in development in most organizations is the result of poor and irrelevant skills acquired by university graduates which do not fit to the job descriptions that demands committed and innovative personnel to deliver high-quality and sustainable service to the fast technological world. Additionally, the study concludes that, TCU standards and guidelines are plainly articulated as also addressing the demand for every university graduate to acquire adequate skills that can enable to fit in job at reasonable standards. However, little has been practically inculcated to students as they pursue various programmes. The study also conclude that, some faculties from which students belong

are equipped with reasonable skills that enable them offer quality and sustainable service while others are uncertain. Finally, the study concludes that, there is a mismatch between what is taught in most of university and thus the quest for quality and sustainable services is questionable due to traditional and outdated programs offered in Tanzanian universities particularly in the Northern Zone Tanzania in which the study was contextualized.

Recommendations

Based on the conclusions, the study recommends to the universities that, there should be periodic review and reform curriculums under each programme as per TCU standards and guidelines to enable so that programmes do not fade up and fail to bring about desired outcomes to the students. The study recommends to the universities that, career choice, entrepreneurship, guidance and mentorship have to be conducted to enable students stay in focus on what they are prepared to offer to the society after they complete their studies at higher quality and sustainable manner. Also, the study recommend that, universities should take initiatives to have a joint venture with stakeholders such as employers, economists, politicians and the entire industrial economy sector so as share the type and quality of skills they demand to cater for the needs of the descent job market as demanded in the 21st century. Finally, the study recommends to student and alumni that, imparted knowledge in their brains is simply a guiding manual of what they are supposed to offer to the community. So, it is very essential to change their mindsets so as to become innovative and self-reliant rather than continuously blaming the government, universities and programs they pursued.

References

- Aviso, K. B., Demeterio III, F. P. A., Janairo, J. I. B., Lucas, R. I. G., Promentilla, M. A. B., Tan, R. R., & Yu, D. E. C. (2021). What university attributes predict for graduate employability? *Cleaner Engineering and Technology*, 2, 100069.
- Chikazhe, L., Makanyeza, C., & Kakava, N. Z. (2022). The effect of perceived service quality, satisfaction and loyalty on perceived job performance: perceptions of university graduates. *Journal of Marketing for Higher Education*, 32(1), 1-18.
- Cohen, L., Manion, L., & Morrison, K. (2018). *Research methods in education*. (7th ed.). Routledge.
- Creswell, J.W. & Clark, V.L.P. (2018). *Mixed methods research*. (3rd ed.). Sage Publishers, Inc.
- Creswell, J.W. & Creswell, J.D. (2018). *Qualitative, Quantitative and Mixed methods Approach*. (5th ed.). Sage Publication, Inc.
- ILO (2020). *Global Employment Trends for youth 2020: Technology and future jobs*. ILO.
- ILO (2020). *World Employment and Social Outlook: Trends 2020*. International Labour Office.
- IUCEA (2010). *Road map to quality: A handbook for quality assurance in higher education*. IUCEA/DAAD.
- Kalufya, N. & Mwakajinga, (2016). Employability of graduates from Higher educational Institutions in Tanzania. *Institute of Social Work Journal*. 1(2).
- Magasi, C., Mashenene, R. G., & Dengenesa, D. M. (2022). Service Quality and Students' Satisfaction in Tanzania's Higher Education: A Re-examination of SERVQUAL Model.
- Melak, D., & Derbe, T. (2022). Analysis of determinants of youth self-employment career choices. *Journal of Small Business and Enterprise Development*.

- Mgaiwa, S. J., & Poncian, J. (2016). Public–private partnership in higher education provision in Tanzania: implications for access to and quality of education. *Bandung*, 3(1), 1-21.
- Mgaiwa, S. J. (2021). Fostering graduate employability: Rethinking Tanzania’s university practices. *SAGE Open*, 11(2), 21582440211006709.
- Mutalemwa, D. (2021). *An Empirical Study of University Education and Graduate Employability in Tanzania*. University of Dodoma.
- Munishi, E. J. (2022). Factors Contributing to Lack of Soft Skills among Tanzanian Higher Learning Graduates.
- Mwanyika, S., Salema, V. & Malusu, J.M. (2020). Evaluation of the Effectiveness of Higher Education Development Programme on Ensuring Higher Education Satisfy the Market Demands in Tanzania. *Research journal’s Journal of Education*. 6(10).
- Mwantimwa, K. (2019). Higher institution education and entrepreneurial knowledge acquisition of graduates in Tanzania. *Current Politics and Economics of Africa*, 12(2/3), 209-229.
- National Bureau of Statistics (2021). *Tanzania: Unemployment rates from 1999 to 2020*. NBS.
- Navarro-Espinosa, J. A., Vaquero-Abellán, M., Perea-Moreno, A. J., Pedrós-Pérez, G., Aparicio-Martínez, P., & Martínez-Jiménez, M. (2021). The Higher Education Sustainability before and during the COVID-19 Pandemic: A Spanish and Ecuadorian Case. *Sustainability*, 13(11), 6363.
- Ndyali, L. (2016). Higher Education System and Jobless Graduates in Tanzania. *Journal of Education and Practice*, 7(4), 116-121.
- Ogula, P. A. (2009). *A handbook on education research*. (2nd ed.). New Kemit.
- Ogula, P.A., Okendo, E.O. & Maithya, P.M. (2018). Educational research advanced short course: A guide for. SEREK.
- Okendo, E.O., Atoni, R., & Kitula, P.R. (2020). *Fundamentals of educational research: Concepts and methods*. Rinny Educational and Technical Publishing Services.
- Orozco-Messana, J., Martínez-Rubio, J.M. & González-Pons, A.M. (2020). *Sustainable Higher Education Development through Technology Enhanced Learning*.
- OXFAM (2019). *The power of education to fight inequality how increasing educational equality and quality is crucial to fighting economic and gender inequality*. Oxfam Briefing Paper: OXFAM.
- Pandya, B., Patterson, L., & Ruhi, U. (2022). The readiness of workforce for the world of work in 2030: perceptions of university students. *International Journal of Business Performance Management*, 23(1-2), 54-75.
- Salami, S. S., & Tiamiyu, K. A. (2019). *Enhancing Quality University Education for Sustainable Development in Nigeria: Private Sector Roles and Challenges*.
- Scott, F. J., & Willison, D. (2021). Students’ reflections on an employability skills provision. *Journal of Further and Higher Education*, 45(8), 1118-1133.
- Scurry, T., & Renaud, V. (2022). Turbulent Transitions: Graduate Unemployment and Underemployment. *What do graduates do? 2021/22*.
- Sumberg, J., Fox, L., Flynn, J., Mader, P., & Oosterom, M. (2021). Africa’s “youth employment” crisis is actually a “missing jobs” crisis. *Development Policy Review*, 39(4), 621-643.

- Stufflebeam, D. L. (2000). The CIPP model for evaluation. In *Evaluation models* (pp. 279-317). Springer, Dordrecht.
- Tamrat, W. (2022). Graduate Employability: Whose Responsibility? In *Higher Education in Ethiopia* (pp. 202-204). Brill.
- TCU (2020). *VITALSTATS on university education in Tanzania 2019*. TCU.
- TCU (2019). *Handbook for standards and guidelines for university education in Tanzania*. (3rd ed.). TCU.
- UN (2015). *Transforming the word: the 2030 agenda for sustainable development goal*. UN.
- URT (2010). *Higher Education Development Programme 2010 -2015: enhanced relevancy access and quality in Education*. URT.
- URT (1999). *National higher education policy*. MoSTHE.
- Wong, B., Chiu, Y. L. T., Copsey-Blake, M., & Nikolopoulou, M. (2021). A mapping of graduate attributes: what can we expect from UK university students? *Higher Education Research & Development*, 1-16.
- World Economic Forum (2017). *The future of jobs and skills in Africa: Preparing the region for the fourth industrial revolution*. Samans, R. & Zahid, S. eds. WEF.