SPATIAL POLICY EVALUATION IN THE TANGERANG CITY (EFFECTIVENESS AND EFFICIENCY PERSPECTIVE)

Dafyar Eliadi H¹

Ph.D Candidate in Public Administration, University of Padjadjaran, Indonesia

ABSTRACT: The assessment different policy with studies policy on the implementation or formulation of policy. Policy evaluation process in perspective a groove / the cycle of public policy, occupying a position last after the implementation of policy, so that it is only natural if public policy that has been made and executed and evaluated .Evaluation also thought that the links between the theory (policies) with practice (implementation) in the form of the impact of the implementation of policy, what is the significance is in accordance with who is expected to or not .Also of the evaluation results we can evaluate whether a program policy affording benefit or not its intended for the community .Normatively the function of evaluation is needed as a form of public accountability, especially in the society that became more critical evaluate performance of the government. There was a policy of spatial planning in tangerang is still facing problems in any policy, hence the improvement process are needed to be deep to do .It is indicated by the presence of the problems in the use of space that is indicative of the mismatch of space utilization in locations are allocated as the area, settlement, the warehouse and others. The based on the background, the question of this research is how is the spatial planning evaluation in tangerang?

KEYWORDS: Evaluation, Policy, Spatial

INTRODUCTION

Study of the evaluation of different policies with formulation of policies or the review of the implementation of the policy. The evaluation policy in the perspective of the process flow/public policy cycle, occupies the last position after the implementation of the policy, so it's only natural if public policies that have been created and implemented and evaluated. The evaluation will also assess the link between the theory of (policy) and practice (implementation) in the form of the impact of policy, whether the impact as expected or not. From the results of the evaluation, we can assess whether a policy/program provide benefits or not intended for the public.

In the normative function of evaluation is needed as a form of the public questioned, especially in the increasingly critical communities assess the performance of the Government. Study of evaluation of policies related to the problems of spatial policy on evaluation. Spatial management is an important aspect in improving the quality of

Published by European Centre for Research Training and Development UK (www.eajournals.org)

sustainable development in Indonesia in General and the city of tangerang in particular. This paper specifically contains a description of a problem setting up the space in the town of Tangerang, and descriptions problems became its uniqueness. The uniqueness are especially associated with the privilege of the Tangerang city as the location of the local international airport, the largest in Indonesia namely Soekarno Hatta. This has spurred rapid growth in the area of Tangerang city and will have an impact on the development of the region and the spatial. Problems that make the writers striking and assessed are interested in doing the research is primarily associated with the use of space which does not match allocation.

This can be explained in landscape management and spatial concept, in which there are clear regulations, has actually been in use of space, but it turns out the allocation or use not in accordance with the rules of use of the existing space. These things need to be evaluated, especially for knowing where the source of the problem comes from, and why these problems can occur.

As the location where one of the largest airport was built, making the phenomenon of spatial in this study differs from that found in other areas-. In the data –preliminary data have been obtained, there has been a mismatch of land allocation, where the area is supposed to be used as the airport was used as a residential area that is intended for a settlement turned out to be used for the construction of the warehouse. It is certainly not in accordance with the rules of use of space, and need to look for the base of the problem or background problems in the use of space. Some instrument setup region has been published, but some of the problems that have been raised can be aspects that need to be evaluated in the implementation of the policy.

With regard to development planning in the region, especially in terms spatial, that concern the Government of the Republic of Indonesia has published Act No. 26 of 2007 about the Structuring of space, which is a guideline for the implementation of sustainable development. The spatial plan must produce which had a high anticipation of power development and no less quickly with development needs.

Therefore, the spatial plan must be operational realistis that serves as a coordination instrument for development programs of the various sources of funding, as a manisfestation of the utilization of space. Thus the spatial plan is a strategic policy both at the central level as well as the region.

Based on Act No. 26 of 2007 concerning Spatial, spatial consists of three (3) activities, i.e. the process of spatial planning, use of space, and controlling the utilization of space. In this case the spatial plans as a result of spatial planning should be incorporated in the guidelines for the utilization of space. Use of space is done through the use of space programs and their implementation of cost, which is based on the spatial plan.

Published by European Centre for Research Training and Development UK (www.eajournals.org)

Associated with spatial Tangerang city, has drawn up rules for the number 6 in 2012 about the spatial plan of the city of Tangerang, which governs the allocation of space in the town of Tangerang, Tangerang Mayor Rules as well as no. 32 in 2008 about the Organization and The Department of city planning Work regulating the Spatial organization of Auth as an important part of the Department of city planning coupled with the establishment of a monitoring team will be specifically will monitor the performance of policies in spatial Tangerang.

Spatial field is led by a head of the principal has a duty to lead, plan, organize and control the activities of organizing some tasks within the scope of The drafting and evaluation of the implementation of the spatial plan of the city; implementation of the survey and mapping spatial; as well as the control and supervision of the use of space.

See the various phenomena that occur in the city of Tangerang, where there are land use and the space that is not in accordance with the allocation, so this research will focus on evaluation of policy spatial in the town of Tangerang. This is important in an effort to find the cause of widespread abuse of the use of space, and searching more deeply the causes of discrepancies between the regulations on the use of space and its implementation in the field.

Tangerang City Planning Department has had the elements – elements on Spatial field, such as Spatial Kabid, head of the Spatial Planning of the technical Section, Section Head mapping and Survey, as well as the head of the section for the control of space, where all have the task of conducting an evaluation, but a general overview on the ground still showed discrepancies in the allocation of some parts of the spatial city of Tangerang. Some information obtained indicates the existence of land use should being tended for the expansion of the airport but was later built on trade and services, then land intended for housing land should then built warehouse. This is an example of the use of space which is not in accordance with the allocation.

Administratively it violates but often happens is polemic, because despite the obvious – obvious violations have occurred in land use, but it is not easy to do. It is due to the owners of the building have a IMB (Building Permit). Evaluation and analysis associated with a variety of such phenomena will provide an overview and analysis of why these issues can occur.

Spatial utilization control in Tangerang city was part of the process of creating order in things spatial as well as an important part in this process. The first search is an important step to do is to observe the various processes in the granting of permission to erect the building. This is because many of the permit – the permissions granted precisely overlap with the status of land that should be used for other things. Land use allocation permission consistently with rigorous surveillance system is one of the important instruments in creating order in the utilization of space in the town of Tangerang.

Published by European Centre for Research Training and Development UK (www.eajournals.org)

The existence of this permission throughout the land use changes are required to get permission from the City Government of Tangerang without exception. But in reality on the ground is still plentiful land use changes without permission from the local government and even violated existing spatial plans, making use of space is not effective, the chaotic territory planning, and the impact on the environment and the welfare of society.

The existence of various problems in the process of spatial policies in Tangerang city and evaluation of policies at the service of The city of Tangerang, especially sub-spatial field is crucial. Thus expected the various stages of the evaluation conducted on the apparatus can improve the performance Of The Tangerang city, especially sub-office of Spatial. In conducting the evaluation policy of the Tangerang city Spatial evaluation process conducted by the established Teams set up by the Mayor of Tangerang Town Space in order to be able to walk well. The team is located in tangerang City Planning Department, whose members must work in the area of Tangerang which were divided into the eastern region, Western region, and the central region.

This paper is at the scope of the evaluation of spatial policy with the consideration that the drafting of the Spatial Plan of the city of Tangerang over the policy process is long enough, both technical and political process. Once set in the year 2012, the city of Tangerang Spatial policy became a reference for the Government to provide licensing Tangerang city for investors in the town of Tangerang, and also to the whole community in the town of Tangerang who make use of land in the town of tangerang.

LITERATURE

According to Dunn (2000: 185) the term evaluation can be like ned to valuation (appraisal), awarding numbers (ratings), and valuation (assessment). Evaluation with regard to the production of information regarding the value or benefits "policy. The evaluation provides valid information regarding the performance of a policy, i.e. how far the needs, values, and the opportunity has been can be achieved through publicactions, evaluating contributed on clarification and critique of the values that under lie the selection of goals and targets. Evaluation of the contributions on the application methods of the analysis of other policies, including the formulation of problems and recommendations. So even though the entire process with regard to policy, evaluation policy is more concerned on the performance of policies, in particular on the implementation of public policy.

The purpose of developing the evaluation according to Westra (1983: 41) is how to provide information that is prepared on development programs in order to achieve the intended main target and goal can control procedurally in compliance with plans and programs, so that with the holding of the deciding policy expected that evaluation be

informed about program implementation and results, which can help them in making decisions, including whether to add, reduce or even modify existing programs.

As a system, then no policy evaluation activities regardless of the activity or the other stages. How it looked in sight of evaluation activities inherent in all stages of the activity since the formulation, implementation, as well as how the results or benefits for the community as a goal of the policy. So basically the purpose of the evaluation is also the goal of all stages of the policy. (Rusli, 2013: 113).

Evaluation according to Dunn in Nugroho (2003: 181) definition of evaluation can be explained as follows:

"Evaluation has related meanings, each point on the scale of values of some applications of the results of policies and programs. In general the term evaluation can be like ned to interpretation (apparisal), giving the figures (Charts) and assessment (just my Assessment), words which States attempt to analyze the results of the policy in the sense of other units. In a more specific sense, the evaluation with regard to the production of information on the results of the policy value or benefits."

PAL (1988: 49-57) divide the evaluation policy into four categories:

- 1. Planning and needs evaluations
 Includes an assessment of the target population, the needs of the present and
 futureas well as existing resources.
- 2. Process evaluations

Evaluation of implementing measures, implementing programs and media information systems.

- 3. Impact evaluations
 - Evaluation of the impact of the policies of both the expected and unexpected as well as the expansion of the program.
- 4. Efficiency evaluations
 - Evaluation of the efficiency of the policy, which can be seen from a comparison of the cost advantage.

The essence of the evaluation according to LAN, (2005: 131) is to provide feedback (feedback), which leads to a good result (successful outcomes) according to the size of the real and objective. In fact, the purpose of the evaluation is to repair (if necessary, not in order to prove/to improve, not to prove). Two things to be disclosed through the evaluation were: (1) the output (output policy) policy, that is what is produced by the presence of policy formulation; (2) results/impact policy (policy outcomes/consequences), i.e. the result and consequences caused by publication and implementation of a policy.

Evaluation of public policies is one of the stages of the policy process are critical and essential, since this process would involve not only the evaluators of academicians and

Published by European Centre for Research Training and Development UK (www.eajournals.org)

practitioners, but involves other community component, so that created conditions where there is no distance between the public policies with the community.

RESEARCH METHOD

Based on the characteristics of research that aims to answer questions of research on Policy Evaluation Spatial description in Tangerang city through observation and in-depth interview technique. The next goal is emphasized in research who wish to acquire a new concept about the evaluation of Spatial Policies in Tangerang city through the collection of primary data from informants and observations as well as secondary data processing in the field. To that end, this research design using qualitative methods.

Qualitative methods research was carried out based on the problems with the aim of empirical research examined in dig or build a proposition or explain the meaning behind the reality. In this study, the researchers used a qualitative research method with approach case studies. Qualitative methods are used to investigate a particular social phenomenon carefully to answer questions research.

Based on the type of research that the researcher only developed the concept and gather facts, because it is limited to research efforts revealed a situation or event or circumstance of the subject/object of the research on the present moment based on the facts that appear to be or as it is.

The source of the data in this study is the main or primary source of data and additional data source or secondary data. The main data source in the qualitative research is all the action in the field in the form of statements and actions of all perpetrators or informants scrutinized, the source of primary data is from all sides where the expected data is accurate, complete and profound than the informants in the context of the evaluation of spatial policy in the city of Tangerang.

The researchers chose the informant by considering the ability of providing the required data as such, the researchers were able to determine other information with the consideration can improve data information that has been obtained, this technique is done to the direction and focus of researchers.

In the preparation of this study, prior made a plan for data analysis, researchers made a plan of data analysis which aims to organize data obtained by researchers in the field, where data are adapted to the various processes and research issues that exist.

As for the series of process data analysis in this research include:

1. the data analysis process begins by reviewing all available data from various sources, i.e. from interviews, observations, written in the Notes field, personal documentation, official documents, pictures, photos, and more.

- 2. after read, studied and analyzed, then the next step is to hold the data reduction is done by way of making abstraction. Abstraction is made a summary of the core, the process, and the statement needs to be guarded so as to remain in context.
- 3. the next step is to assemble the unit -a unit. Unit -a unit of it then the next step.

After the above is done the entire series, and then the final stage of this analysis is the examination of the legality of the conduct of data (Data validation). Testing the validity of the data in this study are based on certain criteria, namely the degree of confidence and correctness of the data obtained from the informants (credibility), truth (correctness), a description, conclusions, and explanation (explanation) which can be known from compliance with some of the other data sources such as the results of the observation process in the evaluation of policies and also documents related to spatial policy city of Tangerang.

DISCUSSION

If looking at the Tangerang region regulation regarding spatial explained that the purpose of structuring space areas of the city are realizing the space City as a center of Ministry of industry, trade and services, as well as education and culture regional environmentally as part of national strategic areas of Jakarta, Bogor, Depok, Tangerang, Bekasi, Puncak, Cianjur (Jabodetabekpunjur).

The purpose of this policy is to be in position to evaluate Spatial policy city of Tangerang, the authors see Office of city planning will not regardless of the purpose. Then continue to make an effort so that the Spatial policy can run and be able to meet the mandate of the ACT i.e. the Spatial availability of Green open space of 30% of the land area of the city of Tangerang.

The promulgation of the Tangerang city Spatial policy is a form of City Government's efforts in tackling the problem of Tangerang Space in the town of Tangerang. The existence of the policy due problems that arise in the community, there is a policy to resolve the issue.

In the area of Regulation No. 6 in 2012 About Spatial Plan area of Tangerang city 2012-2032, explaining the regulations due to the appearance of the existence of a limited space and a growing understanding of the people of the importance of structuring space so needed a transparent spatial organization, effective, and participatory in order to materialize a safe space, comfortable and productive.

Tangerang is no condition can experience an area, while the population growth continues to experience increased. Based on the results of the 2010 census, the average rate of population growth in the town of Tangerang was of 2 percent per year, over the last ten years since 2000-2010.

Each year the population density grew while the area remains. With a density of population of the need for three places higher. It became much consideration by the Government Of Canada in developing the construction on its territory is small.

The objectives stated in local regulations No. 6 in 2012 About Spatial Plan area of Tangerang city 2012-2032, became the motivation for implementor in carrying out the policy. Then the stated policy objectives also be guidelines for evaluators to run the evaluation process so that Spatial policy in Tangerang city can run properly.

Tangerang city became a strategic area because it became the city of Tangerang who was instrumental in the development and construction of the city of Jakarta and its surrounding areas. Tangerang has a large participation in the supply of labor and also received in Jakarta. Then from the Tangerang city became part of the national strategic areas of Jakarta, Bogor, Depok, Tangerang, Bekasi, Puncak, Cianjur (Jabodetabekpunjur) which prioritized its spatial Setup, because it has very important in the sphere of influence of the city in the field of economic, social, cultural and/or the environment.

If looking at the stages in the cycle of public policy and one of the important stages in the cycle of public policy is the implementation of policy. Implementation is often thought of as simply the implementation of what has been decided by the legislature or the decision makers, this stage sometimes less influential. But in reality, the stages of implementation to be so important because such a policy would not mean anything if not be implemented properly and correctly. In other words the implementation phase where a policy implemented to its full potential and be able to achieve the purpose of the policy it self.

In conducting the review of the field is done every week by the Spatial KotaTangerang.Done anyway based on the petition by the investor or developer to view of land to be used. That's when the review process is done. In one day The Spatial location of the review addressing the Tangerang city to see the permit allocation can be 3-6 petition. With so much intensity that begged to see the permissions Department of Spatial designation, Tangerang, doing the evaluation in the field by dividing the three regions, namely Eastern region, central region and Western region.

General plan document spatial Tangerang city was the result of a consensus of the stakeholders, which contains policy settings, control strategies, and supervision of construction of the Tangerang city ahead. Tangerang City policy strategy contained in the form of utilization policy space, urban infrastructure development policy, public service policy, development policy settlements, economic development policy, urban design policy, environmental policy, and specific area.

In an area or region, would experience and need to do Development region (regional development), which is an effort to advance the level of the economy and the well-being

Published by European Centre for Research Training and Development UK (www.eajournals.org)

of society in a region by making use of all existing resources optimally. Thus in the development of the region should pay attention to potentialities that are owned by the region. As is the case in the town of Tangerang, with an area that remains, but the region continues to grow. The potential that is owned by the city of Tangerang to be optimized very well.

Spatial is a tool or instrument used to bring about the development of the spatial consists of three main instruments, namely: 1. spatial planning area 2. Utilization of space or the implementation of the plan of spatial region 3. Control of the use of space.

Thus the existence of the Spatial policy, giving little emphasis to private/private to provide green fields. This is reflected in the permit application was by investors to the Government town of Tangerang. the evaluation process is conducted in the form of implementation of the policy itself. Evaluation can be done in the process not only performed in the final stages of an activity program. Yet done in the process of collecting data related to the subject of the evaluation process. This is done in the review process into the field to check whether a building permit has been granted is in compliance with the allocation. Or even check whether the location of land that will be used in accordance with the building in the land.

Spatial policy in Tangerang, implementing overall both functionally and opearationally from Tangerang city spatial policy consists of many actors who are indeed interrelated. Implementing actors in Spatial policy city of Tangerang when mapped consists of; the local government that in this case the burden of responsibility of spatial is located in Tangerang city Spatial Agency supported by the other ministries that are indeed related to spatial Tangerang city like Bappeda, Department of the environment and the society and private parties, either as the main actor in the implementation of the policy or the actor's Companion. The main highlights are private in this Space for private (employers) that has lots of plans for investing in property or construction/industrial factory in the town of Tangerang. Then with the entrepreneur, stretching will be limited by the Spatial Policy in the city of Tangerang. Entrepreneurs can't necessarily be easily get permission to build the property or other business type without looking at the Spatial policy in advance.

Spatial policy in Tangerang, Tangerang picture described in the future as a result of a mutual agreement, a common goal, run in goal with the projection of the Tangerang city as a center of Ministry of industry, trade and services, as well as education and culture regional environmentally as part of National Strategic from Jakarta, Bogor, Depok, Tangerang, Bekasi, Puncak, Cianjur (Jabodetabekpunjur). To achieve this policies that later can represent the desired goals.

In achieving the objectives of a public policy, the cost of the process is not a little. The number of cost that must be removed, however the result is thus not achieving the objectives that have been set previously. Therefore required efisensi in any public policy implementation.

Handling the construction of Tangerang City faced with numerous problems that must be resolved with the needs of a very large cost. Tangerang Banten area as a city that became the capital city of Jakarta buffer, even into the city center from the megapolitan Jabodetabek area. Expressly for financing the implementation of his policies is the responsibility of the Government of the city of Tangerang. With so many businessman who developed his business in the town of Tangerang, causing the city of Tangerang has a pretty big tax source. Results of the large capital tax for the city of Tangerang in the conduct of policy Space in the town of Tangerang.

Even to get the minimum number of a green area of the city has about 30 percent, or an estimated shortage of Tangerang City 1,600 ha RTH to be owned by the Government. So if the average one meter Rp1 million, requiring an acre compared Indosat Rp10 billion for the liberation of its land, if as many as 1,600 acres of the funds needed for Rp16 trillion.

Spatial policy Tangerang is the macro policies that have derivative policies is relatively quite a lot. Of the derivative policies there were later passed into the programs. In practice, where timeliness is expected that net benefits obtained in The Spatial policy such as expected, or even more.

Tangerang city Spatial policy already existed since the formation of the city of Tangerang. Since 1994 and then revised at the beginning of 2000, which in 2013 is theregulation of the Tangerang Region 3rd about the space. In a change of the regulation, following the development of the city of Tangerang and also in accordance with the mandate of the previous regulations.

Such a policy would entail costs in its efforts to achieve the desired goals. In making these units cost necessary to harsher a budgeting, to appropriate cost benefits and recorded properly. Any budget on a policy determined in accordance with the requirements of the policy. But there are times when there is improper use of target, in the sense of the use of the budget being wasted because it doesn't fit what you want a head of time.

The budget for the field of Spatial Planning Service at Tangerang 2013 only ranged from 1.8 billion. Budget is a financial plan with the structured program that has been validated and is a plan written on the activities of an organisation which is expressed quantitatively and is generally expressed in monetary units for a certain period.

The budget is big enough for only its realization is still not in compliance with the planned budget. The difficulty for the implementor's policy to realize the budget, because the bumps on the realization for the acquisition of land. If the land is already above the factory or even home communities, it will be difficult for the Government to conduct the Tangerang land acquisition. They tend not to give his house to condem ned to open green space.

Published by European Centre for Research Training and Development UK (www.eajournals.org)

Based on the results of the evaluation team who were in the service of the city of Tangerang, the budget is still a bit short of expectations even to conduct land acquisition. The evaluation is done by performing the action on the Court to crosscheck whether land has been used in accordance with the allocation. If the new development will be easier to make adjustments in accordance with building land that , even to provide RTH on the new building would be easier if compared to performing actions for the buildings that have been standing a long time, even before the policy Space in 2012 was passed.

Tangerang region has a strategic role and function within the broader area of megapolitan i.e. Jabodetabekjur (Jakarta, Bogor, Depok, Bekasi, Tangerang, Cianjur), thus the development of Tangerang city has great benefits for explored. Mainly for the benefit of the local population. This achievement during the construction of the Tangerang city was indeed quite rapidly but the benefits are mostly felt by residents outside the city of Tangerang who invest or even working in the town of Tangerang. For that the Government should have policies that can trial on local residents so that they cannot feel marginalized.

The plan is a form of spatial plan taking into account the interests of the various sectors of community activity in allocating land/space and resources contained there in (acomprehensive) in accordance of the meaning of spatial plan is the basis for the utilization of space/land. Spatial plan is the product of a plan that contains the development plan of the structure of space and space utilization pattern plans to achieve at the end of years of planning.

The structure of the space formed by the central system activity and network system infrastructure that includes a network system of transport (land, sea, air), electrical and energy network systems, telecommunication networks, systems and network system of water resources. While the pattern of use of space is a space allocation for various types of land use planned. Spatial quality plan is a precondition in conducting spatial. However the spatial plan should be coupled with a controlling utilization.

CONCLUSION

If looking at the Tangerang region regulation regarding Spatial explained that the purpose of structuring space areas of the city are realizing the space City as a center of Ministry of industry, trade and services, as well as education and culture regional environmentally as part of national strategic areas of Jakarta, Bogor, Depok, Tangerang, Bekasi, Puncak, Cianjur (Jabodetabekpunjur).

The objectives stated in local regulations No. 6 in 2012 About Spatial Plan area of Tangerang city 2012-2032, became the motivation for implementor in carrying out the policy. Then the stated policy objectives also be guidelines for evaluators to run the evaluation process so that Spatial policy in Tangerang city can run properly.

Criteria of effectiveness is already running because it has a clear goal in Tangerang city Spatial policy. But in the process efficiency for the use of the budget is still not well done, due to the absorption of the budget for land acquisition has yet to be done. Because the land was already occupied by a community long enough and needed a big enough budget.

REFERENCES

- Abdul Wahab, Solichin.1990. Introduction To The Analysis Of The Wisdom Of The State. Jakarta: Rineka Cipta.
- Badjuri, Abdulkahar & Yuwono, Teguh, 2002, Public Policy Concept & Strategy. Semarang: Undip Press
- Branch, Melvile C. 1995. City planning Comprehensive introduction and Explanation. Yogyakarta: Penerbit UGM.
- Bridgman, J. & Davis G. 2000. Australian Policy Handbook, Australia: Allen & Unwin.
- Bromley, Daniel W. 1989, *Economic Interest and Institutions : The Conceptual Foundations of Public Policy*. New York : Basil Blackwell.
- Catanese, A.J. dan Snyder, J.C. 1986. *Pengantar Perencanaan Kota*. Jakarta: Penerbit Erlangga.
- Constantios, Doxiadies. 1975. Ekistics An Introduction To The Science of Human Settermarts. London: Hutchinson and Co Publishers
- Cook, Thomas J., Scioli, Jr, Frank P.1975, *Impact Analysis In Public Policy Research*. New York: Beverly Hills: Sage Publication.
- Daldjoeni. 1987. Geography of towns and villages. Bandung: Alumni.
- Dunn, William. N. 1994. *Public Policy Analysis : An Introduction*. New Jersey : Prentice-Hall, Inc
- ------ 2000. *Introduction To The Analysis Of Public Policy*.. Editor: Samodra Wibawa, dkk. Yogyakarta: Gajah Mada University Press.
- Dye, Thomas R. 1976. *Policy Analysis: What Governments Do, Why They Do It, and What Difference It Makes*. Albama: The University of Albama Press.
- ----- 1992. Understanding Public Policy. New Jersey: Prentice-Hall, Inc.
- Edward III, George C 1980. *Implementing Pubic Policy*. Washington DC: Congressional Quarterly Inc.
- Edward III, George C and Ira Sharkansky. 1978. *The Policy Predicament: Making and Implementing Public Policy*. San Francisco: W.H. Freeman and Company.
- Grindle, Marielee. S. 1980. *Politics and Policy Implementation in the Third World*. New Jersey: Princeton University Press.
- Hutapea, Parulian dan Nurianna Thoha. 2008. *Competence Plus*. Jakarta: PT Gramedia Pustaka Utama.
- Islamy, Irfan M. 1997. *The Principles For The Formulation Of State Policy*. Jakarta: Bumi Aksara.
- Jayadinata, Johara T. 1999. *Land use Planning In Rural, urban, and regional*. Bandung: Penerbit ITB.

- Published by European Centre for Research Training and Development UK (www.eajournals.org)
- Jones, Charles O. 1996. *Introduction To Public Policy (Public Policy)*. Terjemahan Ricky Ismanto. Jakarta : PT Raja Grafindo Persada.
- Kivell, Philip. 1993. *Land and The City: Patterns and Process of Urban Change*. London: Routledge.
- Langbein, Laura Irwin. 1980. Discovering Whether Programs Work: A Guide To Statistical Methods For Program Evaluation. California: Goodyear Publishing Company.
- Lembaga Administrasi Negara RI. 2005. SANKRI, Book III Foundations and Basic guidelines for Implementation and development of the system of State administration. Jakarta: LAN.
- Maguire, D.J., Kimber, B., and Chick, J. 1991. *Integrated Geographic Information Systems: the importance of raster*. Seattle: *ACSM/ASPRS Annual Convention Technical Paper*.
- Mahmudi. 2005. *Public Sector Performance Management*. Yogyakarta: UPPAMPYKPN. Maxwell, Joseph A. 1996. *Qualitative Research Design: An Introduction Approach*. London: Sage Pub.
- Mustopadidjaja.2003. Process management: Public Policy Formulation, implementation, and Performance Evaluation. Jakarta: Lembaga Administrasi Negara dan Duta Pertiwi Foundation.
- Nasution. 2004. *Total Service Management, Integrated Service Management*. Jakarta: Ghalia Indonesia
- Neuman, W. Lawrence. 2013. *Methodology of social research: qualitative and quantitative Approaches*. Jakarta: PT. Indeks.
- Nugroho, Riant D.2003. *Public Policy Formulation, implementation and Formulation*. Jakarta: PT Elex Media Komputindo.
- Pal, Leslie A. 1987. Publik Policy Analysis: An Introduction. Toronto: Methoen.
- Person, wayne, 2006. . Public Policy, introduction to the theory and practice of Policy Analysis. Jakarta: Kencana Prenada Media Group.
- Putra, Fadillah. 2003. *Critical Paradigm In The Study Of Public Policy*. Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar.
- Rose, Richard. 1969. The Power Elite. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Rusli, Budiman. 2013. *Public policy: building a public service that is Responsive*. Bandung : Hakim Publishing.
- Santoso, Amir. 1993. *Public Policy Analysis: An Introduction*. Jakarta: Jurnal Ilmu Politik Sekaran, Uma 1992. *Research Methods for Business: A Skill Building, Approach* (2nd *Edition*). Singapore: John Wiley &Sons Inc.
- Sinulingga, D, Budi. 1999. *The construction of city, Regional and local Views. Jakarta:* Pustaka Sinar Harapan.
- Soegijo, G. Sidharta. 1989. Introduction To The Catalogue Of The Exhibition "Embracing The Sky". Galeri Soemardja. Bandung: FSRD ITB.
- Subarsono, AG.2006. *Public policy analysis (concepts, theories and Apikasi)*, Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar.
- Suradinata, Ermaya. 1998. *Management of Government and the Autonomy of the region*. Bandung: Ramadan.

Sulaiman, Affan. 1998. *Public Policy-The Policy Of The Government*. Bandung: BKU Ilmu Pemerintahan Program Magister Ilmu-ilmu Sosial pada Institut Ilmu Pemerintahan Kerjasama UNPAD-IIP.

Stillman II, Ricard J (penyunting). 1988. *Public Administration: Concepts & Cases. Boston*: Hounghton Mifflin Company.

Tachjan. 2006. *Implementation Of Public Policy*. Bandung: Penerbit AIPI Bandung – Puslit KP2W Lemlit Unpad.

Terry, George R.2000. *Principles Of Management. (Indonesia-language edition)*. Bandung: PT. Bumi Aksara.

Thoha, Miftah. 1986. Organizational behavior: the basic concept and its application. Jakarta: CV. Rajawali

Tjokrowinoto, Moeljarto. 1996. *Development, the dilemma and challenge*. Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar.

Wahab, Solichin Abdul. 1991. *Analysis of Wisdom: from Formulation to implementation of State Policy*. Jakarta: Bumi Aksara.

Weiss, C.H. 1972. Evaluation Research: Methods for Assessing Program Effectiveness. Toronto: Englewood Cliff.

Westra, Pariata. 1983. *The Management Of Regional Development*. Jakarta: Ghalia Indonesia.

Wibawa, Samudra. 1994. Public policy: Process and analysis. Jakarta: Intermedia.

Widodo, Joko. 2008. *Public policy analysis (concepts, and application of public policy Process)*. Malang: Bayumedia.

Winarno, Budi. 2002. Theory and process of public policy. Yogyakarta: Media Pressindo.

Peraturan Daerah Kota TangerangNo. 6 Tahun 2012Tentang RencanaTata Ruang WilayahKota Tangerang

Peraturan Daerah Provinsi Banten Nomor 36 Tahun 2002 tentang Rencana Tata Ruang Wilayah Provinsi Banten Tahun 2002-2017 (Lembaran Daerah Propinsi Banten Tahun 2002 Nomor 38 Seri C)

Peraturan Menteri Pekerjaan Umum No. 05/PRT/M/2008, tentang Pedoman Penyediaan dan Pemanfaatan Ruang di Kawasan Perkotaan

Peraturan Menteri Pendayagunaan Aparatur Negara no Per/15/M.Pan/7/2008 tentang Pedoman Umum Reformasi Birokrasi.

Peraturan WalikotaKota TangerangNo. 32 Tahun 2008Tentang RencanaTata Ruang WilayahKota Tangerang

Undang-Undang Pokok Agraria Nomor 5 Tahun 1960

Undang-undang Nomor 4 Tahun 1992 tentang Perumahan dan Pemukiman

Undang-Undang Nomor 22 Tahun 1999 dan perubahannya yaitu Undang-Undang Nomor 32 Tahun 2004 tentang Pemerintahan Daerah yang menekankan Otonomi daerah.

Undang-Undang Nomor 25 Tahun 1999 dan perubahannya yaitu Undang-Undang Nomor 33 Tahun 2004 tentang Perimbangan Keuangan antara Pemerintah Pusat dan Pemerintah Daerah.

Undang-Undang Nomor 26 Tahun 2007 tentang Penataan Ruang.

Published by European Centre for Research Training and Development UK (www.eajournals.org)