

## RESEARCH ON CLOTHING OF ANCIENT CHARACTERS IN MURALS OF DUNHUANG MOGAO GROTTOS AND ARTWORKS OF SUTRA CAVE LOST OVERSEAS

**Xia Sheng Ping**

Tunhuangology Information Center of Dunhuang Research Academy, Dunhuang, Gansu Province, China

E-mail: [dhxiashengp@hotmail.com](mailto:dhxiashengp@hotmail.com), [1125443239@QQ.com](mailto:1125443239@QQ.com)

---

**ABSTRACT:** *At the beginning of the twentieth century (1900), the Sutra Cave of the Mogao Grottoes in Dunhuang (presently numbered Cave 17) was discovered by accident. This cave contained tens of thousands of scriptures, artworks, and silk paintings, and became one of the four major archeological discoveries of modern China. The discovery of these texts, artworks, and silk paintings in Dunhuang shook across China and around the world. After the discovery of Dunhuang's Sutra Cave, expeditions from all over the world flocked to Dunhuang to acquire tens of thousands of ancient manuscripts, silk paintings, embroidery, and other artworks that had been preserved in the Sutra Cave, as well as artifacts from other caves such as murals, clay sculptures, and woodcarvings, causing a significant volume of Dunhuang's cultural relics to become lost overseas. The emergent field of Tunhuangology, the study of Dunhuang artifacts, has been entirely based on the century-old discovery of the Sutra Cave in Dunhuang's Mogao Grottoes and the texts and murals unearthed there. However, the dress and clothing of the figures in these lost artworks and cultural relics has not attracted sufficient attention from academic experts. The author has therefore systematically researched the dress and clothing worn by all characters in the ancient murals and artworks of Dunhuang's Sutra Cave in the hope that this research will provide valuable information for the study of ancient clothing.*

**KEYWORDS:** lost overseas, dunhuang murals, sutra cave artwork, clothing

---

## INTRODCUTION

### Foreword:

On May 26<sup>th</sup> of the 26th year of the reign of Qing Dynasty Emperor Guangxu (year 1900), Taoist priest Wang Yuanlu of the Mogao Grottoes' Sanqing Palace accidentally discovered the Sutra Cave (currently numbered Cave 17). Thousands of scriptures, artworks and silk paintings were found in this Sutra Cave, which became known as one of the four major archeological discoveries of modern China. The discovery of these numerous texts, artworks, and silk paintings in Dunhuang shook academic circles across China and around the world.

With this discovery came the invention of Tunhuangology, a discipline based around the academic research of Dunhuang artifacts. Tunhuangology covers the fields of art, history, archeology, literature, language, socioeconomics, religion, and literature, among others. In 1930, researcher Chen Yinke proposed this new discipline in the wake of the discovery of the Sutra Cave, stating that "Tunhuangology is a major trend in today's academic world" [1]. Since then, Tunhuangology has been included as an independent discipline in the field of scientific research.

Topics discussed by academic Tunhuangology experts and scholars include the time and origin of the characters in Dunhuang's Sutra Cave and the reason behind their actions and appearance. The age of the murals on the outer wall of the doorway of the Sutra Cave--the year and period in which the north and south walls at the entrance of Cave 16 of the Mogao Grottoes were repainted—serve as one of the most crucial bases for analyzing the period in which the Sutra Cave was sealed. The murals of Cave 16 were

previously assessed as being Song Dynasty paintings [2]. In 1964, a survey group organized by the Dunhuang Institute of Cultural Relics and the Institute of Ethnic Studies of the Chinese Academy of Social Sciences assessed the cave as having been repainted during the Western Xia [3]. Mr. Ma Shichang believes that the repainted murals in Cave 16 should be assessed as having been painted during the Kingdom of Guiyi in the reign of the Cao family—before Western Xia’s occupation of Gua and Sha, during the Xianping Era of Emperor Zhengzong of Song at the earliest (997-1003), during the reign of Cao Zongshou or his son Cao Xianshun” [4]. The discovery of the Sutra Cave attracted the attention of many foreign scholars, and during these early decades, the majority of the Dunhuang artifacts were lost overseas. After the discovery of the Sutra Cave in Dunhuang, expeditions from all over the world flocked to acquire a total of tens of thousands of ancient manuscripts, silk paintings, embroidery, and other artworks preserved in the Sutra Cave and send them abroad, also acquiring murals, clay sculptures, and wood carvings in some of the other local caves, resulting in a significant loss of Dunhuang’s cultural relics as they were shipped overseas. The entire field of Tunhuangology has been based on the discovery of the Sutra Cave and the texts and murals unearthed in Dunhuang’s Mogao Grottoes over a century ago.

### **Discovery of the Sutra Cave in Dunhuang Mogao Grottoes and the Loss of its Relics**

On February 11<sup>th</sup> and 12<sup>th</sup> of 1908, French Sinologist Paul Pelliot’s assistant Charles Nouette was investigating the Yulin Grottoes. On February 14<sup>th</sup> that same year, Paul Pelliot arrived in Dunhuang and came to the Mogao Grottoes on February 15. Paul Pelliot numbered the existing caves of the Mogao Grottoes, took photos, made a detailed record and numbering of the Mogao Grottoes, copying the inscriptions on the murals [5]. He spent three weeks sketching nearly 20,000 volumes of ancient manuscripts in Grotto 17. He shipped a total of more than 5,000 pieces to France, along with a large number of wooden carvings, painted sculptures, and other artifacts [6]. In order to investigate the inscriptions of donors on the cave’s ground floor murals, Paul Pelliot even removed the murals of Cave 55 [7] and shipped them to France. In 1914, Aurel Stein came to Dunhuang and bought 570 volumes of scriptures [8]. In the same year, Sergei Oldenburg came to Dunhuang from the Russian Empire, discovering and purchasing more than 12,000 volumes of manuscripts and more than 100 silk paintings, as well as taking more than ten murals from the Mogao Grottoes, including those of Cave 263, along with dozens of painted sculptures [9].

In 1924, the American Langdon Warner came to the Mogao Grottoes to take away 26 murals, damaging dozens of them during the failure to remove them. In 1925, Warner came to Mogao Caves again, spending several days taking photos of the Western Thousand Buddha Caves and Anxi Yulin Caves, numbering the caves, and recording the inscriptions on them. In *Warning Horace Jayne and His Masters*, Mr. Chang Shuhong said [10]: According to incomplete statistics, in 1924, Warner used adhesive tape to remove and damage murals created in the early and mid Tang Dynasty. The damaged murals included No. 320, 321, 323, 329, 331, 335, and 372, with a total of 26 as recorded by the Dunhuang Cultural Relic Research Institute. Among the damaged paintings from the early Tang Dynasty, there were several murals of national historic value related to the history of Buddhism in China, including a painting of envoy Zhang Qian’s Welcoming the Golden Buddha of the Western Regions sent by Emperor Wu of Han”.

## Loss of the Mogao Grotto Relics

### *Langdon Warner's Robbery of the Dunhuang Relics*

In 1980, in Peter Hopkirk's book *Foreign Devils on the Silk Road: The Search for the Lost Treasures of Central Asia* was published by John Murray Publishing House of London, [11], in which Hopkirk stated that "Warner told his family not to mention the murals to the [expedition's] sponsors, because he wasn't sure whether the laboratory could break the tape from the fragile picture (the result was that they rescued 11 murals out of 12)". This assessment approximates the results of Mr. Wang Yiqing's investigation [12]. According to Wang Yiqing's *Mrozowski. Dunhuang, and Central Asian Art Collections in the United States*, in November 1920, the artifacts retrieved by Sergei F. Oldenburg during his 1914-1915 Dunhuang expedition are now held in the East Asia Department of the Hermitage Museum in St. Petersburg, Russia. There are numerous types of artistic materials among these collections, including mural fragments, statues, and paintings, as well as detailed records of the grotto investigation and photos that have not yet been published. Of particular importance are the six types of the Nine-piece Mogao grotto fragments, along with several fragments of murals that have been separated from their other pieces. Not many artifacts are on display here, but these paintings are in very good condition, and include cultural relics created during the periods of the Northern Wei, Sui, Early Tang, Mid-Tang, and the Five Dynasties. Some of these items have been exhibited twice in Japan, but the entire situation has yet to be fully published [13].

The painting "Pulling the Ship", which was damaged by Langdon Warner in 1924, was recently reproduced with the assistance of related Japanese institutions. The painting was originally located on the south wall of Cave 323. The subject of the painting was a medium-sized sailless cargo barge. The painting includes about 20 characters, including the Buddha [14], showing a diverse selection of clothing. Akiyama Mitsuwa said that, since the publication of Paul Pelliot's *Les Grottes de Touen-houang 6* [15], most of the research on the Dunhuang Grotto murals has been based on these prints and photos. Of course, fundamental progress in the study of these murals is subject to on-site visits to Dunhuang. However, for researchers outside China, the Dunhuang Grottoes offer a distant yet attractive reserve of attractive Buddhist relics. In this case, the optimal solution is to make effective use of available visible information to reproduce the murals as correctly and as detailed as possible. It is also the opinion of the author that more investigations should be conducted from an art history perspective. In view of this idea, Mr. Akiyama Mitsuwa introduced new materials on Dunhuang mural research that he had seen in recent years, and made the Dunhuang murals collected by the Hermitage Museum available for public consumption. The exact location of the fragments and the methods for maintaining the brightness of their colors were also explained.

## Akiyama Mitsuwa's Investigation Chart

No.	No. of Cave	Mural/Wall Surface	Time of Creation	Original Content	Location of Fragment	Content of the Fragment	cm Size of Fragment (cm)	Original Method of Removal	Notes
10	263	South wall	Northern Wei Dynasty	Defeating Demons and Transforming to the Thousand Buddhas	Sixth figure from the lower eastern portion	Donor	28×21	Cut down	Incomplete, cutting markings left about 3 cm around all four sides
11	263	Northern side of east wall	Northern Wei Dynasty	Donor: Thousand Buddhas	First body from the northern lower part	Donor	27×21	Cut down	Damaged; restored
12	263	Northern side of east wall	Northern Wei Dynasty	Donor: Thousand Buddhas	First body of the Thousand Buddhas from the northern lower part	Thousand Buddhas	23×16	Cut down	Incomplete, cutting markings around all four sides
14	263	North wall	Northern Wei Dynasty	The Revelation at Sarnath	Right part of the Parinama	Flying Apsaras and various bodhisattvas	185×43	Cut down	Damaged, restored, stolen by Oldenburg, now on collection in the Hermitage Museum
15	263	North wall	Northern Wei Dynasty	The Revelation at Sarnath	The fourth body from the lower eastern part	Donor	12	Cut down	Incomplete, not restored. The dotted line represents the remaining part, and there is a zigzag cut underneath it.

In addition, Mr. Liu Yongzeng of Dunhuang Research Academy has created statistics on the Dunhuang cultural relics that have been lost overseas [17], listing and recording detailed information about the stolen statues and murals of Dunhuang's Mogao Grottoes.

## Liu Yongzeng's List Stolen Mogao Grotto Murals

No.	No. of Cave	Location	Time of Creation	Content	Size of Fragment (cm)	Original Method of Removal	Notes
9	263	Lower part of south wall	Five Dynasties	Male donor	56×50	Cut down	Damaged, unrestored. Clear cuts are still visible, and the lower part of the donor's robe lies at the bottom. The painting was taken by Oldenburg and is now in the collection of Russia's Hermitage Art Museum. (Plate 22)
10	263	Sixth body from the lower eastern part of the south wall	Northern Wei Dynasty	Thousand Buddhas and donor	28×21	Cut down	Incomplete, cutting markings about 3 cm around all four sides (Plate 23)
11	263	First body from the lower eastern side of the north wall	Northern Wei Dynasty	Thousand Buddhas and donor	27×21	Cut down	Damaged, restored.
13	263	First body from the lower eastern side of the east wall	Northern Wei Dynasty	Thousand Buddhas and donor	23×16	Cut down	Incomplete, marks from cutting implements on all four sides.
14	263	Lower part of the north wall	Northern Wei Dynasty	Male donor	76×63	Cut down	Damaged, non-restored.
15	263	Right of the Parinama on the north wall	Northern Wei Dynasty	The Revelation at Sarnath, Flying Apsaras, and various bodhisattvas	185×43	Cut down	Damaged, restored.

*Russian Collection of Dunhuang Art*, including 1925 plates No. 10, 11, 13-16, and 39-52, all taken by Oldenburg, are now being kept in Russia's State Hermitage Museum [18]. Of the Hermitage Museum's Dunhuang mural fragments, the most colorful are those of the Northern Wei Caves. One of the fragments is a long strip, 185 cm high and 43 cm wide (at the bottom). On the right side of the strip is a row of Thousand Buddha statues. On the left side there are overlapping Flying Apsaras and bodhisattvas, which serve as a tribute to the Buddha. A row of small monk-like donors are painted side by side in the lower part of the painting (this fragment was exhibited in the "Northeast Black Sea Nomads and Silk Road Art Exhibition", catalog 108).

### Investigation Chart

No.	No. of Cave	Mural/Wall Surface	Time of Creation	Original Content	Location of Fragment	Content of Fragment	cm Size of Fragment	Original Method of Removal	Notes
10	263	South wall	Northern Wei Dynasty	Defeating Demons and Transforming to the Thousand Buddhas	Sixth figure from the lower eastern portion	Donor	28×21	Cut down	Incomplete, cutting markings left about 3 cm around all four sides
11	263	Northern side of east wall	Northern Wei Dynasty	Donor: Thousand Buddhas	First body from the lower northern part	Donor	27×21	Cut down	Damaged, restored
12	263	Northern side of east wall	Northern Wei Dynasty	Donor: Thousand Buddhas	The First body of the Thousand Buddhas from the lower northern part	Thousand Buddhas	23×16	Cut down	Incomplete, cutting markings left on all four sides
14	263	North Wall	Northern Wei Dynasty	The Revelation at Sarnath	Right of the Parinama	Flying Apsaras and various bodhisattvas	185×43	Cut down	Damaged, restored, originally taken by Oldenburg and currently in the collection of the Russian Hermitage Art Museum
15	263	North wall	Northern Wei Dynasty	The Revelation at Sarnath	Fourth body from the lower eastern part	Donor	12	Cut down	Incomplete, not restored. The dotted line represents the remaining part, and there is a zigzag cut underneath it.

In 1996, Mr. Wang Kexiao published the *Overview of the Dunhuang Cultural Relic Collection in the Russian State Hermitage Museum*, which provided an overview of the Dunhuang Cultural Relics Collection in Russia's State Hermitage Museum. This collection includes artifacts No. ДХ—86 and No. ДХ-187: the Music of the Heavenly Palace, collected from Pelliot's Cave 117 and Dunhuang Research

Academy's Cave 263. The restored painting is 104 × 64 cm in size. They include images of a music performer (first figure) and a dance performer (second figure). The arch on the left is white, and a flying dance performer is painted on the black ground below the arch, with a gray round light, a swinging crown, and light blue clothing. The middle arch is dark brown, and the ground under the arch is reddish brown. This section also contains a painting of a 'JiLetian', an angelic music-playing courtesan with a round white halo, wrapped in a long brown skirt and covered with a large brown scarf. The arch on the right is also white, and a flying dance performer is also painted on the black ground, with light blue round light, covered with a black scarf and wrapped in a gray dress with brown wrinkles. These three figures are all outlined in yellow. Contours of round lights, scarfs, and long skirts are again depicted with thin white lines. This painting was created during the Northern Wei Dynasty. The largest mural in the collection, No. DX-16aBc, also comes from the Northern Wei Dynasty, and from the same cave as the previously described painting [19].

No.	Name	Type	Size	Time of Creation	Notes
193	Flying Apsaras	Mural	40×10	Sui Dynasty	Damaged, Cave 124a as numbered by Pelliot
194	Donor	Mural	62.5×26.5	Northern Wei Dynasty	Damaged, marked with text. Cave 117 as numbered by Pelliot; Cave 263 as numbered by the Dunhuang Research Academy
195	Donor	Mural	72.5×24.5	Northern Wei Dynasty	Damaged, Cave 117 as numbered by Pelliot, Cave 263 as numbered by the Dunhuang Research Academy
196abc	Marginal section of a painting	Mural	197×69.5	Northern Wei Dynasty	Damaged; Cave 117 as numbered by Pelliot, Cave 263 as numbered by the Dunhuang Research Academy
323	Head of the Buddha	Sculpture	Height: 21.5	Northern Wei Dynasty (?)	
324	Head of the Buddha	Sculpture	Height: 23.5	Northern Wei Dynasty	Cave 123a as numbered by Pelliot, Cave 437 as numbered by the Dunhuang Research Academy
361	Thousand Buddhas (?)	Sculpture	24×13	Northern Wei Dynasty	Damaged

Japanese publisher Kodansha has produced a total of 3 volumes of *The Art of Central Asia* [20], which contain all of the artworks collected by the British Museum that Aurel Stein took from Dunhuang. A number of other artworks have still been lost in other regions. There are also some artworks that have not been covered in this article which nevertheless contain important information related to research on clothing in Dunhuang artwork.

### Artworks Unearthed from the Sutra Cave of Dunhuang's Mogao Grottoes

The two-dimensional artworks unearthed from the Sutra Cave are classified into silk paintings, linen paintings, paper paintings, and prints. The major discovery of artworks within the Sutra Cave attracted the

attention of several western explorers and scholars, who made personal visits to the Dunhuang Grottoes to investigate and record the Dunhuang findings using modern archeological methods. These expeditions released numerous photos and materials related to the Dunhuang Grottoes. It was the discovery of the Sutra Cave that brought the Mogao Grottoes to the attention of the modern world.

***Aurel Stein's Theft of Sutra Cave Artwork:*** The first modern non-Chinese to visit the Mogao Grottoes was Aurel Stein, a Hungarian-born British archaeologist. When he visited the Mogao Grottoes in Dunhuang in 1907, he obtained scrolls and silk paintings from the Taoist priest Wang Yuanlu. Stein's *The Thousand Buddhas: ancient Buddhist painting from the cave-temples of Tunghuang on the western frontier of China*, published in 1921, releases photos of murals and silk paintings from the Mogao Grottoes. After the discovery of Cave 17 of the Dunhuang Grottoes, Stein visited Dunhuang in 1906 and 1907 and collected a considerable amount of data related to the find. The artifacts Stein acquired are now held in the British Museum in London, the Victoria-Albert Museum, and the National Museum of India. In 1908, Paul Pelliot obtained another large volume of the cultural relics from the Sutra Cave, taking away a large number of silk paintings [21], a large number of manuscripts, and other relics. It is worth emphasizing that the silk fabric fragments and silk paintings taken away by these explorers are of great value [22].

The majority of the significant works unearthed from the Mogao Grottoes are paintings, silk paintings, line drawings, and engravings. The unearthed paintings of the Sutra Cave consist of two categories: one consists of stand-alone "silk paintings", and while the other paintings are scattered within the unearthed texts. Stein took over 520 silk paintings, which are now in the collection of the British Museum in London, the National Museum of India, the Guimet Museum in Paris, and the Oriental Writing Department of the National Library.

#### ***Oldenburg's Theft of Sutra Cave Artworks***

Sergei Oldenburg of Russia also acquired a great deal of Dunhuang artifacts, and his collections are now held in the Hermitage Museum and the Oriental Institute of the Russian Academy of Sciences in Saint Petersburg.

The following section outlines the majority of the Sutra Cave paintings. Most are scattered insertions within the Dunhuang texts and scrolls. According to the *Tunhuangology Dictionary*, Pelliot took more than 140 texts, and Stein took more than 70. Over ten texts are still held in the Beijing Library, making for a total of more than two hundred and forty texts. The number of texts taken by Lev Nikolaevich Menshikov is unclear. In addition, there are more than 1,100 Sutra Cave paintings scattered across Japan, the United States, and elsewhere in the world. Each painting differs in size. They date from the seventh to the tenth centuries, most being produced in the mid-Tang Dynasty or later. The paintings taken by Stein and Pelliot possess chronological inscriptions, the earliest of which is labeled "the seventeenth year of Kaiyuan (729 AD)" on the statue of a monk, and the latest one is P.116, titled "the eighth year of Pingping Xingguo (983 AD)". The Dunhuang relics that have been currently made available for public review have mainly published in the three volumes of *The Art of Central Asia* produced by the Japanese publisher Kodansha. *The Art of Central Asia* has published all of the artworks collected by the British Museum that Stein took from Dunhuang. In the third volume, the paintings of donors and ladies unearthed from the Dunhuang Sutra Cave reflect the sartorial culture and clothing of the time. Most of these silk paintings have been well preserved, but some of them have been damaged. The paintings scattered in the texts are basically all paper drawings. Sorting these paintings by category, one finds color drawings, line drawings, engravings, and sketches. In 1914, Stein came to Dunhuang again and removed another 570 scrolls [23]. In the same year, Oldenburg came to Dunhuang again, discovering and purchasing more than 12,000 volumes of texts along with more than 100 silk paintings [24]. In 2007, the book *The Complete Works of Dunhuang Silk Art (British Collection)* was published by Shanghai Ancient Books Publishing House and edited by Zhao Feng. The work included 124 artworks including Buddhist flags, scrolls, handkerchiefs, colorful fabrics, monochrome fabrics, prints, and embroidery, mainly

coming from the Tang and the Five Dynasties. The third volume includes a general list of Dunhuang textiles held in the British Museum, a general list of Dunhuang textiles held in the V&A Museum, and a general list of Dunhuang textiles held in the British National Library [25]. The contents of the Dunhuang paintings are basically identical to the Dunhuang murals. Both mainly include Buddhist paintings, but also some Nestorian and secular paintings. They include portraits of temple donors, statues, illustrations, and expressions of Parinama, Buddhist revelation and transformation.

The portraiture of the donors in the drawings are not exactly the same as those of the wall murals, and some of these contents have not been fully preserved to the present day. Some artistic methods and contents are similar to those of the murals, and some are quite different. Due to these artworks having been sealed in the Sutra Cave for hundreds of years, the colors and lines of many of the artworks have been well-preserved, and some colors have been kept in like-new quality, a rare quality of preservation in wall murals.

The relics in the Sutra Cave exist as supplementary materials to the wall murals, and enrich their content. In terms of format, most of the paintings are stand-alone, some of which were drawn outside of the Dunhuang region. The relics of the Sutra Cave and the murals in Dunhuang are able to confirm and complement each other's contents. Dunhuang is primarily known for its murals, but the Sutra Cave paintings are also a highly important part of Dunhuang art. Dunhuang's murals and the Sutra Cave paintings together form the whole figure of Dunhuang painting [26].

### ***Ancient Clothing in the Dunhuang Sutra Cave's Silk & Linen Paintings***

Dunhuang's silk paintings and linen paintings are basically all colored, with only a few being line drawings. Most of the engravings were done in ink. In terms of form, there are single paintings, sets, groups, series, and sketches.

The State Hermitage Museum is Russia's largest national museum of art and history, and one of the largest museums in the world. The Hermitage Museum's collection of Dunhuang relics include murals, sculptures, silk paintings, paper paintings, linen paintings, and fragments of silk fabrics. The silk paintings are mostly fragments, the largest of which is a work from the late Tang Dynasty. It depicts a group of three male donor figures, standing and sitting, all wearing robes of different colors, and the last two wearing scarves long enough to touch their feet. The fragment also includes paintings of bodhisattva and Parinama.

The linen paintings are mostly complete, such as a portrait of the Goddess of Mercy, 146 x 64 .5cm, at the bottom, with three male donors in the lower left corner. In the middle is a votive text: "South No □□□□□ Bodhisattva / may the deceased parents inhabit the pure land of God's life / expression of wishes great and small." In No. ⅡX57 is a portrait of a Buddha sitting on a lotus platform, and three donors on the bottom left are kneeling on a small blanket, wearing robes which open on the side. The first two donors wear scarves long enough to touch their feet, and the third donor wears a hooded hat. The first holds an incense burner in both hands, the second holds a lotus, and the third prays with both hands. The first inscription says "The main Taoist disciple Changman devotes himself to the Buddha." The Third inscription is, "□ □ Zhuokou devotes himself to the Buddha." The second inscription is, "Male disciples (?) □..." A woman kneels on his right side, wearing a bone comb on her head with a floral 'dian' makeup pattern on her forehead, seeming to step into a dance. She wears a black *ruqun* and a *peibo* scarf. A girl behind her wears a long red coat, carrying red ornaments on her shoulders and holding red fruits in her hands. The inscription on the third figure reads, "The new daughter-in-law Suo devotes herself to the Buddha." This is a group portrait of a family of donors, and was created during the Five Dynasties [27].

Volume 1 of *Russian Collection of Dunhuang Art* published by the Shanghai Ancient Books Publishing House [28] includes a number of linen paintings. These paintings include several examples of men's and women's clothing. For example, Figure 45: *The Outline of Buddha* is a silk painting from the mid-Tang Dynasty (8<sup>th</sup> Century). It is a portrait of a female donor wearing her hair in a high bun. She is wearing a



short coat with large sleeves and a high-waisted skirt; she seems broad and plump. In Figure 46, the male donor wears a soft scarf long enough to touch his feet, as well as a round-necked robe, a leather belt around his waist and a bow-knot, and has his hands folded. Figure 47: *The Outline of Buddha* is a silk painting from the Five Dynasties 14.2 cm high and 17.5 cm wide. Figure 48.: *Parinama of Infinity* is a silk painting created during the late Tang Dynasty, and contains portraits of a number of different people. Figure 48.8 contains two figures from the Tibetan Empire, a male donor wearing a round hat and a large open-lapel robe. Behind him is a maid, with a frontlet on her head, wearing a double-lapel robe and a waist tie. Figure 84 is a silk painting created in the late Tang Dynasty showing monk and lay donors. There are two noblewomen on the left, wearing high-headed hairpins, collared coats, and wide-sleeved skirts, and their clothing seem very luxurious. The third, fourth, and fifth figures are monk donors wearing cassocks with large sleeves, and two male donors behind them are wearing scarves long enough to touch their feet. Figure 85 is a Five Dynasties-era silk painting of a donor, and is 13 cm high and 46 cm wide. Figure 85.1 consists of two even rows of donor figures. Each of the paintings has three male and female donors with high hair-buns, wearing high-collar and high-waisted coats on the inside and black wide-sleeved coats on the outside, with long skirts below. The three male donors wear black scarves long enough to touch their feet, round-necked robes, and red leather belts around their waist. Similar male and female donors can be seen in linen paintings created in the Five Dynasties (956 AD), such as Figure 98, which has 3 male donors, and Figure 98, which has 4 female donors. See also the Portrait of the Goddess of Mercy created during the Song Dynasty, a linen painting that is 116 cm high and 54 cm wide, as well as Figures 99 and 2, which exhibits male and female donors and their clothing.

Volume 2 of *Dunhuang Art in Russian Collections* [29] also includes many silk paintings, including Cave 117BIS as numbered by Pelliot (Cave 263 as numbered by the Dunhuang Research Academy), dated to the Northern Wei Dynasty. The mural is high, and 69.5cm wide. In ⅧX 196, there are three monk donors on the left. The first and second figures from the left are revealing their right arms, and the third is wearing a collar and white sleeve on his right shoulder. There is also a mural of a male donor from the Five Dynasties in Cave 117BIS as numbered by Pelliot (Cave 263 as numbered by the Dunhuang Research Academy). The mural is 72.5cm high and 25cm wide: ⅧX 195. Figure 44 is 62.5 cm high and 26.5 cm wide, ⅧX 194. Figure 45 contains two male donors wearing scarves, black round-neck robes, red waist belts, and shoes. The second figure's outfit is the same as the first one. In *The Outline of Buddha*, a silk painting from the Mid-Tang Dynasty (8<sup>th</sup> Century), ⅧX224.15P.223, a woman in the painting wears a half-turned hairstyle. See Figure45.15, *The Outline of Buddha*, Mid-Tang Dynasty (8<sup>th</sup> Century), The male donor wears heavy shoes. In Figures 46 and 48, the female donor wears a headscarf, a narrow-lapeled robe with central cuffs, a pair of shoes, and a decorative container in her hand. One late Tang Dynasty silk painting is 38.5 cm high and 60 cm wide containing male and female donors. Figure 84 monk donor wearing a partial shirt. A male donor wears a scarf and the female donor wears a flower crown. She wears a wide-sleeved gown and cape on the outside, and a short-sleeve coat with large sleeves, a wide belt, and a long skirt on the inside. Figure 85 includes a male donor wearing a scarf and a round-neck gown. The book also contains a large number of portraits of laypersons and monks, etc., expressing the characteristic styles of Buddhist clothing.

The three volumes *The Art of Central Asia* contain a large number of linen paintings unearthed from the Sutra Cave. In addition to paintings of male and female donors and monks, there are also a large number of Buddhist paintings, showing the evolution of different styles of Buddhist clothing.

The clothing shown in the portraits unearthed from the above-mentioned Sutra Cave are similar to clothing shown on the donors in the Dunhuang murals. By verifying these clothing styles against histories from this period and clothing present in Dunhuang during this period, although Dunhuang was on the periphery of ancient China, the clothing there were consistent with that of the Central Plains. This is precisely the sort of question we wish to explore when studying clothing.

---

### *Ancient Clothing in the Unearthed Engravings from the Dunhuang Sutra Cave*

More than thirty types of texts have been unearthed from the Dunhuang Sutra Cave, most of which were produced between the 9th and 10th centuries, most of which originated locally, and a few of which were imported from other places. A total of about two hundred Dunhuang woodcarvings are currently in the collection of the National Library of Beijing, the British Museum in London, the Guimet Museum in Paris, France, and the State Hermitage Museum in St. Petersburg, Russia.

These engravings have been studied to varying degrees by scholars across China and around the world [30]. Most of these engravings were produced during the reign of Cao Yuanzhong. This period was the heyday of the Guiyi Circuit and its Cao Family regime, when the local society was stable, the economy was prosperous, the local culture was highly developed, and the Guiyi Circuit de-facto kingdom was in harmony with the surrounding ethnic nations. These factors made the local engravings highly popular. Most of the Dunhuang engravings are related to Buddhism, whether they are portraits or statues of the Buddha or illustrations of Bodhisattvas. The most common theme in the engravings are portraits of the Thousand Buddhas. These Thousand Buddhas were carved from a small wooden board and pressed onto the paper one by one. In the engravings, the Buddha and Bodhisattvas are clad in different Buddhist clothing: The Buddha wears a cassock, which has three main forms: a right-arm-revealed style, a through-the-shoulder style and a double-collar drooping style. The disciples wear green robes with gold brocades and red-striped cassocks. The Bodhisattva wears a three-faced crown and a flower-vine crown, a divine robe, and a skirt.

Changes in Buddhist clothing can be seen from the statues of the Buddha and the portraits of Bodhisattvas and monk donors in the Dunhuang engravings. The clothing of the Buddha and monks changed with the expansion of Buddhism into the Central Plains. These later figures not only wore the cassocks stipulated in Buddhist law, but also secular clothes, showing the sinicization and secularization of Buddhist clothing. The styles of monk's clothing during the Han Dynasty can be roughly divided into two types: one is a cassock, worn by monks during Buddhist activities and rituals; the other are the plain clothes worn by monks during daily actions. It can be seen that the clothing of Buddhist monks also changed to adapt to regional ethnic groups, forming separate sub-cultures of Buddhist clothing.

In addition, there are many statues and inscriptions of owners and donors from each dynasty in each cave. Statues and inscriptions of craftsmen who create the caves were rarely made. After the late Tang Dynasty, some statues of craftsmen appear in the caves, but only as the cave owner or donor, not the craftsmen who built the cave along with the cave owners or donors. There are markedly no craftsmen or records related to the same found in the official caves. In contemporary Dunhuang engravings, the donor and the craftsman appear side by side, including the highest local military officers and artisans under the jurisdiction of the government. Through the Dunhuang engravings, we can explore a series of historically significant social issues such as social changes shown by new relationships between donor and craftsman. Further, the clothing of the figures shown in the engravings reflect certain aspects of social customs at the time. These engravings can be combined with the Dunhuang murals to study the sociological and sartorial characteristics of the local people at the time. In a certain sense, Dunhuang engravings are the focus of a 5,000-year-old Buddhist grotto art form, as well as an inevitable result of the development of Dunhuang art [31].

It can be said that Dunhuang engravings provide references for Dunhuang murals. However, during the development of the Dunhuang engravings, they passed through the late Tang Dynasty, the Five Dynasties and Ten Kingdoms, and the Song Dynasty, gradually becoming increasingly secular and popularized, forming its unique style. Chinese engraving can also be said to be closely related to Chinese culture and art, as well as secular life. The statue stones and bricks come from the Han Dynasty, the stone carvings and line drawing from the Northern and Southern to the Sui and Tang Dynasties, all exhibit multi-faceted influences on the production and development of Dunhuang engravings [32]. Although Dunhuang

engravings served to promote Buddhism, the figures, clothing, and decorations in the engravings are mostly shown in Chinese styles, and are expressed in the Central-Plains style. This shows that Buddhist engravings were completely sinicized from the beginning, because this expedited their spread and distribution. Dunhuang engravings reflect a special form of expression of Chinese Buddhism in the Dunhuang area, which had an important influence on the development of Buddhist clothing in future generations.

In short, the clothing of Buddhist figures in Dunhuang engravings and the statues of Buddhists and monks in Dunhuang Grottoes are in the same vein the development of Dunhuang Buddhist art, and are an inevitable product of the development of Dunhuang Buddhist clothing culture. Compared with grottoes and silk paintings, the style of the engravings are more secular and popularized.

### *Clothing in Manuscripts Unearthed from the Dunhuang Sutra Cave*

“Dunhuang manuscripts” are texts based on Dunhuang’s murals, silk paintings, linen paintings, and paper paintings. When referring to the cave line drawings of Dunhuang, these manuscripts also includes the line drawings in the cave wall murals. All were completed almost exclusively by the drawing of white lines. These works also serve as a good reference for studying paintings in the Dunhuang murals. Works referred to as “samples” refer to smaller samples of the original painting, both circulated copies of the original version and its modifications—although the “original version” is may be promoted using the “sample”, the painter may not have followed the “sample” while painting, often adding some personal tastes and preferences while painting the sample [33].

By examining fine art from Dunhuang such as silk paintings, linen paintings, paper paintings, and engravings currently available from the British Museum, the National Museum of India, the India Office Records in London, the Guimet Museum in Paris, the State Hermitage Museum of Russia, and other museums around the world, we can find a number of materials related to the Dunhuang manuscripts. Although this type of manuscript and the cave line drawing manuscripts are similar, they are still distinct. They are similar in that they are both master examples of “line drawing” artwork. They were generally all painted via copying. A large number of Sutra Cave paintings are concerned with either exactly the same or roughly the same topics, which explains the widespread use of drafts and copying between multiple works. The cave murals show traces of drafting processes. For example, Cave 7 of Western Thousand Buddha Caves, Sui Dynasty Caves 276 and 103, Cave 201 and 26 which began in the early Tang Dynasty and were repainted in the mid-Tang Dynasty; Tang Dynasty Caves 79 and 386; and Late-Tang-era Cave 9. Some of these include line drawings with clearly drawn clothing. Mr. Sha Wutian categorized the drafts: the original draft of Parinama drawings, drafts of illustrations, drafts of stories, reference drafts of roof painting designs, drafts of statues, drafts of portraits, and drafts of Vajrayana drawings [34]. There are a large number of portraits in these drafts, and many of the subjects of these portraits are wearing different clothing and reflecting different statuses, providing us with rich materials for researching clothing. By discussing the characteristics of these figures’ clothing during different eras, such as changes in scarves, clothing styles, and accessories, references are provided for determining the exact age of the creation of the various drafts, manuscripts, and artworks.

## **CONCLUSION**

Dunhuang’s silk paintings, linen paintings, and paper paintings are closely related to their drafts and manuscripts. Based on discussions on the production and circulation of “samples” and “master copies”, it becomes clear that the appearance and development of the Dunhuang paintings often requires the creation of original drafts and master copies, and the circulation of the original versions depends on the creation of “samples”. During the process of copying and sample creation, the drawings were constantly modified due to personal preferences and tastes of the painters as well as the painters’ historical environments and cultural backgrounds. From the original versions to the statues, to the creation of samples and portraits, painters and craftsmen played the most dominant role in this production cycle. Because of the large

number of subjective factors affecting the painters and craftsmen, these paintings were often not restricted by theme, showing a great deal of creativity. Especially in Buddhist images in Chinese paintings, the problem of qualitative variance is particularly obvious, since when we look at Indian Buddhist images in China's western regions, we can see the painters and the craftsmen played a less significant role in terms of determining content. This is just one more very interesting aspect of our research results [35].

### Acknowledgements

This paper is one of the phased results of the "Arrangement and Research of Academic History Data of Tunhuangology" (17ZDA213) a major project of the National Social Science Fund; and one of the research results of the China Dunhuang Grottoes Conservation Research Foundation's "Unearthed Texts of the Dunhuang Sutra Cave and Literature Research Catalog Database" project.

### References:

- [1] Bai, Bing. (1985). On the Closed Years of the Dunhuang Sutra Caves. In: *Cave and Art: The Collected Works of the National Dunhuang Academic Symposium in 1983*. Gansu: Gansu People's Publishing House.
- [2] Liangfu, Jiang. (1999). *The Great Cultural Treasure of Dunhuang*. Yunnan People's Publishing House.
- [3] Yuquan, Liu. (1982). The Xixia Caves in Anxi Yulin Grottoes of Mogao Grottoes in Dunhuang. *Anthology of Dunhuang Studies*. Gansu People's Publishing House.
- [4] Dunhuang Institute of Cultural Relics. (1982). *Contents of Dunhuang Mogao Grottoes*. Cultural Relics Publishing House.
- [4] Shichang, Ma. (1978). Several Questions on Dunhuang Sutra Caves, *Relics*. 12.
- [5] Translation: Paul, Pelliot, Sheng, Geng and Jianbin, Tan. (1993). *Notes of Paul Pelliot on Dunhuang Grottoes*, Gansu People's Publishing House.  
98、122、127、168、172、177、190、217, 1996年。
- [6] Exhibition Catalogue. (1996). Silk Road—Big Art Exhibition. No.67, 96, 98, 122, 127, 168, 172, 177, 190, 217. Tokyo Museum of Japan, Tokyo Renaissance Promotion Committee.
- [7] Translation: Paul, Pelliot, Sheng, Geng and Jianbin, Tan. (1993). *Notes of Paul Pelliot on Dunhuang Grottoes*, Gansu People's Publishing House. pp 211-219.
- [8] *Russian Collections of Dunhuang Art: I and II*. (1998). Hermitage Museum of Russia, Shanghai Ancient Books Publishing House. Shanghai Ancient Books Publishing House.
- [9] Kengo, Higashiyama. (1996). Three Great Caves in Dunhuang 290. *Selected Works of Japan Kodansha* 74.
- [10] Shuhong, Chang. (1955). Warning Horace Jenny and His Masters. *Relics Reference*. 8.
- [11] Peter, Hopkirk. (1980). *Foreign Devils on the Silk Road: The Search for the Lost Cities and Treasures of Chinese Central Asia*. London: John Murray Publishing House. p. 221.
- [12] Yiqing, Wang. (1990). Dunhuang and Central Asian Art Collections in the United States. *Journal of Dunhuang Studies*. No. 1.
- [13] Yiqing, Wang. (1990). Dunhuang and Central Asian Art Collections in the United States. *Journal of Dunhuang Studies*. No. 1.
- [14] De, Ma. (1995). On the Historical Materials of Dunhuang Mural Vehicles (Part 2). *Dunhuang Studies*. Issue 3.
- [15] Paul, Pelliot. (1920). *Les Grottes de Touen-houang*. 6 vols. 24
- [16] Mitsuwa, Akiyama. (1981). Translation: Yongzeng, Liu. New Materials on Dunhuang Mural Research—Discussion on Luo Jimel's Photos and Remains of Murals in Fogg Museum and Hermitage Museum. *Dunhuang Studies*. Issue 1.
- [17] Yongzeng, Liu. (2000). Discovery of Lost Dunhuang Cultural Relics in the Sutra Cave. *Dunhuang Studies*. No. 2.
- [18] Hermitage Museum of Russia. (1997). *Russian Collections of Dunhuang Artworks*. Shanghai Ancient Books Publishing House.

- 
- [19] Kexiao, Wang. (1996). Overview of Dunhuang Cultural Relics Collection in the State Hermitage Museum of Russia. *Dunhuang Studies*. No.4.
- [20] The Art of Central Asia, 3 volumes. (1982). Kodansha. Volume 3, p. 45.
- [21] Exhibition Catalogue. (1996). Silk Road—Big Art Exhibition. No.67, 96, 98, 122, 127, 168, 172, 177, 190, 217. Tokyo Museum of Japan, Tokyo Renaissance Promotion Committee.
- [22] [French] Krishna Ribaud and Fuxue, Yang. (1995). The Importance of Ceremonial and Votive Fabrics from the Dunhuang Grottoes (Summary). *Dunhuang Studies*. Issue 2.
- [23] State Hermitage Museum of Russia, Shanghai Ancient Books Publishing House. (1997). Russian Collections of Dunhuang Art (I, II), Shanghai Ancient Books Publishing House.
- [24] Kengo, Higashiyama. (1996). Three Great Caves of Dunhuang. *Selected Works of Japan Kodansha* 74.
- [25] Edited: Zhao Feng. (2007). Complete Works of Dunhuang Silk Art (British Collection). Shanghai Donghua University Press.
- [26] Edited: Xianlin, Ji. (1998). The Dictionary of Dunhuang Studies. Shanghai Lexicographical Publishing House. p. 231.
- [27] Kexiao, Wang. (1996). Overview of Dunhuang Cultural Relics Collection in the State Hermitage Museum of Russia. *Dunhuang Studies*. No. 4.
- [28] Shanghai Book Collection of Dunhuang Art, Shanghai Ancient Books Publishing House, Shanghai Ancient Books Publishing House, 1997.
- [29] Shanghai Collection of Dunhuang Art, Shanghai Ancient Books Publishing House II Shanghai Ancient Books Publishing House, 1997.
- [30] Huili, Tai. (2005). Narratives of Dunhuang Printmaking. Yihu, Yu. (2005). Dunhuang. The Nature and Use of Dunhuang Prints. Rongjian, Wu. (2005). Several Questions about Dunhuang Prints. Yi, Wang and Xiaoping, Zou. (2005). Artistic Features of Dunhuang Prints. An'ping, Zhou. (2005). The Historical Role of Ancient Chinese Prints from Dunhuang Engraved Buddha Paintings. Shengbao, Xie and Jing, Xie. (2005). The Impact of Dunhuang Engravings on the Engraving and Printing Industry. *Dunhuang Studies*. No. 2.
- [31] De, Ma. (2005). The Background Significance of Dunhuang Prints. *Dunhuang Studies*. No. 2. p. 1.
- [32] Xizhen, Wang. (2005). Research on Dunhuang Prints and Folk Art. *Dunhuang Studies*. No. 2. p. 41.
- [33] Wutian, Sha. (2007). *Research on Dunhuang Manuscripts*. Central Compilation and Translation Press.
- [34] Wutian, Sha. (2007). *Research on Dunhuang Manuscripts*. Central Compilation and Translation Press. pp. 27-28; pp33-34.
- [35] Wutian, Sha. (2007). *Research on Dunhuang Manuscripts*. Central Compilation and Translation Press.