

## **PRIVATE TUTORING OF ENGLISH: MOTIVATIONAL PRACTICES IN THE LIVED EXPERIENCES OF BANGLADESHI HIGHER SECONDARY STUDENTS**

**Dr. Md. Monjurul Islam**

Pundra University of Science & Technology

**Mohammed Samuel Hoque**

Daffodil International University

---

**ABSTRACT:** *This article aims to address one main and three sub- research questions by presenting and analyzing the findings. The article analyzed the lived experiences of eleven Bangladeshi higher secondary school students to provide insight into their thoughts, feelings, beliefs, values and assumptions of private tutoring of English (PT-E). Each participant participated in a one-to -one in-depth semi-structured interview. To justify research questions of the study, 267 significant statements (i.e., significant phrases or sentences that pertained directly to the lived experience of PT-E participants) were identified from 11 verbatim transcripts of interviewees. As of 267 significant statements, four themes are originated from the analysis of the participants' responses to the interview questions.*

**KEY WORDS:** private tutoring of english, shadow education, supplementary tutoring, motivational factors, higher secondary school, bangladesh

---

### **INTRODUCTION**

Private Tutoring (PT) is a global phenomenon (Bray, 2013; Bray & Lykins, 2012; Dang & Rogers, 2008; Mazawi, Sultana, & Bray, 2013; Mori & Baker, 2010). It is common particularly in South and East Asia. In Hong Kong, for example, a survey of 898 secondary school students found that 72.5% students in lower secondary had received private tutoring, while the proportions in middle and senior secondary levels were 81.9% and 85.5%, respectively (Ngai & Cheung, 2010). In Japan, a 2008 survey found that 72.5% middle school students and 60.5% high school students received private tutoring (Kim & Park, 2010). The issue of private tutoring has also been discussed in Africa, Europe, and North America (Bray, 2006; Ireson & Rushforth, 2011; Jheng, 2015).

Private Tutoring in English (PT-E), as a subfield of private tutoring (PT), has recently received attention from researchers (Hamid, Sussex, & Khan, 2009; Yung, 2014). In a recent study in Hong Kong, Bray (2013) shows that the proportion of secondary students (71%) involved in private tutoring in English was much higher than in mathematics (58%) and in Chinese (39%). High rates of student participation in PT-E have also been reported by studies in South and East Asian nations (e.g., Bray & Kwok, 2003; Hamid & Baldauf, 2011). Furthermore, some recent studies have focused on the role of PT-E and students' academic achievement in relation to test scores in English along with the test scores in other subjects (Park, Byun, & Kim, 2011). For example, Kang (2007) shows that there is a significant improvement in grades resulting from expenditure on tutoring among South Korean students, controlling for teacher assessed initial ability, hours of self-study, and family characteristics. Similar findings were reported by studies on PT-E in Hong Kong (Yung, 2014).

Despite the fast growth of PT-E and its potential effect on students' motivational practices, the role of PT-E for motivating students has received relatively little attention in academic research. More clearly, one emerging issue of PT-E literature is the problem of rising numbers among students in developing countries, such as Bangladesh. Therefore, further research is needed to examine how their experiences have been influenced by private tutoring of English (PT-E). The present study provides empirical evidence from higher secondary students who take up PT-E in Bangladesh while receiving mainstream schooling. In order to address the gap mentioned above, this investigation will add to research in the field. While previous research has adopted an economic approach to examining motivational practices arising out of PT-E (Dang & Rogers, 2008), this study uses a phenomenological perspective to focus on the lived experiences of high school students who participate in PT-E (see Research Design for details). This article is guided by one main research question and three sub-questions as below:

1. What are the motivational practices of private tutoring for English language that motivate Bangladeshi students in mainstream schools?
  - (a) What are students' perceptions of the role of PT-E?
  - (b) How PT-E deals with high stake public exam practices and stakeholders' perceptions about public exams?
  - (c) How PT-E addresses deficiencies of English teaching in schools?

In investigating these questions, the influence of PT-E as the alternative for classroom teaching, the role of public examination pressure as well as academic status of learners for taking up PT-E as a remedial of school teaching are examined.

### **Motivational factors and PT-E**

In recent time, exam-oriented language teaching, ineffective and insufficient classroom teaching, public examination pressure and lack of classroom teaching environment motivate students to participate in PT-E. In other words, by showing up the importance of examinations, exam grade and ineffectiveness of classroom teaching, private tutors take the opportunity by highlighting their necessity and marketing their effectiveness to fill up these gaps. For this reason, some experience teachers, i.e., the best teacher in school is the best tuition provider, play the important role to motivate students to involve in PT-E. Specifically, many private tutoring centers are run by the most favorite teacher in schools. They display their potentiality in the classroom and highlight their demand to the students. This situation acts as a powerful motivator to fulfill students' desire to reduce the discrepancy between their actual and ideal selves.

Similarly, sometimes private tutors demonstrate academic result in the promotion pamphlets and ex-students' academic successes through the advertisements. These types of activities play the role to provoke 'executive motives' of tutees assist to promote a good tutor-student relationship. That is, showing up the significant of examinations and grade, private tutors motivate students to oblige their duties and responsibilities to facilitate possible negative outcome.

Finally, with the intention to improve students' academic results in mainstream education and

high-stakes examinations (Yung, 2014), tutors provide the best learning environment compared to the mainstream classroom teaching. To do that, private tutors tell interesting stories and cracking jokes in lesson as well as for providing the best environment, tutors sometimes arrange the small number of students in a group.

English and PT-E in Bangladesh

In Bangladesh, although English has limited use in daily communication, it has a powerful presence in the education system (Hamid, Khan, & Islam, 2017). The resource allocation for education in general, and English teaching in particular, has been one of the lowest in the world (Hamid et al., 2009). Consequently, the quality of English teaching, particularly, in rural schools, is far from adequate. But, proficiency and equality of teaching and learning English is a must for the nation to abolish poverty, hunger, disease, illiteracy and indignity, especially, in rural area. The policy of teaching and learning English is at the root of social equality because the chance of learning English is kept unlocked to all irrespective of social class, religion or geographic locations. However, it is true that not all students have been getting the same quality support and opportunities as the acute shortage of teachers and other resources plague teaching and learning English. As in the past many years, rural students, most of whom are poor, are disadvantaged in this regard. But, they have to take the same national school-leaving examination as students from all over the country. The result is, as can be expected, many of them turn out as failed students.

Apart from these educational and examination issues and controversies, the question of linguistic capacity in a social setting is essential for learning English. Furthermore, the present scenario shows that the PT-E is on the increase throughout the country. There is no prognosis that this scenario is going to change for better soon. Although the Bangladesh context is somewhat different socially and economically from other Asian, European and North American countries, the practice of PT and PT-E is quite the same as in other countries in the world. In fact, where over one-third of the 159.10 million citizens do not have formal literacy (Hamid & Honan, 2012), both PT and PT-E have been dominant in all levels of education in Bangladesh (Hamid et al., 2009).

### **The study Design**

Using a phenomenological research design, the present article attempts a micro level study, i.e. a small scale, in-depth investigation, to ensure a rich description of students' lived experiences of the PT-E phenomenon. The phenomenological approach adds to a previously ignored perspective on the lived experiences of participants in PT-E. Previous research has typically used large scale, macro-level quantitative design. Using purposeful sampling, the researchers selected, for in-depth interviews, 11 *higher secondary school*<sup>1</sup> (see Table 1) students who had been taking private tutoring of English (PT-E) and had at least four to seven years of experiences of PT-E. All participants were given pseudonyms.

The purpose of selecting higher secondary school students was to gain a detailed and clear picture of their experiences of PT-E as these students had 12 years schooling and were going

---

<sup>1</sup> In Bangladesh, school has three levels: primary, secondary and higher level. Generally, higher secondary schools are called 'college'. Usually, college teaches 11<sup>th</sup> and 12<sup>th</sup> grade students.

to enter the university by next academic year. Most importantly, as students in Bangladesh have English lessons from Grade 1 to 12, they have substantial exposure to English teaching in school. So, their involvement in PT-E at the higher secondary level offered insights into their experiences that may contribute to the question of inequality between students. Finally this study needed selective sampling to examine data inductively, recursively and interactively in order to provide a holistic view of PT-E as a phenomenon.

Two different regional areas were identified to cater to the different backgrounds of the participants based on urban (metropolitan city) and rural (sub-district) areas in Bangladesh. The first site of the present study was Rangpur, a regional metropolitan city in the northern Bangladesh; and the second one was Rajarhat, a rural sub-district under Kurigram district, located in the northern region of the country. After selecting the study sites, both government and non-government schools were selected within these two sites. Both types of schools follow the national curriculum and use Bangla as a medium of instruction.

Besides the regional and school variations, the chosen students were identified among students who had been participating in different types of private tutoring of English (PT-E). These types of tutoring had been divided into three kinds: 'one to one private tutoring' which refers to tutoring conducted between one tutor and one tutee; 'small-group private tutoring' referring to tutoring conducted between one tutor and 2 to 9 students in a group; and tutoring 10 or more students which is considered large-group is popularly known as "coaching". Coaching refers to large-group tutoring conducted in large-scale centers sometimes having branches across the country.

In brief, out of 11 participants seven were selected from urban metropolitan city colleges and four were selected out from rural sub-district colleges. In term of types of institutions, six colleges were non-government colleges and five were government colleges. Regarding the types of tutoring, six participants were chosen from one to one tutoring and group tutoring respectively while the remaining five were selected from coaching centre. Five participants had four to five years of experience of taking up PT-E while other six had six to seven years of experience. Finally, the frequency of participating PT-E was three to six days per week as the duration of lesson and tuition fee varied based on the types of tutoring. The following table shows the thumbnail sketch of participants:

Table 1 Participant profiles

No .	Participa nt pseudonyms	Region	Types of Institution	Types of tutoring	Years of PT-E experience	Frequenc y (per week)	Duration per lesson (hours)	Monthly Cost (TK\$)
1	P-1	Urban	Non-Governmen t	One to one	7	3	1.30	3000
2	P-2	Urban	Governmen t	Group tutoring	6	4	1	750
3	P- 3	Urban	Governmen t	Group tutoring	5	3	1	500
4	P- 4	Urban	Governmen t	Coaching	7	3	1	400
5	P-5	Urban	Non-Governmen t	One to one	7	3	1-1.30	2500
6	P-6	Urban	Governmen t	Coaching	4	5	1-1.30	700
7	P- 7	Urban	Non-Governmen t	Coaching	4	4	0.45	600
8	P-8	Rural	Non-Governmen t	Coaching	5	5	0.45	600
9	P-9	Rural	Non-Governmen t	Coaching	7	6	0.50-1	1000
10	P- 10	Rural	Governmen t	Group tutoring	4	3	1.30	900
11	P-11	Rural	Non-Governmen t	One to one	6	4	1-1.30	1500

On behalf of generating data, the study used a face to face semi-structured formal interview consisted of open-ended questions to allow for probing of the respondents to elicit insightful information. The main purpose of this type of phenomenological interview was to obtain descriptions of the life world of the interviewee in order to interpret the meaning of the described phenomena (Kvale & Brinkmann, 2009). As a result, the purposeful sampling interview was deemed most appropriate for the study.

For analyzing data, all interviews were audio-recorded and transcribed verbatim as soon as possible following the interview. Transcripts were reviewed by the researchers for accuracy.

Once transcription was finished, a phenomenological style of analysis was conducted with the assistance of Nvivo 8, a qualitative software program. The Nvivo 8 software program assisted the researcher in coding themes, managing and analyzing unstructured information. Primarily, the process began with reading through the written transcripts several times to capture initial impression (Lieblich, Tuval-Mashiach, & Zilber, 1998). After getting initial impression, the process of memoing was applied immediately and this procedure led the early coding. To assist in the coding process a log was maintained through the process. Then from each transcript, significant phrases or sentences that pertained directly to the lived experience of PT-E was identified. That is, the *open coding* process was assigned to sort out various aspects of the data that had been retrieved to generate answers of the research question to refine a list of codes that identified the major ideas and perspectives through themes. After finishing coding, the researchers identified “abstract themes” that emerged from the analysis of the data. This master list constitutes a primary outline or classification system reflecting the recurring regularities or patterns in the study. These patterns and regularities became the themes into which subsequent items were sorted.

## **FINDINGS**

To frame all facets of PT-E that contributes to motivational practices, data was analyzed to validate research questions of the study. As of 267 significant statements, four themes are originated from the analysis of the participants’ responses to the interview questions. These include: (1) PT-E as the alternative for classroom teaching, (2) the public exam pressure, (3) PT-E response to academic result, and (4) remedial of school teaching.

Each theme focuses on the necessary justification of students’ motivational factors to involve in PT-E. For instance, in the theme 1, respondents focused on the significance of PT-E (Private Tutoring of English) as the alternative for classroom teaching. They found PT-E as “an immediate necessity,” “a compulsory issue,” that acts as a powerful motivator. Likewise, in the theme 2, participants identified PT-E as the important practices to take away the public exams pressure. That is, participants felt pressure to follow their duties and responsibilities in order to avoid possible negative outcomes. For this reason, they had engaged in PT-E “at the very beginning of their academic sessions” considering school teaching was “not enough” to do the best in the examination result, discussed in the theme 3. Furthermore, participants considered PT-E as the remedial of school teaching as they felt unhappy with classroom teaching, discussed in the theme 4. Finally, the detailed findings of these themes are analyzed below.

*Theme 1: PT-E as the alternative for classroom teaching.* In this theme, interviewees, irrespective of location (i.e., rural and urban), and types of school (i.e., government and non-government school) as well as tutoring (i.e., one to one, small or large group tutoring) demonstrated that PT-E has become the substitute for classroom teaching because nothing much happen in the classroom. That is, PT-E viewed as the important learning practices, which had taken the position of the ‘alternative’ classroom teaching to the mainstream schooling and acted as a powerful motivator. This was evident in a description of an urban government school participant (P-2) in grade 6, taking up PT-E in a small group:

It is necessary to take up PT-E for me because it is difficult to do better in my upcoming HSC [Higher Secondary School] examination only depending on my classroom teaching.

Another urban non-government school student (P-1) who has a 7 years' experience of participating in PT-E felt,

Yes, I think I do not need to go to the mainstream school anymore if I continue my PT-E. I believe I can do the best by taking up PT-E.

Similarly, a non-government (public) school student (P-7) undergoing one-to-one PT-E emphasized on the same view and expressed,

Yes, without attending any English class at my school, PT-E lesson can be sufficient for me as my classroom teaching is not enough for me.

So, participants (both government and non-government schools) in the metropolitan city of Rangpur considered PT-E as their major learning activities which had become the alternative place besides their mainstream school English teaching.

Like the urban (metropolitan city) students above who described the necessary role of PT-E , one rural (sub-district) non-government school participant (P-11) who had been taking up PT-E from grade 6, explained it as, “ I believe that now a student cannot do well only attending the mainstream school teaching. He /she must involve in PT-E.” Another rural respondent (P-10) from a public school undergoing PT-E in a small group from grade 8 emphasized it as,

Yes, without attending English classes at my school, only PT-E is sufficient for my learning English and doing better in the public examination.

Not only did these students see PT-E as the alternative supplement to their classroom lessons but also they viewed PT-E as the necessarily needed along with the mainstream schooling in Bangladesh. One rural non-government school student (P-9), participate in the PT-E in a school teacher batch (small group) concluded,

The present situation not only motivates but also forces [me] to involve in PT-E because it is essentially needed if I want to go ahead with the current practice of Bangladeshi education.

However, some rural students were resigned to the quality of mainstream schooling. They understood that their mainstream schools could not provide them with optimal learning opportunities and were aware that their schools were located in a poor, remote area in the country where facilities were expected to be minimal in the school. This was viewed in a description of a rural non-government school student (P-8), undergoing PT-E in a coaching centre (large group),

Actually when I finish one class final exam to enter for a new class, I have to find out private tutor immediately and I do not feel comfortable until finding the good PT tutors.

Consistently, all 11 participants both government and non-government schools in the urban and rural areas were articulated in pointing out the academic deficiency of their classroom

teachings and emphasized the necessary role of PT-E. For instance, one urban public school student (P-3) having undergoing PT-E from grade 6 in a coaching centre (large group) detailed it as, “My personal belief is that without PT-E, I cannot do well in the examination because school [school teacher] does not teach well.” In the same way, a rural student (P-9) having PT-E from grade 6 in a coaching centre (large group) stated it as,

Yes I think so [without PT-E, I cannot do well in the public examination]. Moreover, I believe without going to the school anymore, I can do the best in the [public] examination by taking up tutoring.

Moreover, by participating PT-E, participants not only got the chance to fill up their academic insufficiencies but also got necessary compensation from it. This was evident in a description of an urban non-government school learner (P-5), having PT-E from grade 6, as “I get benefit from PT-E because what I do not learn in the school English class that I can easily learn at PT-E.” Another non-government school rural student (P-9), undergoing PT-E from grade 6, stated, Yes I am getting assistance by involving in PT-E otherwise I do not participate in PT-E. For instance, my PT-E tutor is very good to provide the examination tips and the guideline for my examination preparation. All in all, it can be concluded that participants were motivated to engage in PT-E as if this were the alternative for classroom teaching playing the role of the powerful motivator.

*Theme 2: Public Examination pressure.* In this theme, interviewees, irrespective of their locations and types of school or tutoring, focused on the mental pressure associated with their public examinations. Participants felt that public examination preparation had become one of the important motivators to involve in PT-E because they all had a target to do their best in public examination result and wanted to secure a place at a university. That is, they feel pressure to comply with their duties and responsibilities to carry on the good public examination records.

Examination pressure was evident as an urban government school participant (P-2), having 6 years of experience, stated the reason for involvement in PT-E, “The reason of my participation in PT-E to remove my public examination pressure forever.” Another urban public school interviewee (P-3), taking up PT-E in a school teacher batch (small group of students) from grade 7, described it as,

When the public exam comes ahead, I feel the metal pressure to do the best in the exam because of my fairness to carry on my previous public exam result [secondary school examination result]. For this reason, I have to participate in PT-E.

Another urban non-government school student (P-4), having 4 years’ experience of PT-E in a coaching centre (larger group of student) expressed:

I feel pressure to continue my previous exam result that highly motivates me to take up private tutoring. So there is a pressure and I need to take up private tutoring to remove this pressure which is not possible from my school teaching.

Likewise, a rural non-government school student (P-7), undergoing PT-E in a coaching centre from grade 8, described it as “For removing my upcoming public examination pressure [Higher secondary school examination], taking up PT-E from coaching is a must.” Another rural public school student (P-10) who had been involving in PT-E for 4 years described his reaction of



exam pressure by saying,

Surely, I feel pressure by thinking of my upcoming public examination as my syllabus has not completed yet. So I feel pressure to take up PT-E to finish the syllabus.

Another rural student (P-11), having PT-E from grade 6, elaborated the description:

Thinking about the pressure of public exam, I have started to take up PT-E at the very beginning of my academic session. If I take tuition only two months before the public exam, my mental pressure will be higher. For this reason, I have started it earlier so that I can do better in future [in the examination].

Consistently, some participants (both urban and rural) told that there was no other target to engage in PT-E except the upcoming examination pressure. For this reason, PT-E tutors always gave importance to examination preparation, which became the main motivator for the students. So, participants felt a deep observation on the role of PT-E to take away their public examination pressures. For example, an urban student (P-6), involved in PT-E from grade 8, reported, “Yes, my upcoming public examination pressure is one of the main factors to take up PT-E.” Another 7 years experienced urban student (P-1) reported with highlighting, “Yes, it is definitely true that I take up PT-E because of the pressure of attending public exams.”

Similarly a rural student (P-8), involving PT-E in a coaching centre, noted, “Yes, we take lesson at PT-E based on the exam [syllabus] to take away the exam pressure.” Another 7 year experienced rural student (P-9) emphasized on the same view and stated,

Yes it is certainly true that the pressure of attending public exams is the most important reason to take up private tutoring.

In conclusion, students need especial care before the public examination. For this reason, private tutors highlight the exam oriented teaching advertisement to motivate students for undergoing PT-E. It was observed in both rural and urban areas, irrespective of school types, where private tutors focused on their tutoring practices based on students’ desire to do the best in the examination.

*Theme 3: PT-E response to academic result.* In this theme, participants, irrespective of their locations and types of school or tutoring, focused on the academic result as the key motivator to participate in PT-E. More clearly, they desire to do the best in their academic results. For that, PT-E plays the significant role to achieve their expected result and assists them to fill up their obligation and accountability for avoiding possible negative outcomes. This was evident in a description of a rural non-government school participant (P-8), undergoing PT-E in a coaching centre from grade 6 (large group):

Academic result is the main factor for me to participate in the private tutoring. I have already told that school may be good for learning but not good for doing better in the examination result.

Another rural student (P-10) from a public school, involved in PT-E from grade 8, stated, “Yes, this is true. Actually I am taking up PT-E to do well in the exam.” One more rural student (P-

11), taking up PT-E in a coaching centre from grade 7, stated that “I think..... Because.... Bangladeshi students are not learners rather examinee.” Furthermore, a rural student (P-9), having 7 years’ experience, described the role of the coaching centre for doing the best in the examination as

Coaching plays very important role to do the best in the exam.” That is why; coaching centres usually take this opportunity and play the role as a ‘success place.

Similarly, like rural students, the hope of doing the best in the exam was on the minds of many urban students too. An urban public school student (P-6), taking up PT-E from grade 8, expressed a similar view: “Yes, we never emphasize on the education [learning] rather we emphasize on the examination result.” Another urban non-government school student (P-8), having 7 years’ experience, summarized the idea and stated,

I think that academic result is the main factor to attend private tutoring in English. I also believe that it is difficult to do the best in the exam without PT-E.

Finally, an urban student (P-8), taking up private tutoring from grade 7, summed up it as:

Though I cannot improve my basic skills in English, PT-E helps to improve my exam skills that help to do the best in the exam. Actually, to do the best in the exam grade or to get golden five in the exam, I take up PT-E and I do not have the target to develop my basic skills and knowledge in English.

Sometimes, interviewees (both urban and rural) were motivated to involve in PT-E not only for doing the best in the exam but for developing the ‘Basic English’ skills. A rural student (P-8) described it as “By taking up PT-E, I learn many things and my conception of basic knowledge have been developed. For this reason, I am taking up PT-E.” Likewise, an urban student (P-41) participant expressed, “Yes mostly it is beneficial to me because my skills have been improving by taking up PT-E.” Another one student (P-1) concluded it as “I can finish the school syllabus as well as my basic knowledge has been improved.”

Thus, students considered PT-E as an important practice that assists them to do the best in the academic result. For this reason, PT-E always draws attention to the students by offering various types of courses so that students can do the best in the public examination result and fulfill their duties for avoiding possible negative outcomes.

*Theme 4: Remedial of school teaching.* In this theme, participants, irrespective of their locations, schools and type of tutoring, focused on the negative consequences of mainstream schooling and expressed that they had been motivated to participate in PT-E to remedy of school teaching. That is, interviewees felt that they did not get sufficient lessons from the mainstream school teaching. So, participants experienced the depressing learning environment in the mainstream school that influences them to participate in PT-E. For instance, a grade 12 urban public school student (P-1) who had 7 years of PT-E experience described the situation:

My school English teacher teaches inadequate in the classroom and we know those who are taking PT-E from him [class teacher]; they are doing well in the class. They are getting different types of notes, sheets and suggestions from him. Actually, sir does not teach in class rather

asks questions in the classroom and teaches in the PT-E batch.

Another urban non-government school student (P-2), having 6 years of PT-E experience, summarized the existing situation of school teaching in the following response:

For many reasons, school teaching is not enough, such as huge numbers of students in the class, class time is not enough time to finish any lesson properly, teacher does not teach rather ask question in the classroom again and again without teaching in the class.

The true picture was evident in the description of an urban non-government school student (P-5), who took up one to one PT-E from grade 5:

It is seen in the school .....Traditionally school teachers are writing on the board and students are setting in the branch. During the class, sir may ask student one time whether students understand it or not. When teachers ask about the lessons, one or two students may reply of the question. If answer is not good, then other students must laugh at or insult him/her in front of the class. On the other hand, when students take lessons at the PT-E, PT tutor take care of everyone lesson individually.

Similarly, like urban participants, rural participants felt the harsh reality of school English teaching that influenced them to take up PT-E. This was illustrated in the following statement that was quoted from a rural public school student (P-10) in grade 12, taking up PT-E in a school teacher batch: “The present situation not only motivates but also forces to take PT-E. If I talk about govt. school, most of times of a year school are closed.” Another rural nongovernment school student (P-9) concluded it as, “There is nothing good in the school lesson if something ... very much limited....very little for the examination preparation and university admission.”

Furthermore, all participants (both urban and rural) also stated that they were not getting enough from the school English teaching due to in adequate number of classes. An urban non-government school student (P-5), having 6 years’ experience of PT-E, expressed:

Yes, school English teaching is not sufficient to me because school classes are not held on regularly rather only one or two classes per week which are not enough for me.

So, interviewees needed to make up the class lessons by taking PT-E. An urban public school student (P-4), having 7 years of experience, stated the situation as “School has two or three classes in a week which may be, I say, good. But, it is not sufficient for me to do the best in the exam.” A rural non-government school student (P-10) stated, “Yes, in our education system.... numbers of classes are insufficient to complete the syllabus.” Another rural non-government school student (P-11), having 6 years’ experience of PT-E, noted, “By attending in the school teaching, I get 5 to 6 classes per a month but I am getting 25 classes per month from my current coaching centre.”

Finally, it can be viewed that participants (both urban and rural) considered PT-E as the necessary support to fill up the gap of school teaching. It was evident in a description of a rural student (P-8), taking PT-E in a coaching centre from grade 7, as noted, “Here [from coaching centre] I am benefited in many ways. Coaching helps me to make up the gap which is not happened in the classroom teaching.” Similarly, an urban public school student (P-2), taking

PT-E in a tutor batch from grade 6, articulated, “ Hmmm...I have to go to private tutor batch for extra care because I need extra care that is impossible to get in the classroom teaching.” Thus, one urban nongovernment school interviewee (P-4) considered the situation as a problematic if government would take step to stop it. He noted, “If government stops private tutoring without improving the quality of teaching then I am in problem.”

## DISCUSSION

Based on earlier discussion of the findings, it is viewed that five issues motivate participants, irrespective their locations and types of school and tutoring, to involve in PT-E. For instance, one of the most important concerns is that interviewees consider PT-E as the alternative for classroom teaching next to the mainstream schooling. Furthermore, they need PT-E not only to take away their examination pressures but also to accomplish their expected results that is not possible only depending on their mainstream school teachings. Namely, interviewees are motivated to avoid possible negative outcomes. Specifically, they felt comfortable to engage in PT-E as they get better environment and experience compared to the mainstream classroom teaching that motivates Bangladeshi higher secondary students in mainstream schools to be enrolled in private tutoring sessions.

Data analysis and interpretations revealed that interviewees believed Private Tutoring of English (PT-E) was the alternative for classroom teaching that was needed to remove the public examination pressure. More clearly, they regarded PT-E as an appropriate place to earn the desire academic result. Furthermore, students tended to depend on the PT-E like a required place to make up the school English teaching as well as considered it as a good place to take away the unhappiness of school teaching. Finally, all participants, irrespective their locations, types of school and tutoring, affirmed that the existing practice of PT-E had been required as the alternative for classroom teaching (theme 1) to the mainstream schooling. This replied to PT-E practice is one of the study's contributions to the literature in the area of shadow education (private tutoring).

However, based on the experience and understanding of all 11 interviewees, it was also revealed that they had been undergoing to the PT-E to take away their public examination pressures (theme 2). This finding is consistent with other studies on shadow education (private tutoring) (Kang, 2007; Kwok, 2004; Yung, 2014; Zhang, 2013) where they pointed out the significant role of private tutoring to prepare students for their public examinations so that they could achieve their desires examination grade.

In addition, it was evidenced that participants were motivated to involve in PT-E because they trusted on PT-E as a remedial of school English teaching (theme 4) and identified the important role of PT-E to improve their academic result (theme 3) (e.g., academic contests). These two findings are consistent with the findings of Baker, Akiba, LeTendre, and Wiseman (2001) where they identified two reasons of taking up private tutoring, i.e., academic contests and remedial education. Furthermore, many participants saw a connection between PT-E and the hopeless classroom teaching. Therefore, all participants, irrespective their locations, types of school and tutoring, talked about the insufficient classroom teaching and expressed their experiences of the unhappiness of school English teaching.

Consistent with Hamid et al. (2009), in the theme 4, the remedial of classroom teaching, emerged as a student's experiences of poor English teaching at school as the main reason for receiving PT-E, but contrary to the findings of Yung (2014) that "learners in this study did not necessarily feel that school teachers taught poorly." Furthermore, the finding, unhappiness with school English teaching, is consistent with the finding of Hamid et al. (2009) as "by default, they place their faith in PT-E because they consider that school English teaching is inadequate."

Like Nath's (2008) study, participants in the current study experienced teachers' inability to fulfill the happiness of students in the classroom teaching. Similar to Nath's finding as "the teachers are generally unable to provide the quality education that is desired." all participants, irrespective their locations and types of school and tutoring, considered school English teaching as a failure of their satisfactions. They expressed their views of impossible to believe it.

As noted earlier, Nath (2008) identified two important reasons to spread of private tutoring of English in Bangladesh, namely the low quality of the teachers and large class sizes. Interviewees' experiences of large numbers of students and insufficient teaching in school English class were strong in theme 4. Participants in this study were aware of this situation and many spoke about it and felt that without PT-E, it would be difficult to get any quality education in the school environment. So, it is difficult to trust of school teaching that motivated them to take up PT-E.

## **CONCLUSION**

The growing popularity of PT-E on the one hand and students' growing frustration with school instruction on the other calls for rethinking the school curriculum in English together with its pedagogy in Bangladesh and other parts of the world. As researchers have argued in this study, students appear to be losing their faith in classroom teaching which throw them to find out PT-E as the alternative for classroom teaching. That is, classroom setting, arrangement, short lesson time, huge class size and irregularity of sessions make classroom instruction meaningless and irrelevant as far as the result in public exam is concerned. More clearly, teacher's motivation, skills, incentives, and working conditions do not support effective teaching-learning in school. For this reason, the school has become the recruiting ground for students in private tutoring. So, the high stake public exams and students' perceptions about the importance of exam scores, and the education policy-makers' emphasis on it have created the ground for flourishing of PT-E, despite legal prohibition of it, which is impractical and unenforceable.

Acquiring English language skills is clearly the casualty of assessment based on public exams (that rewards memorization of set answers based on textbooks, rather than actual competency), school and classroom deficiencies, poor teacher skills and preparation, and teachers' lack of motivation and incentives. Therefore, there should be a sense of urgency among policy makers and school authorities to change in assessment of student learning by emphasizing more formative assessment in school and public exams focusing on demonstration of competency and proficiency rather than memorizing set answers. More clearly, it is necessary to make classroom and schools learning-friendly ensuring minimum conditions such as class-size, learning time, discipline in holding classes. Furthermore, it needs to work on incentives, motivation, working conditions and professional skills of teachers. Education policy-makers',

public's and parents' orientation about why and how English language proficiency is actually achieved.

## References

- Baker, Akiba, M., LeTendre, G. K., & Wiseman, A. W. (2001). Worldwide shadow education: Outside-school learning, institutional quality of schooling, and cross-national mathematics achievement. *Educational Evaluation and Policy Analysis*, 23(1), 1-17.
- Bray, M. (2006). Private supplementary tutoring: comparative perspectives on patterns and implications. *Compare: A Journal of Comparative and International Education*, 36(4), 515-530. doi:10.1080/03057920601024974
- Bray, M. (2013). Shadow Education: Comparative Perspectives on the Expansion and Implications of Private Supplementary Tutoring. *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 77, 412-420. doi:10.1016/j.sbspro.2013.03.096
- Bray, M., & Kobakhidze, M. N. (2014). The Global Spread of Shadow Education *Qualities of Education in a Globalised World* (pp. 185-200): Springer.
- Bray, M., & Kwok, P. (2003). Demand for private supplementary tutoring: conceptual considerations, and socio-economic patterns in Hong Kong. *Economics of Education Review*, 22(6), 611-620. doi:10.1016/s0272-7757(03)00032-3
- Bray, M., & Lykins, C. R. (2012). *Shadow Education: Private Supplementary Tutoring and Its Implications for Policy Makers in Asia (Vietnamese translation)*: Asian Development Bank & Comparative Education Research Centre, Faculty of Education, The University of Hong Kong.
- Dang, H.A., & Rogers, F. H. (2008). How to Interpret the Growing Phenomenon of Private Tutoring: Human Capital Deepening, Inequality Increasing, or Waste of Resources? *World Bank Policy Research Working Paper Series, Vol.*
- De Silva, W. A. (2015). Shadow education: private supplementary tutoring and its implications for policy makers in Asia. *Compare: A Journal of Comparative and International Education*, 45(1), 176-179.
- Fung, A. (2003). Cram schooling in Hong Kong: The privatization of public education. *Asian Anthropology*, 2(1), 179-195.
- Hamid, M. O., & Baldauf Jr, R. B. (2011). English and socio-economic disadvantage: learner voices from rural Bangladesh. *Language Learning Journal*, 39(2), 201-217.
- Hamid, M. O., Sussex, R., & Khan, A. (2009). Private tutoring in English for secondary school students in Bangladesh. *Tesol Quarterly*, 43(2), 281-308.
- Ireson, J., & Rushforth, K. (2011). Private tutoring at transition points in the English education system: its nature, extent and purpose. *Research Papers in Education*, 26(1), 1-19. doi:10.1080/02671520903191170
- Jheng, Y.J. (2015). The influence of private tutoring on middle-class students' use of in-class time in formal schools in Taiwan. *International Journal of Educational Development*, 40, 1-8.
- Jung, J. H., & Lee, K. H. (2010). The determinants of private tutoring participation and attendant expenditures in Korea. *Asia Pacific Education Review*, 11(2), 159-168.
- Kang, C. (2007). Does money matter? The effect of private educational expenditures on academic performance. *National University of Singapore, Department of Economics Working Paper*, 704.
- Kim, J. H., & Park, D. (2010). The determinants of demand for private tutoring in South Korea.

- Asia Pacific Education Review*, 11(3), 411-421. doi:10.1007/s12564-009-9067-3
- Kwok, P. (2004). Examination-oriented knowledge and value transformation in East Asian cram schools. *Asia Pacific Education Review*, 5(1), 64-75.
- Lee, C. J., Lee, H., & Jang, H.-M. (2010). The history of policy responses to shadow education in South Korea: Implications for the next cycle of policy responses. *Asia Pacific Education Review*, 11(1), 97-108.
- Mazawi, A. E., Sultana, R. G., & Bray, M. (2013). Beyond shadows *Private tutoring across the Mediterranean* (pp. 205-216): Springer.
- Mori, I., & Baker, D. (2010). The origin of universal shadow education: what the supplemental education phenomenon tells us about the postmodern institution of education. *Asia Pacific Education Review*, 11(1), 36-48. doi:10.1007/s12564-009-9057-5.
- Nath, S. R. (2008). Private supplementary tutoring among primary students in Bangladesh. *Educational Studies*, 34(1), 55-72. doi:10.1080/03055690701785285.
- Ngai, A., & Cheung, S. (2010). Students' participation in private tuition. *Youth Poll Series*(188).
- Park, H., Byun, S.-y., & Kim, K.-k. (2011). Parental involvement and students' cognitive outcomes in Korea focusing on private tutoring. *Sociology of education*, 84(1), 3-22.
- Yung, K. (2014). Learning English in the Shadows: Understanding Chinese Learners' Experiences of Private Tutoring. *Tesol Quarterly*.
- Yung, W. h. (2011). *Shadow education in Hong Kong: the experience of learners of English*. The University of Hong Kong (Pokfulam, Hong Kong).
- Zhang, Y. (2013). Does private tutoring improve students' National College Entrance Exam performance? A case study from Jinan, China. *Economics of Education Review*, 32, 1-28. doi:10.1016.

**Dr. Md. Monjurul Islam** is currently teaching at Pundra University of Science & Technology and as an assistant professor and he has done his PhD in TESL at University of Malaya. His research has focused on the policy and practice of TESOL education in Asia. He may be contacted at [monj0603@gmail.com](mailto:monj0603@gmail.com)

**Mohammed Samuel Hoque** is currently teaching at Daffodil International University as an associate professor and a PhD student at University of Sains Islam Malaysia. He may be contacted at [hoque.eng@daffodilvarsity.edu.bd](mailto:hoque.eng@daffodilvarsity.edu.bd)