Extensiveness of Higher Education Development Programme on Enabling Institutional Linkage to Ensure Quality University Graduates in the Northern Zone Tanzania

Fortunatus Michael Mbua, Rev. Dr. Victorini Salema & Dr. Timothy Mandila
Mwenge Catholic University, P.O. Box 1226, Moshi – Tanzania

ABSTRACT: *Institutional linkages has been a demand for all universities in the world. Higher Education Development Programme (HEDP) was meant to cater for this fundamental purpose. This study therefore aimed at finding out the extensiveness of HEDP on enabling institutional linkages of universities in the Northern Zone Tanzania. The study was anchored to the Value-Added-Theory. Convergent design under the mixed research paradigm lead the study. The target population for the study was 18,601 respondents from eight (8) Universities in the Northern Zone of Tanzania. This comprised of 5,118 final year bachelor degree students, 483 lecturers, 8 DVC-academics, 12,292 alumni and 100 employers. The study sample comprised of 697 respondents from which 511 were final year bachelor degree students, 48 lecturers, 4 DVC academics, 124 alumni and 10 employers. Sampling techniques included stratified random, purposive and automatic inclusion. Data collected through questionnaires, indepth interview guides and document analysis guides. Validity of quantitative data collection instruments was ensured through content and face validity while for qualitative was ensured through explanation of the purpose of study and ensuring equal time for each interview. Internal consistency of Likert type items was estimated through Cronbach Alpha, while the dependability of qualitative items was ensured through triangulation. Quantitative data was analyzed by using descriptive statistics where frequencies, percentages, and means were determined. Qualitative data was analyzed through transcription of texts, generate themes, interpret, discuss and making conclusions. The study found that, HEDP is to some extent known to students and alumni for its purpose of establishing linkages. The study concluded that HEDP has to the lower extent achieved the goal of ensuring institutional linkages. The study recommended that universities should conduct periodic review and reform programmes to cater for the needs of the current demands of 21st century soft skills.*

KEY WORDS: institutional linkages, employability, soft skills, competitive job market, quality graduates and 21st Century skills.

INTRODUCTION

Education has been globally perceived as one of the significant tools to inform, reform and transform people to be useful for oneself and the entire communities they belong and serve. For this purpose, to be accomplished, education pursued had to be relevant through enabling individuals develop holistically. It is in this mega role of education that there must be a link between what students learn from schools, colleges and universities and the actual world of skills that enable people to become competitive in the industrial economy (URT, 1995; 2014). There have been complaints from numerous stakeholders that education systems since colonial era had not inculcated adequate knowledge, skills and values that enable them become active participants of development by supplementing government's efforts. There also periodic outcries that, the status of education particularly higher education has failed to fulfil what was expected, that is to produce skilled personnel rather that adding more dependent youths who cannot supplement their skills and efforts to bring about personal and national development (ETP, 2014).

Since independence of Tanganyika, the government has been periodically carrying out macro and micro reforms in system of education to make it relevant for Tanzanians. Therefore, education systems particularly teaching and learning, assessment procedures and the curriculums were undergoing renovations to meet this purpose (WEF, 2017; Mbirigenda, 2020; Chidyau, 2021; Suleiman et al. 2017; Skikos, 2016). Among remarkable reforms in education systems in Tanzania were subjected to Educational Sector Development Programme (ESDP) in which sub-Sectoral programmes were formulated and implemented in multiple phases. The major educational programs included: Primary Education Development Programme (PEDP) of 2002 to 2006; Secondary Education Development Programme (SEDP) of 2004 to 2006 and the Higher Education Development Programme (HEDP) of 2010 to 2015 (MoEVT, 2010). Up to the 21st century, the quality of education particularly the quality of its graduates has been hesitantly acceptable and useful to local and international levels. However, one would ask: what is wrong with the knowledge and skills acquired and applicability? The situation is even worse when the status of university graduates is compared to the resources employed to prepare incapable personnel who seemingly isolated to the 21st century with inadequate skills, knowledge and values.

In a special way, Higher Education Development Programme (HEDP) was implemented under the 1999 National Higher Education Policy (NHEP) which put clearly the demand for quality higher education and quality of human resources in and from higher education institutions. The aims of implementing the HEDP was precisely a response to the community outcries on low quality of education and its products (university graduates). The main push factor for HEDP was that the claim of most educational stakeholders in the world had a common voice in decades claiming for quality higher education. This entails that, stakeholders need to be assured of the value for money as they invest for their children and grandchildren's education. It is also known that, higher education is a great scaffolding tool to transform and link them to socio- economic transformation and an asset for the nation's sustainable development. It is in this sense that; parents, guardians,

relatives and the government at large bear the burden to meet these hopes (Mwanyika et al, 2020). The ILO (2020) and NBS (2021) reports revealed outcries from global communities particularly the youth (about 267 million) who are roaming with little skills or holding irrelevant skills acquired from universities. This means that, education systems are not linked to the economic world that demands for skilled individuals that can be innovative of new technology and not only the consumers of the ready-made technology (Mgaiwa, 2021).

The current situation of university graduates evidently show that, individuals with little or inadequate linkage to the local and international world are actually running behind time and are automatically isolated and unknowingly live in their own island which is characterized by poverty, ignorance, disease and backwardness in technological advancement as noted down by Nyerere (1967). The Inter University Council for East Africa- IUCEA (2010) and the Tanzania Commission for Universities-TCU (2019) clearly addressed the issue of quality in provision of education especially by providing the standards and guidelines that had to enable higher education institutions embrace changes that could enable institutional linkage, research, consultancy as well as work-driven personnel. Information Communication Technology, curriculum reforms, technological and administrative being the areas for reforms. All these changes were meant to enable graduates to be linked to the real world of competitive economy as stated in the NHEP (1999); the Tanzania Vision 2025; the NSGRP (2010); UN Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) commonly known as the agenda 2030 especially Goal number 4 on Quality education, all were intended to prepare suitable and sustainable graduates who could transform themselves and the entire community to the level of industrial and technological world. Despite all these strategies, most graduates in Sub-Sahara African universities are merely graduating with good certificates but do not fit to serve the purpose for the 21st century and skills since they do not cater for the demands of the current competitive industrial economy (Mwanyika et al. 2020; Kessy, 2022, Mgaiwa 2021).

Statement of the Problem
Lack of institutional linkages among universities in Tanzania has absolutely rendered graduates with inadequate 21st Century soft skills required for the industrial and innovative world market leading to increased unemployment. Evidence from experience, international organization reports as well as from empirical studies indicate that, most university graduates in Tanzania as the same situation to most universities across developing countries are facing a serious challenges of the lack of exposure and proper information about competitive skills they should embrace for the 21st century which is basically the world of industrial economy and very fast technological innovation. International organizations such as ILO (2020), WEF (2017) have pointed out that, the major indicator of lacking institutional linkage is increased unemployment among youths. The studies by Kessy (2020) and Ukonu and Habu (2022) affirmed that, with the rapid expansion of higher education, there is a widely shared concern that graduates face substantial difficulties in the job search and are often forced to accept unfavourable early employment. It is also alarming that the number of university graduates is periodically increasing from time to time but cannot actively create employment chances, rather seek to be formally employed. This delays the growth of

economy and innovation due to the possession of inadequate and irrelevant skills that do not cater for the needs of the current society (TCU-Statista, 2021).

To be more specific for the universities in the Northern Zone Tanzania, in six (2015-2021) the graduates were 12,292 but there are several complaints for the lack of skilled personnel who can fit for formal employment as well as self-employment (TCU, 2020). Unfortunately, the gap is still widening from time to time despite the fact that higher education institutions are entrusted to fill this gap through research and innovations and teaching. However, this does not connect students and graduates in particular to the real world of competitive job since skills they possess do not match to the demands of current job market (Ma & Bennet, 2021; Mwanyika et al. 2020). Therefore, this study was carried out to determine the extensiveness of Higher Education Development Programme (HEDP) on enabling institutional linkages to enhance quality of university graduates in the Northern Zone-Tanzania.

Research Question

The study was guided by the following research question: To what extent does Higher Education Development Programme has enabled institutional linkage to ensure quality of graduates in the Northern zone Tanzania?

Theoretical Framework

This study employed Value Added Theory which takes into consideration that graduating from universities with good certificates is not the only criteria of being employable or having ability work. Rather, institutional linkage to local and international linkage can be an added value for university graduates. This study employed Value Added Theory which was firstly advocated by Neil J. Smelser's (1962). Saffer (2018) asserts that, the name "value-added" originated from the theory's attempt to explain how a collective effort iteratively gains value at each stage of progression up to its issuance as collective action. The theory is structural-functionalist in orientation, meaning that: "Things exist or occur in social systems to serve a societal function or to benefit a society". The theory assumes that, the student's achievement in education cycle is the factor of knowledge, skills and attitudes (Kim & Lalancette, 2013 as cited in Mwanyika et al. 2020). In addition to that, Saffer (2018) insisted that, collective actions occur to release strain and/or benefit those who seek to change the values, norms, roles, or situational facilities in a social system. Therefore, Value-Added Theory (VAT) states that; "collective actions are the response to a strain (or multiple strains) in a system". In this case, Value added theory is referred to as the theory of social behaviour which has the four basic components which are; situational facilities (resources i.e., financial, cultural, or social), roles or motivation/organization of individuals (rules and laws), norms (rules and laws of varying degrees of formality, that guide individuals' social behaviors) and values (abstract of goodness) (Parsons, 1951 in Saffer, 2018).

Value Added Theory (VAT), plays a significant role in evaluation of programmes particularly the Higher Education Development Programme and the entire higher education system. The theory address that, HEIs have to enable students acquire skills through engagement in professional training so as to make them useful members as they add value to the society through transformation

49

of the societies through their creative and innovative ideas. The theory declares for acquisition of adequate and relevant skills that may enable university graduates prove their significant roles that can be attested through engaging in the innovative tasks they are entrusted to serve in their community sustainably. It is expected that graduates have to demonstrate full capability through revelation of relevant skills they possess that connects them to the world of competitive economy as demanded by the 21st century. Also, the Value Added Theory's attempt to explain how collective effort iteratively gains value at each stage of progression up to its issuance as collective action. In the same vain, Higher education Institutions entrusted as implementing the HEDP to ensure collective gains (added values) brought about by the programme at each stage from situation analysis to completion of its life span and finally evaluation of impacts to Tanzanian university graduates, quality and sustainable service they deliver and linkage at local and international levels.

REVIEW OF EMPIRICAL STUDIES

The extent to which HEDP has Enhanced Institutional Linkages to Ensure Quality of University Graduates
The aspect of institutional linkage is one of the aspect that may trigger institutional development as well as enhance quality of graduates that can be competitive in the job market at local and international standards. Studies under this theme suggest various strategies made by universities to enhance institutional linkage as the demand for globalized world in which the active participants are the youths. The theme advocates for exchange of professional personnel who are equipped with adequate skills under the areas of specialization that are expected to transform the through possession of soft-skills that are actually demanded in the 21st century.

In Switzerland, Loukkola, et al. (2020) carried out the study to attest whether there was a valid demand among higher education institutions and their stakeholders for an evidence-based, data-driven analysis of higher education and its performance. The study used several high-profile research tools which relied on quantitative and qualitative indicators. The tools included rankings, funding formulae and other system steered mechanisms, such as teaching excellence frameworks and performance contracts, as well as initiatives to measure and compare achieved learning outcomes. The study found out that, there were no universally agreed-upon indicators to measure the quality of higher education across systems. Conversely, neither policy as the engine nor programme to run effectively were suggested to enhance quality in provision of higher education. On the other hand, indicators of qualities to be adhered to are seemingly not clear. Thus, the current study filled this gap by setting up quality indicators such as institutional linkage as one of interventions made to bring about desirable impacts on the graduates' livelihood.

Another study was conducted In Delta State Nigeria by Ubogu and Orighofori (2020) investigated the level of globalization of education as determined by several factors including Information and Communication Technology (ICT). The study was designed to examine ICT as a strategic tool in the internationalization of higher education as an indicator of quality. The study employed

50

descriptive survey research design. The sample size of the study consisted of 294 respondents (171 male and 123 female lecturers) selected from six tertiary institutions in Delta State, Nigeria using the systematic and simple random sampling techniques. Correlation Coefficient was used to collect data from respondents. Data analysis was done by way of computed means, standard deviations and z-test. The study revealed that, ICT is a fundamental tool that can play a crucial role in the internationalization of higher education by fostering the exchange of information and collaboration among different higher institutions, and reducing the stress of processing admission into higher education. Since the study employed descriptive survey to find out stakeholders' perceptions from six universities in Delta State in Nigeria, the study findings might be missing some key information from employers who were not included in the study as they are fundamental personnel and consumers of university products (Mwanyika et al. 2020). Also, the study investigated ICT as the only factor for quality of HEIs rather than opening a free room for investigation of factors and their significant contribution to quality university graduates in HEIs. Another contradiction was that the study employed Correlation Coefficient as a tool for data collection from respondents. This contradicts to what is agreed by other researchers such as Cohen, et al. (2018); Ogula et al. (2018); Creswell (2012); Gravetter et al. (2017) who points that Correlation coefficient can be computed during data analysis but not as a data collection tool. This limits the findings to be entrusted as they can be worthy to make justification of the concern under investigation.

In Kenya, McCowan (2018) conducted the study to assess barriers to institutional linkage as experienced by Kenyan Higher Education Institution. The researcher carried out the study drawing information from interviews, observations and documentary analysis as part of a three-year study. Three types of barriers that were found to have impacted on quality of most Kenyan Universities identified in the data: resources; governance and pedagogical culture. The findings suggested for an immediate response to three nominated challenges. Despite the findings and conclusions made, the study did not clearly and with justification show the sample and sampling procedures employed as suggested by Okendo et al. 2020; Cohen et al. 2018; Ogula, 2009 that, selection of sample and sampling procedures have to be justified so that the findings can be generalized or transferred to other contexts. Additionally, the study findings are certainly be generalized out of Kenyan Universities since the study did not capture a wider spectrum of multiple aspect that accounts for quality of graduate such as cultural and technological aspects.

Moreover, the study carried out in Kenya by Muema and Lavery (2018) investigated the consequences of massification as a result of democratization of Higher Education over three decades which led to Juakalization in public higher education in Kenya. Juakalization is the dilution and conversion of high quality university education to assume an artisan nature of mass production of low quality and unstandardized educational product. The study compared Kenyan Jua Kali artisan production process to that of higher education, where both work under hostile conditions to produce mass low quality products. The study employed systematic review of literature with qualitative and quantitative synthesis and public documents to analyze the consequences of massification in Kenya's higher education. The findings indicated that the consequences of massification of overcapacity and insufficient infrastructure led to mass

51

production of a low quality non-standardized university products. The study earmarked a potential concern for quality of university graduates resulted from democratization of higher education system in Kenya. However, the study had no clear and justifiable approach of whether it employed both qualitative and qualitative research paradigms or one was dominant over the other. From the study, it is not clear whether there was a programme or project implemented to intervene the situation. Pointing out a serious problem related to quality of products (university graduates in focus) which cannot be consumed by Kenyans themselves before thought of being consumed by other parts of the world. The study seemingly exposed the magnitude of the problem not addressing the problem.

In Tanzania, Mwanyika et al. (2020) carried a study to evaluate the effectiveness of Higher Education Development Programme (HEDP) on improving quality of education in Tanzania as one of the efforts to improve the quality of higher education. The study employed mixed method in which concurrent triangulation design was employed. The study sample was 560 participants which consisted of continuing students, university graduates, lecturers and employers. The study employed both probability and non-probability sampling procedures. The target population included 10 public universities and 2 university colleges in Tanzania accredited by Tanzania Commission for Universities (TCU). Evaluation instruments included questionnaires, interview guide and document analysis guide to collect data. Data were analyzed using descriptive and inferential statistics. The study found that to the large extent HEDP achieved its objectives of ensuring that higher education offers relevant and diversified education. Lecturers' perceptions regarding relevance and diversification of higher education when compared by their levels of education qualifications were found to be insignificant.

Conversely, Mwanyika et al. (2020) did not critically investigate the key aspects of quality that seem to have lowered linkage and marketability of university graduates in the country and internationally. Also, the study treated quality of Higher Education Institutions in the same way across the country while it is a clear fact that quality is contextual in the sense that, what is thought to be of quality in one region of country might not be in another context where the university is operating (IUCEA 2010). In this case, choosing sample of universities throughout the country forces the study findings to be generalized and not treating each region or zone as contextually unique. Finally, the study abandoned accredited private universities with no justifiable reasons.

Summary and Demonstration of Knowledge Gap
Most of reviewed empirical studies showed various initiatives taken by universities to bridge the gap of institutional linkages through enhanced skills demanded for competitive economy and technological development. Studies by Loukkola, et al. (2020); Ubogu and Orighofori (2020); McCowan (2018); Muema and Lavery (2018); Mwanyika et al. (2020) revealed various initiatives made by HEIs in the world to ensure institutional linkages. Among the initiatives suggested include the role of ICT, launching programmes and democratization of education. Yet, little has been done to enhance institutional linkages among universities in the world. Studies on Institutional linkages could give insight on way forward towards improving quality of programmes offered and other

52

aspects that could expose graduates to the actual world that demands for soft skills for competitive economy and technological development of the 21st century. Also, empirical studies reviewed employed deigns and data collection procedures that do not match to research procedures. In a nutshell, none of the empirical studies treated uniqueness of the context as the main factor that can embrace quality of programmes being implemented. It is in this regard that, the current study investigated the extent to which HEDP has enhanced Institutional Linkage through various techniques to enhance quality and acceptability of university graduates at local and international levels with a combination of data collection and analysis techniques for detailed information.

EVALUATION DESIGN AND METHODOLOGY

The study employed convergent research design under mixed research approach since the intention was to gather quantitative and qualitative data sets as suggested by Creswell and Creswell (2018); Creswell and Plano (2018); Okendo et al (2020); Ogula et al. (2018). The target population for this evaluation study was 18,601 respondents from eight (8) Universities in the Northern Zone of Tanzania as per TCU statistics (2020). This comprises of 5,118 final year bachelor degree students, 483 lecturers, 8 Deputy Vice Chancellor Academics (DVC-academics), 12,292 alumni in five consecutive years (2016-2020) and 100 employers. The study sample was obtained through probability and non-probability sampling whereby the study sample was 697 in which 511 were final year Bachelor degree students selected through stratified random sampling technique; 48 lecturers selected through stratified random sampling technique; 4 DVC academics were included in the study; 124 alumni were selected conveniently through an online Google form (eQuestionnaire) and 10 employers selected purposively.

The study used questionnaires for final year bachelor degree students, lecturers, and alumni to gather quantitative data whereas for qualitative data in-depth interview guide for DVC-academics and employers were engaged. Validity of quantitative research instruments was estimated by five research experts from Mwenge Catholic University in which content and face validation was made. Validation of qualitative data collection instruments was estimated through explanation of the purpose of the study to the participants and giving equal time interval for interviews (45 minutes per interview). Pilot study was conducted between 1st April and 30th May 2022, followed by estimation of reliability of questionnaires (12 Likert type items). The reliability of quantitative data collection instruments was estimated through Cronbach alpha where the estimated reliability coefficient value found was .78. Thus, questionnaire was acceptable for the study (Cohen at al. 2018; Ogula, 2009). Dependability of qualitative data collection instruments was conducted through member checking and triangulation. Quantitative data was analyzed through descriptive statistics where by percentages, frequencies and mean scores were computed. Qualitative data was analyzed by transcribing raw field data, coding, generating themes, interrelating and interpreting the meaning of themes.

DATA ANALYSIS, DISCUSSION AND INTERPRETATION OF THE FINDINGS

The study was designed to reveal the extent to which the High Education Development Program (HEDP) enhanced institutional linkages among university graduates in the Northern Zone Tanzania. Questionnaires were used to collect data for the study from final year bachelor students, alumni of various universities and lecturers were Deputy Vice Chancellors (DVC) – Academics were interviewed. The researcher sough to firstly find out information from final year students by inquiring them through questionnaire to indicate the levels of agreement on various statements pertaining institutional linkages among university graduates in the Northern Zone Tanzania in relationship to HEDP. Table 1 summarizes the responses of final year bachelor degree students:

Table 1: *Final Year Students' Responses on Linkages to National and International Agencies Related to Education (n=509)*

Statements	VLE %	LE %	ME %	HE %	VHE %	M
1. Exchange programmes link students to competitive job market	15.1	13.0	5.7	41.8	24.4	**3.47**
2. Institution is self-equipped with all facilities for quality graduates	5.9	12.2	7.1	45.0	29.9	**3.81**
3. Institutional linkage strengthens innovative ideas	1.4	4.3	4.7	42.6	47.0	**4.29**
4. ICT connects and expose students with the world of competitive economy	9.9	19.5	8.3	41.4	20.9	**3.44**
5. ICT connectivity contribute to proper use of time and bridge to them with globalized world	6.9	14.1	4.9	51.1	23.0	**3.69**
6. Need for institution to promote and market her programmes and products	6.7	1.0	0.5	36.5	55.4	**4.33**
7. Students are confidence to offer services anywhere and confidently	3.3	1.6	1.8	37.7	55.6	**4.41**
8. Students are confident to stand for job competition globally	4.1	2.8	8.3	44.8	40.1	**4.14**
9. Students are lazy by nature, they cannot offer quality and sustainable services to the community	20.0	14.1	10.6	30.5	24.8	**3.26**
10. Equipped with entrepreneurial skills and create employment opportunities	5.7	10.2	3.7	35.8	44.6	**4.03**

Source: Field data (2022)
[Keys: 5=Very High Extent (**VHE**); 4=High Extent (**HE**); 3=Moderate Extent (**ME**); 2=Low Extent (**LE**); 1=Strongly Very Low Extent (**VLE**), %=Percentage]

Table 1 portrays responses from final year bachelor students on whether higher education institutions have taken initiatives to enhance institutional linkage and individuals become part and parcel of competitive personnel in the job market at local and international levels. Students were required to rate whether universities have programmes that link them to competitive job markets.

54

The data in Table 1 indicates that, moderate majority (66.2%) of final year students indicated high extent and very high extent that higher education institutions have taken initiatives to enhance institutional linkage by having exchange programs that link students to competitive job market while minority (28.1%) indicated very low extent and low extent whereas extreme minority 5.7% were indicated moderate extent on the fact that universities have taken initiatives to enhance institutional linkages. In the same vain, when students were asked to rate whether universities are well-equipped with facilities that may prepare quality students, majority (74.9%) showed high extent and very high extent that universities are equipped with teaching and learning facilities with while extreme minority (18.1%) rated low and very low extent. Again, 7.1% rated moderate extent on the availability of facilities. Data entails that majority the final year students in universities are sensitive to the linkage programs initiated to connect them to the world of competitive market and they have been making sure facilities are available for the implementation of programmes. The data also indicate that some few students are not aware about the programs and are not sure whether facilities allocated for the programmes offered are sufficient. These findings suggests that HEDP is to some extent known to students for its purpose of establishing linkages for competitive market although not all students are fully aware of its purpose of existence. The findings are in line with the study by Mwanyika et al. (2020) in Tanzania which showed that implementation of the HEDP has successfully enhanced quality in sub-sectors despite some challenges that can be addressed. This means that HEDP is highly influential to students and functions well in assisting students to establish linkages that connect them to competitive world wide job market.

The findings were also supported by the argument by the Human Resources personnel and DVC-academics who shared their views through face-to-face interviews. One of the DVC-academics through an interview when asked about institutional linkages shared that:

We have connections with other universities outside the country for instance currently we are working with the State University of Zanzibar especially in course related to tourism where we have open doors for our students and lecturers to cooperate and try to see they can participate in matters about tourism, research and publications, projects field and practical training as well as field practical. But again, we have a cooperation with the University of Tampere in Finland where we do have exchange programmes, research and publication *(Personal interview with DVC-Academic "B" on 11th May, 2022).*

Another contribution made during a face-to-face interview by the DVC-Academics on university linkages expressed that:

Now we are trying to work very hard to have conferences and workshops and in these conferences we are trying very much since our students are doing research this is the forum for presenting their findings. And that is more relevant than taking that to the journal paper. And can only be there after presentation. And even if is in the journal, it is good to be shared in conferences. But now holding these conferences is also challenging because of financial constraints. If we look at all what we plan to do, we fail because of financial problems. But with time we'll be able to fix all

the problems and hold conferences so as to strengthen student researches (*Personal interview with DVC-Academics "A" on 4ᵗʰ May 2022).*

The information obtained through interview shows that university administrators work hand in hand with students in ensuring that various academic programs offered are well established with linkages to competitive jobs market worldwide. This information implies that, universities have been carrying out periodic innovation on the area of institutional linkage through benchmarking of the programmes, carrying out conferences, seminar and workshops that link students to the world of competitive skills. The findings are in contrast to those of the studies by Sekkaki (2022) in Finland; Mgaiwa (2021); Kalufya and Mwakajinga (2017); and Kessy (2020) in Tanzania who revealed that most of the students are lacking skills that enables their student acquire required skills to become competitive in the job market. This may probably indicate that some programs in universities have not yet established linkages to job markets and hence failed to connect student to competitive job markets worldwide as demanded in the 21ˢᵗ century skills. The findings are in agreement to the interview response by one of the human resource personnel who suggested what ought to be done to improve institutional linkages that:

Because here we are talking about how each higher learning institution is offering what is related to other institutions outside the country or within the country. And then here is where the aspect of linkages comes in, when an institution is developing its own program, we are talking about the issue of benchmarking about what is offered in Europe, Asia, or maybe South America can now be linked to other institutions whether domestically to make sure that the graduates who are coming from other institutions they can work or they can be now linked to whatever is taking place in other part of the world not necessarily within the country. So, for me I see, little is done in the aspect of linkages between these institutions that are operating maybe in specifically in Tanzania and what is taking place in the world in terms of preparing graduates who fit in the world of economy *(Personal interview with Employer "A" on 5ᵗʰ May 2022).*

The interview information means that, to some extent little has been done and much is needed to be done to enhance institutional linkages. In the same manner, the interview indicates that innovative skills are likely to delay since universities have not adequately done to enhance institutional linkages through benchmarking of the programmes that could enable graduate be equipped with innovative skills that could enable make them competitive in the world job market. Therefore, the implication of the current situation alerts that most universities in Tanzania will continuously produce half-baked graduates with inadequate skills that are actually dependent of ready technology and wait of being employed rather than creating employment opportunities.

Furthermore, data in Table 1 displayed the extent to which Institutional linkage strengthened innovative ideas as a result of the implementation of HEDP by the universities. The intention was to find out whether the institutional linkage has enabled acquisition of innovative ideas among university students. Data from Table 1 asserts that; majority students (89.7%) rated high extent and very high extent to the statement that institutional linkages have influence on acquisition of

56

innovative skills among students while extreme minority (5.7%) rated low extent and very low extent. The data reveals that, students are very confident and are highly sure that when the universities enhance institutional linkage through various initiatives will create innovative ideas. These findings indicates that the implementation of the HEDP was meant to equip students with innovative ideas and universities have fulfilled the purpose under the influence of Information and Communication Technology (ICT). The findings from table 1 on the roles of ICT to enhance institutional linkage concurs to what was shared by one of the DVC-academics from university "A" who commented that:

Of course; ICT is bringing many people together like the use of UMS is making them connected to their lectures, they are accessing assignments and the results. But now what I can see here as a challenge is the capacity. This is the problem because there are too many users when decide to use at the same time, the connectivity becomes the problem. Otherwise, the service is there. I think something has to be done because it is beyond our expectations. Even with the "Mkongo wa Taifa" we still have a challenge of connectivity. Otherwise, it is serving the purpose and the investor is trying to increase the bandwidth from fifteen to forty. But this innovation is very costly *(Personal interview with DVC-Academic "A" on 4th May 2022).*

Information from the interview indicates that, institutional linkages through ICT is available and was aimed at linking students with the entire world by ensuring that they become innovative and competitive in the technological world as demanded by the 21st century. The interview also revealed that not only benchmarking of the programmes as argued by one of the human resource personnel but also the use of ICT that could expose students to the world of competitive skills demanded in the current job market. However, the response from the interview indicates that despite the initiatives of the government to improve in ICT connectivity through the National ICT Backbone (NICTBB), there are still challenges of ICT connectivity that limits universities to successfully link students with the entire world of competitive job markets and innovative skills. Results from interviews are in line with what was revealed by Kalufya and Mwakajinga (2017); Kessy (2022) in Tanzania; Ubogu and Orighofori (2020) in Nigeria; and McCowan (2018) in Kenya who found out that universities still have a long journey to go in enhancing institutional linkages that was meant to bring about innovative ideas among university graduates through the implementation of the HEDP. Therefore, institutional linkage as one of the most crucial aspects for quality of university graduates as articulated in the HEDP has to some extent revealed to students but in the actual sense, studies indicate that students are not equipped with innovative skills that can link them to the competitive job market.

Generally, data in Table 1 indicates that, the aspect of institutional linkages is of great potential to the wellbeing of students and university students since the data portrays the highest mean score of 4.29 that institutional linkage strengthens innovative ideas; mean score of 4.33 on the need for universities to promote and market her programmes and products; the need for students to be confidence when offering services anywhere with mean score of 4.41; the need for students to stand for job competition across the world with the mean score of 4.14; and the need for students

be equipped with entrepreneurial skills and create job opportunities for themselves with a mean score of 4.03. These mean scores indicate that students agreed and strongly agreed with what universities have to offer in order to enable them be linked to the innovative and competitive skills demanded for job market. The findings are in alignment with the National Higher Education Policy (NHEP, 1999) that is clearly articulated in chapter 3; part 3.1 and 3.2 and the Education and Training Policy (1995; 2014) which insists that education systems especially Higher education institutions have a mandate to adhere to the changing needs of the current society including the role of ICT as well as reforming there programmes to meet the demands. Therefore, universities have to take initiatives to ensure that all programmes enable students and graduates get linkages that can enable them easily absorbed to the world of competitive soft-skills.

Nevertheless, other aspects revealed to score moderate mean score meaning there are more initiatives to be taken by universities to enhance institutional linkage as one of the influential aspect that may enhance quality of graduates through innovative skills and competition on job market. Among the aspects that have to be revisited by universities include: exchange programmes to link students to competitive job markets ($\bar{x} = 3.47$); institutions self-equipped with facilities for quality of graduates ($\bar{x} = 3.81$); ICT as the mean to expose students to the world of competitive economy ($\bar{x} = 3.44$) and ICT connectivity to contribute to proper use of time ($\bar{x}=3.69$). Data in Table 1 implies that, there are aspects such as preparation of competitive, supply of facilities for institution al linkage and the role of ICT suggested for reforms. This concur with what was stated in the CIP_1P_2I model that there must be periodic monitoring and evaluation of entire programme and make necessary reforms in the entire education systems before things go astray. This imply that, the imp act of the HEDP are not met as expected if impacts are not revealed through the low quality of its products (university graduates).

Moreover, the study sought the opinions of university alumni on their views as to whether the universities they went through enabled them to have linkage to the local and international standards and become competitive personnel in the job market and innovative skills demanded for the 21st technological advancement. The information from alumni are presented in Table 2:

Table 2: *Table 1: Alumni's Responses on Linkages to National and International Agencies Related to Education (n=124)*

Statements	VLE	LE	ME	HE	VHE	M
	%	**%**	**%**	**%**	**%**	
1. Exchange programmes that link to the world	15.3	12.9	9.7	32.3	29.8	**3.48**
2. Institution is self-equipped with all facilities	0.0	16.9	30.6	40.3	12.1	**3.48**
3. Institutional linkage improved innovation in our institution	14.5	58.1	12.9	14.5	0.0	**2.27**
4. ICT connects students with the industrial and economic world	0.0	21.8	2.4	42.7	33.1	**3.87**
5. University benchmark programmes that connected us to the universities in the world	0.0	0.0	33.1	42.7	24.2	**3.91**
6. Need for university to engage in marketing of products and programmes	0.0	0.0	0.0	52.4	47.6	**4.48**
7. Alumni's confidence to offer services anywhere and confidently	0.0	0.0	9.7	17.7	72.6	**4.63**
8. Alumni are lazy by nature, they cannot offer quality services	60.5	37.1	0.0	2.4	0.0	**1.44**
9. Alumni are equipped with entrepreneurial skills and can create self- employment	35.5	0.0	27.4	25.0	12.1	**2.78**
10 Programme offered in my faculty did not impart skills but academic excellence	30.6	19.4	34.7	15.3	0.0	**2.35**

Source: Field data (2022)
[[Keys: 5=Very High Extent (**VHE**); 4=High Extent (**HE**); 3=Moderate Extent (**ME**); 2=Low Extent (**LE**); 1=Strongly Very Low Extent (**VLE**), %=Percentage]

Responses from the university alumni in Table 2 from various universities in the Northern Zone Tanzania indicates that several statements concur in their responses with those of the final year bachelor students. Data in Table 2 showed that, low majority (62.1%) alumni rated very high extent and high extent on the statement that universities had exchange programmes that linked them to the world. On the other hand, low minority (28.2%) showed low extent and very low extent on the fact that universities have no exchange programmes that linked them to the competitive world of work. And the rest of the portion extreme minority (9.7%) was showed moderate extent. This implies that, universities have enhanced institutional linkage through implementing various programmes that expose students to the real world of competitive job market. As it was affirmed during face-to-face interview by the VC-academics and Human resource personnel that some of the initiatives include benchmarking of the programmes with other high-profile universities in the world, having exchange programmes for students and lecturers, and the role of ICT to connect students with the world of competitive job market. In the same vein, the findings are in agreement with the study by Arsenis et al. (2022) who disclosed the role of technology which is actually facilitated by ICT in assessing students and graduates employability skills. Therefore, the findings

indicate that, universities have from time to time enhanced linkages by ensuring the availability of exchange programme as well as facilities.

Other statements that have got the similar responses to those of the final year bachelor students includes those of; institutions being well equipped with facilities for institutional linkage. Majority alumni indicated that moderate (52.4%), low majority (66.9%) and majority (77.7%) rated very high extent and high extent on the fact that universities have facilities for institutional linkages, ICT connectivity as a tool for institutional linkages and benchmarking of programmes that links institutions with the other universities in the world respectively. Additionally, the alumni responded in the highest majority (90.3%) and overwhelming majority (100.0%) showed very high extent and high extent on university alumni's confidence to offer services anywhere and the need for universities engage with marketing of the products and programmes respectively. On the other hand, majority alumni indicated (72.6%: m=2.27) showed very high extent and high extent on the statement that, institutional linkage has enabled graduates become innovative and the highest majority (97.6%: m=1.44) showed very low extent and low extent that students are lazy in such a way that they cannot deliver quality services. The data also indicates that low minority (28.2%) students showed moderate extent that universities had neither programs that connect them to the world nor facilities allocated for the programmes offered. This entails that, some universities have got no exchange programmes with other universities in the world. This is basically connected to the lack of adequate skills that could enable universities establish programmes. These findings suggest that HEDP is to some extent known to alumni for its purpose of establishing linkages for competitive market although not all alumni are fully aware of its purpose of existence. Similar findings were reported by Mgaiwa (2021) and Kessy (2022) that universities are not well equipped with programmes that connects graduates to the world. However, the findings contradict to the findings of the study by Mwanyika et al. (2020) that the HEDP had to the great extent achieved its objectives.

Moreover, Table 2 indicates the items that had extreme lower mean scores just as it was revealed from final year bachelor students such as: instructional linkage improved innovative ideas which scored the mean of 2.27 where majority alumni rated very high extent and high extent to the statement; alumni being lazy and cannot deliver quality and sustainable service (mean score of 1.44) where very high majority (97.6%) showed very low extent and low extent on the statement. Also, alumni showed low extent on the statement that they were equipped with entrepreneurial skills and can create self-employment opportunities (mean score was 2.78). The findings imply that, the implementation of the HEDP has slightly achieved its goals particularly on establishing programmes that are benchmarked to other universities in the world. However, little has been done to ensure that students are equipped with skills than prepares them be innovative and competitive in the job market at local and international levels. The findings concur with the study by Ukonu and Habu (2022) in Nigeria which attested those sustainable technological skills are the key for unlocking office technology management students' potentials in the 21st century workplace. The findings are in align with the response from alumni "D" through a face-to-face interview who argued that:

60

To be honest, I don't know whether there was a programme implemented in the university, but I'm sure something was going on for us. In a real sense I can say the programmes offered in most universities including the university I attended did neither think of my future career nor my life situation as I'm suffering here now, I am totally stranded I sometimes think that I lost most of my precious time learning things that I have go application with in my life. I think Universities have to do more than what is going on currently because the world has changed but things are going on as normal. What is needed is to review their programmes in order to help students fit to the world of competitive job market (*Personal interview with Alumnae "D" on 1ˢᵗ April, 2022*).

The information from the university alumni coincides to the response of the employer from institution "A" who noticeably said that:

Yeah! At first by the time, they are in college, they seem to be eager to work. Maybe due to the nature of performance and whatever in terms of soft skills. But, for sure what is needed in the labour market is beyond schooling. It is how far they can transform what they have learnt theoretically to practical aspect. So maybe they have skills in problems solving, self-reliant but this does not end in theory, they need practice. The problem we are talking about, is not solving mathematical question, we are talking about solving a problem in the community. There is poverty, how they can solve the problem of poverty in their families or in their community. The issue of self-reliance or personal communication, a personal communication has a lot to do, that we need these students once they graduate, they can be able to communicate with other individuals from various parts in the world. Most of the graduates do not have these skills despite they have very good certificates with good grades but they do not qualify for work *(Personal interview with Employer "A" on 4ᵗʰ May 2022)*.The response from interviews shows that, universities have been doing great job to prepare students for competitive economy but the struggles seem to be much hypothetical. The information imply that, there is much to be done by university managements especially on ensuring that programmes offered link students with the current world of competitive job market and through benchmarking with various external pioneer universities the best prospect strategies can be established. These findings are in agreement with those of studies by Kessy (2022) in Tanzania and Sekkaki (2022) in Finland who indicated that higher education institutions in those countries have not adequately prepared graduates neither competitive in economy nor innovative skilled personnel rather created job seekers. Therefore, there is still a lot to be done by universities in Tanzania in ensuring that all programs offered at various levels engage in establishing proper mechanisms of linking learners with competitive job market and innovative skills that are highly demanded in the 21ˢᵗ century job market.

The researcher also sought of finding out from lecturers about the magnitude of their involvement in the implementation of the HEDP and engagement in various programs offered in universities ensure that they link students to the national and international bodies related to job market and formal employments. Data from lecturers was collected through questionnaire and summarized in

Table 3: **Table 3:** *Lecturers' response on the extent to which universities enhance institutional linkages (n=48)*

Statements	VLE %	LE %	ME %	HE %	VHE %	M
1. Exchange programmes linking students to the job market	27.1	35.4	0.0	31.2	6.3	**2.54**
2. Institution is self-equipped with all facilities	10.4	50.0	16.7	14.6	8.3	**2.27**
3. If institution linkage will be insisted will strengthen students' innovative ideas	0.0	0.0	2.1	25.0	72.9	**4.71**
4. ICT connects students with the world	0.0	0.0	4.2	83.3	12.5	**4.08**
5. ICT connectivity does not lead to wastage of time	0.0	2.1	27.1	54.2	16.7	**3.85**
6. Institution has to promote her products	0.0	0.0	0.0	50.0	50.0	**4.50**
7. Confidence that students are skilled enough to work	0.0	0.0	6.2	54.2	39.6	**4.33**
8. Students are confident to stand for job	0.0	6.2	0.0	70.8	22.9	**4.10**
9. Students laziness and lack of personal commitment	33.3	27.1	22.9	16.7	0.0	**2.23**
10. Students are equipped with entrepreneurial skills and can create self-employment	0.0	27.1	16.7	51.1	4.2	**3.33**

Source: Field data (2022)

[[Keys: 5=Very High Extent (**VHE**); 4=High Extent (**HE**); 3=Moderate Extent (**ME**); 2=Low Extent (**LE**); 1=Strongly Very Low Extent (**VLE**), %=Percentage]

Data in Table 3 shows that, majority 72.5% of the lecturers' rated low extent and very low extent on the statement that universities have got exchange programmes to enhance institutional linkage to the world of competitive job market while minority (37.5%) very high extent and high extent on the availability of programmes. This imply that, lecturers who are the main implementers of the programmes initiated by HEDP rated low extent that universities have made enough effort to offer programmes that enable institutional linkage. This was also revealed by minority final year bachelor students and alumni in Table 1 and 2 consecutively who pointed out that, universities have slightly managed to enhance institutional linkages as the result, university graduates are still running behind innovative and creative technological world.

Also, data in Table 3 indicates that, moderate (60.4%) lecturers rated low extent and very low extent to the statement that Institutions are self-equipped with all facilities for implementation of the programmes in the universities. On the other hand, minority (22.9%) showed high extent and very high extent that universities are self-equipped with facilities place for implementation of the programmes. Also, 16.7% remained undecided that they are not sure whether universities were equipped with facilities. This shows that, it is not clear that universities are equipped with facilities that enhance institutional linkages. This implies that, if implementers of the programme (lecturers) affirm that there are no exchange programmes and facilities are not adequate for implementation of programmes offered in the universities, we should not be surprised by the response from alumni, students and employers that the graduates are not equipped with skills that can enable them become

competitive in the job market. These findings concur with those of the studies by Mgaiwa (2021) and Kalufya and Mwakajinga (2017) that there is mismatch between theory and practice among university graduates. The findings are also contrary to what was stated in the Tanzania Vision 2025 that by 2025 Tanzania will have graduated from the least developed countries with high levels of human development. It is just three years from now and the reports are giving a different alarm to the attainment of that vision by 2025. Also, the findings are contrary to Tanzania Commission for Universities (TCU) standards and guidelines (2019) which put clearly the standards and guidelines to be adhered to by all universities. Among others TCU articulated that: Universities have the primary responsibility to ensure and assure the quality of their institutions and the education they provide. The growth, expansion and diversity of university education systems in the country has to correspond to national priorities and quality aspects in terms of inputs, processes, outputs, and outcomes (TCU, 2019).

The quotation from one of TCU standards and guidelines indicate that, there is a clear and well-articulated standards and guideline that all universities have to adherer to. The findings from lecturers are different with what is stated in the TCU standards and guidelines and this imply that implementation of the HEDP in universities is hesitant to achieve the main goal of their operation as well as the objectives of the Vision 2025 and the agenda 2030 of the United Nations. In general, statements that have had similar responses to all interviewees, alumni and final year bachelor degree students had higher mean score and that majority lecturers agreed and strongly agreed with the statements such as: institutional linkage may strengthen students' innovative ideas ($\bar{x}$=4.71); ICT connect students to the world of competitive job market ($\bar{x}$= 4.08); institutions have to promote their products and programmes ($\bar{x}$=4.50) and confidence that students are skilled enough to work ($\bar{x}$=4.33). Statements that showed lower or moderate response include: ICT connectivity as contribute to time wastage ($\bar{x}$=3.85); lecturers disagreed that students are lazy and cannot work ($\bar{x}$=2.33) and the fact that students are equipped with entrepreneurial skills ($\bar{x}$=3.33). This implies that, stakeholders are in agreement that universities have taken initiatives to ensure institutional linkages. The findings imply that implementation of HEDP is significant to the wellbeing of the graduates and in fulfilling the role of TCU on preparing quality human capital and be attained through making sure that all the programmes are aimed at preparing responsible citizens through programmes that enhance institutional and individual linkage to the competitive and innovative skills that enable graduate fit for job competition at local and international levels. In trying to capture the views of lecturers on the universities engagement in ensuring linkage of their institutions to the world of competitive job market, one of the lecturers from university "C" shared that:

In actual sense, universities are entrusted to make sure that all the programmes prepare students ready to work anywhere in the world and with greater confidence. It is very unfortunate that ideas are well articulated in the curriculum documents and approved by TCU but actually it doesn't materialize in the actual implementation since universities are not equipped with facilities that could enable students participate fully and with practice in developing innovative skills. In return, we as lecturers remain in the same rim of enabling students to graduate without carryout our actual

task of preparing skilled personnel we are entrusted to. That is preparing skilled, innovative and competitive graduates that can fill the current needs of the fast technological world *(Personal interview with Lecturer, university "C" on 25th May 2022)*.

The information from the lecturer of university "C" is in line with what was also shared by the employer "A" who collectively revealed that, there is an open mismatch between what is taught in universities with what is actually expected by employers and the entire economic world that seeks for well-developed soft skills. The information from interview imply that, from time to time, the gap between the increasing number of graduate and unemployment rates will rise if initiatives will not be taken through embracing necessary reforms. The findings are in agreement with what was revealed in studies by Mwanyika et al. (2020); Loukkola (2020); Mgaiwa (2021) and Kessy (2022) that, universities have a long journey to ensure that, necessary reforms are made to meet the demands of graduates and the youths in general of being linked to competitive job market in the world. Therefore, the finding from the study suggests for initiatives to relinquish graduates from a viscous poverty ring due to the lack of relevant skills demanded for competitive job market at local and international levels.

Summary of Findings
Generally, the study found that HEDP is to some extent known to students for its purpose of establishing linkages for competitive market although not all students are fully aware of its purpose of existence. This may indicates that some programs in universities have not yet established linkages to job markets and hence failed to connect student to competitive job markets worldwide as demanded in the 21st century skills. This implies that, the current situation is probably that universities in Tanzania will continuously produce half-baked graduates with inadequate skills that are actually competitive in the job market worldwide and at local levels. Furthermore, the study found that, the implementation of the HEDP which aimed at equipping students with innovative ideas, some universities have fulfilled the purpose under the influence of Information and Communication Technology (ICT). This entails that, universities have been taking initiatives to ensure that all programmes enable students and graduates get linkages that can enable them easily absorbed to the world of competitive soft-skills. However, the impacts of the HEDP are not met as expected since low quality of its products (university graduates) is still observed. On the side of alumni, the study found that HEDP is to some extent known to for its purpose of being established to enable institutional linkages for competitive market. Therefore, there is still a lot to be done by universities in Tanzania in ensuring that all programs offered at various levels engage in establishing proper mechanisms of linking learners with competitive job market and innovative skills that are highly demanded in the 21st century job market.

On the side of lecturers who were the main implementers of the programmes including the HEDP rated low extent that universities have made enough effort to offer programmes that enable institutional linkage. Lecturers coactively indicated that to high extent that HEDP is significant to the wellbeing of the graduates and in fulfilling the role of TCU on preparing quality human capital and be attained through making sure that all the programmes are aimed at preparing responsible

citizens through programmes that enhance institutional and individual linkage to the competitive and innovative skills that enable graduate fit for job competition at local and international levels. However, there must be serious initiatives to relinquish graduates from a viscous poverty ring due to the lack of relevant skills demanded for competitive job market at local and international levels.

CONCLUSIONS OF THE STUDY

Based on the findings, the study concluded that some programs in universities are quite irrelevant for the current life situation in the 21st century since they cannot link students to job markets due to the lack of relevant and adequate skills. The consequence is that universities in Tanzania will continuously produce half-baked graduates with inadequate skills that are actually competitive in the job market worldwide and at local levels. Furthermore, the study concludes that, there is still a lot to be done by universities in Tanzania in ensuring that all programs offered at various levels and faculties engage in establishing proper mechanisms of linking learners with competitive job market and innovative skills that are highly demanded in the 21st century job market. Despite the weaknesses on the implementation of the HEDP, stakeholders such as employers and lecturers believe that higher education and initiatives taken are significant to the wellbeing of the graduates. This fulfil the roles of TCU on preparing quality human capital and be attained through making sure that all the programmes are aimed at preparing responsible citizens through enhance institutional and individual linkage to the competitive and innovative skills that enable graduate fit for job competition at local and international levels. Generally, HEDP has to some extent enabled institutional linkages that enhance quality of university graduates equipped with relevant and adequate skills suitable for the 21st century.

Recommendations

Based on the conclusions, the study recommends to the government through ministry of Higher Education Science and Technology that there should be practical and periodic evaluation of launched educational programmes such as the HEDP to document whether the programme phases are directed to the achievement of expected objectives. It is also recommended that, the government should clearly enact policies that indicate tangible reactions to challenges brought about by the education system rather than remaining silent or condemning graduate youths on the lower quality or irrelevant skills they possess simply for traditional life and not suitable for the 21st century. The study also recommends to the universities that they should conduct periodic review and reform of programmes to enable them cater for the needs of the current demands of 21st century soft skills particularly problem solving, entrepreneurial skills and the alike. Finally, the study recommends to the universities that, designing of the programmes in universities should be a collaborative task that stakeholders in industries, economic forums and technological world so as to enable them enroll students to programmes that will prepare them with relevant and acceptable competitive skills that match to competitive job market at local and international levels.

65

References

Arsenis, P., Flores, M., & Petropoulou, D. (2022). Enhancing graduate employability skills and student engagement through group video assessment. *Assessment & Evaluation in Higher Education*, *47*(2), 245-258.

Chidyau, A.J. (2021). *Formativity of school based assessment in improving teaching and learning of science subjects in secondary schools in Kilimanjaro region, Tanzania*. MWECAU – Doctoral Dissertation.

Cohen, L., Manion, L., & Morrison, K. (2018). Research methods in education. (7th ed.). Routledge.

Creswell, J.W. (2012). Planning, conducting and evaluating quantitative and qualitative research. Sage Publications, Inc.

Creswell, J.W. & Clark, V.L.P. (2018). *Mixed methods research*. (3rd ed.). Sage Publishers, Inc.

Creswell, J.W. & Creswell, J.D. (2018). Qualitative, Quantitative and Mixed methods Approach. (5th ed.). Sage Publication, Inc.

Gravetter, F. J., Wallnau, L.B. (2017). Statistics for Behavioral sciences. (10th ed.). Cengage Learning.

ILO (2020 a). *Global employment trends for youth 2020: Technology and future jobs*. ILO.

ILO (2020 b). *World Employment and Social Outlook***:** Trends 2020. International Labour Office.

Kalufya, N. & Mwakajinga, (2016). Employability of graduates from Higher educational Institutions in Tanzania. *Institute of Social Work Journal*. 1(2).

Kessy, A. T. (2020). Higher education and prospects of graduates' employability in Tanzania. University of Dodoma.

Kitula, P.R. (2018). Efficacy of assessment procedures used to evaluate teacher trainees in selected universities in Tanzania. Mwenge Catholic University.

Loukkola, T., Peterbauer, H. &Gover, A. (2020). *Exploring higher education indicators*. EUA.

Ma, Y., & Bennett, D. (2021). The relationship between higher education students' perceived Employability, academic engagement and stress among students in China. *Education+ Training*.

McCowan, T. (2018). Quality of higher education in Kenya: addressing the conundrum. *International Journal of Educational Development 60.* Pp. 128-137.

Mbirigenda, S.K. (2020). Reflection on Education for Self and National Reliance: Challenges of Access, Equity and Quality in Higher Learning Institutions in Tanzania. *Tanzania Journal of Development Studies*: 8(2).

Mgaiwa, S. J. (2021). Fostering graduate employability: Rethinking Tanzania's university practices. *SAGE Open*, *11*(2), 21582440211006709.

URT (1995). *The education training policy of 1995*. MoEC.

MOEVT (2015). *The 2014 education and training policy*. MOEC.

Muema, E.M. & Lavery, M.R. (2018). Redefining Quality in Higher Education: The Concept of "Juakalization". *Sino-Us English Teaching*. 15(9); pp. 177.

Mwanyika, S., Salema, V. & Malusu, J.M. (2020). Evaluation of the Effectiveness of Higher Education Development Programme on Ensuring Higher Education Satisfy the Market Demands in Tanzania. *Research journali's Journal of Education*. 6(10).

National Bureau of Statistics (2021). *Tanzania: Unemployment rates from 1999 to 2020*. NBS.

Nyerere, J. K. (1967). *Education for self-reliance* (pp. 167-190). Dar es Salaam: Government Printer.

Ubogu, R., & Orighofori, M. V. (2020). Information and Communication Technology: A Strategic Tool in the Internationalization of Higher Education. *International Journal of Education and Practice*, *8*(3), 586-598.

Ogula, P. A. (2009). *A handbook on Education Research*. (2nd ed.). New Kemit.

Ogula, P.A., Okendo, E.O. & Maithya, P.M. (2018). Educational Research Advanced short course: A guide for. SEREK.

Okendo, E.O., Atoni, R., & Kitula, P.R. (2020). *Fundamentals of educational research: Concepts and methods*. Rinny Educational and Technical Publishing Services.

Oludayo, O. A., & Ibidunni, A. S. (2019). Employers' interventionist strategic roles in alleviating the dilemma of unemployability among Higher Institution Graduates in Nigeria. *Journal of Entrepreneurship Education*, *22*(2), 1-7.

Saffer, A.J. (2018). *Value-Added Theory*. John Wiley & Sons, Inc. Published.

Sekkaki, S. (2022). *What Are the Potential Drivers to Improve Alumni Engagement*? Case HämeUniversity of Applied Sciences Ltd. International Business Programme.

Skikos, H. (2016). *From university to employment: Higher education provision and labour market needs in Western Balkan.* European Commission.

Suleiman, S.H., Kassim, S.T. & Hemedi, I.M. (2017). The effectiveness of the new education and training policy in addressing the learning crisis in Tanzania. *International Journal of Management in Education.* 20(2).

TCU (2019 a). *State of University Education in Tanzania 2018*. TCU.

TCU (2019 b). *Handbook for standards and guidelines for University Education in Tanzania*. (3rded.). TCU.

TCU (2020). *VITALSTATS on University Education in Tanzania 2019*. TCU.

Ukonu, E. E., & Habu, J. U. (2022). Sustainable Technological Skills: The Key for Unlocking Office Technology Management Students' Potentials in the 21st Century Workplace.

UN (2015). *Millennium Development Goals Report*. UN.

UN (2015). *Transforming the word: the 2030 agenda for sustainable development goal.* New York: UN.

URT (1999). *National higher education policy*. MoSTHE.World Economic Forum (2017). *The future of jobs and skills in Africa: Preparing the region for the fourth industrial revolution*. Samans, R. &Zahid, S. eds. WEF.

@ECRTD-UK: https://www.eajournals.org/

Publication of the European Centre for Research Training and Development-UK