## DUBBING AND SUBTITLING AMERICAN COMEDY SERIES

# Sajjad Kianbakht

IAU, South Tehran Branch

ABSTRACT: Multimedia communication is ubiquitous in our daily life (Gambier, 2001). This study presents a descriptive and discursive analysis of how elements in humorous extracts from an American comedy series (Malcolm in the Middle) travel across linguistic and intercultural barriers in dubbing and subtitling (English-Persian). The analysis is based on several Translation Studies and Pragmatic methods as well as on taxonomy of humorous elements in audiovisual texts. The taxonomy was first proposed by Juan Jose Martinez-Sierra (2005) which consists of eight types of humorous loads including: (1) Visual, (2) Community-Sense-of-Humor, (3) Community-and-Institution, (4) Linguistic, (5) Non-Marked, (6) Paralinguistic, (7) Sound and (8) Graphic. These are used to (a) quantify and (b) analyze the humorous elements in the source and target texts, (c) calculate the percentage of humor in the source text that had been realized in the target version, (d) make observations on humor translation in the comedy series' episodes, and finally, (e) create a list of translational tendencies, potential norms, in humor translation in multimedia texts. The results show that the rendered humorous pieces into Persian are lower in number than the original text. Moreover, the reduction of humorous elements is more noticeable in subtitling than dubbing.

**KEYWORDS:** Dubbing, Humor taxonomy, Subtitling, Translation

#### INTRODUCTION

Language forms an integral part of the sociocultural system. Indeed as many theorists claim, 'language' is perhaps the key cultural system in itself. Generally there are two views towards language from a sociolinguistic perspective. The first one considers language as an instrument for cultural and social transmission (it owes much to Bernstein, 1990). The second view considers language as a semiotic process (Williams, 1983).

Given the second view of language as a semiotic process, what is important is an understanding of the settings in which verbal humor functions as "social cement" or "as a preliminary means towards re-constituting society" (Alexander, 1997, p.7).

The settings in which verbal humor functions as a social phenomenon are of two types. As Alexander claims (1997, p. 7) "The first is multi-source discourse, typical of face-to-face interaction in everyday settings. The second is what may be termed as single-source discourse. This is typical of 'one-way' communication with a non-reactive audience. The current use of the mass media represents the most prototypical of these, with perhaps the printed word, the internet and theatre representing rather less unidirectional settings" (Alexander, 1997, p. 7). The translation of single source discourse falls under the category of Audiovisual Translation. This audiovisual translation is the focus of the research in hand and the next section hinges around it.

## **Audiovisual Translation**

Audiovisual translation is a branch of translation studies, which has been neglected by translation scholars until recent years and it refers to the translation of products in which the verbal dimension is supplemented by elements in other media (Diaz-Cintas, 2005 in Reich, 2006). It has its own subtypes which is the going to be discussed in the proceeding paragraphs.

Audiovisual translation consists of two groups: intralingual and interlingual (Luyken, 1991). The first group is not in the domain of this research so there is a general discussion about it; however, the interlingual group is discussed thoroughly.

# 1) Intralingual Audiovisual Translation:

In this kind of translation the source language is the same as the target language. There are three types of intralingual audiovisual translation: subtitling for the hard of hearing, audio description for the blind, live surtitling and subtitling for the opera and theatre.

# 2) Interlingual audiovisual translation:

Television programs and films are translated into foreign languages. The interlingual translation can be either visual which is known as subtitling, or aural, in which case the whole soundtrack is replaced.

# **Dubbing or Subtitling**

Up to this point it seems obvious that dubbing is too costly and time consuming and on the other hand subtitling is sometimes vague and takes more effort on the part of audience to be figured out, so, making decisions about dubbing or subtitling a product is really critical. Luyken (1991) recommendations about using dubbing and subtitling are worth quoting at length:

- (a) "The closer the link between the linguistic content and the character of a given program, the stronger the case for subtitling" (Luyken et al., 1991, p.189). Programs which should be subtitled are news and current affairs, educational broadcasts, certain drama and life entertainment programs, music and opera relays, and religious programs. If the target viewer group for these programs includes the under 50's, the better educated and more affluent, as well as students and other intellectual minorities, the hard-of-hearing, and those with an interest in the original language of production, then subtitled versions are particularly likely to be successful among them;
- (b) Programs for the very young and the very old, cartoons and puppet shows, science and art programs, sports and other major public events, variety shows, and drama in which entertainment is the predominant factor are best dubbed. However Luyken claims that "drama requires lip- sync dubbing while other programs need not incur this expense. The cheaper forms of dubbing; such as free commentary, voice-over and narration techniques; can be used here very effectively" (Luyken et al., 1991, p.189).

## THEORETICAL BACKGROUND

This study is primarily aligned with the communicative-sociocultural approach of Translation Studies. The framework of the present study is based on descriptive, manipulation-school, functionalist, and relevance theories. Moreover, there is some influence from Cultural Studies as well as Pragmatics.

Furthermore, the present research attempts to study humor in general and verbal humor and audiovisual translation in particular through the lens of dubbing and subtitling. All the qualities of an empirical research mentioned by Williams and Chesterman (2002, p.61) (particular and general, describing and explaining, predicting, and having a hypothesis) are included in this research. Among the subtypes of the empirical research, namely naturalistic and experimental studies, the characteristics of quasi-experimental situation fit this kind of study. At the same time, the focus of the present researcher is to give the outcomes of research in the most comprehensible and quantitative manner.

The taxonomy of humorous elements by Juan Jose Martinez-Sierra (2005) which itself follows the classification of different joke types presented by Patric Zabalbeascoa (1993, 1996, 2005) is implemented in this research. According to Zabalbeascoa (2005), there are eight different humorous elements:

- 1. Community-and-Institutions Elements: They refer to cultural or inter-textual features that are bound to a specific culture such as politicians, celebrities, organizations, newspapers, books, films, etc.
- 2. Community-Sense-of-Humor Elements: topics which appear to be more popular in certain communities than in others by preference, rather than cultural specificity.
- 3. Linguistic Elements: They are based on linguistic features. They may be explicit or implicit, Spoken or written (Sierra, 2005).
- 4. Visual Elements: humor produced by what can be seen on screen, not what can be read.
- 5. Graphic Elements: This type includes the humor derived from a written message inserted in a screen picture.
- 6. Paralinguistic Elements: This group includes the non-verbal qualities of a voice, Such as the intonation, the rhythm, the tone, the resonance, etc., which are associated with expressions of emotions such as screams, sighs, or laughter.
- 7. Non-Marked (Humorous) Elements: represent miscellaneous instances that are not easily categorized as one of the other categories but are, nevertheless, humorous.
- 8. Sound Elements: This final category is sounds that by themselves or in combination with others maybe humorous. They are explicitly and acoustically found in the soundtrack and the special effects when these contribute to the humor.

## **METHODOLOGY**

The present empirical study is based on the taxonomy of humorous elements by Juan Jose Martinez-Sierra (2005). His taxonomy itself follows the classification of different joke types proposed by Patric Zabalbeascoa (1996, 2005).

Using the above mentioned taxonomy, the analysis occurs in three stages:

The first one consists of detecting source jokes and their two translations (Persian dubbing and subtitling) and classifying the humorous elements according to their constituents.

The second step is "global quantity analysis" which consists of counting all the humorous elements previously detected in the source and target texts. This part of the study allows drawing conclusions regarding some general tendencies in humor translation in dubbing and subtitling.

The quantitative analysis alone does not present a full picture of the differences in humor transfer in dubbing and subtitling. As Martinez (2005, p.292) notices, humorous elements after their translation can suffer not only from quantitative but also qualitative losses or changes. This basically means that not all the humorous elements are rendered on the one to one basis. According to what Martinez observes (2005, p.292), humorous elements can of course be lost in translation, but they can also change type or even be added. The detailed analysis carried out in the third part of the study enables the researcher to discuss about the fixed, changed or even added loads of humor. The results of both parts of the analysis as well as the conclusions are presented in the following parts.

Speaking about different types of variables in this research, it is necessary to mention that the independent variables are the humorous elements and the source text subtitles. The dependent variables consist of the dubbed and subtitled text in the target language and the control variable during the research process is the audience's laughter.

The null Hypothesis in this research is: There is no difference between dubbing and subtitling, in the process of translating humor.

# **Sampling**

For the purpose of this research, Malcolm in the Middle, an American comedy soap opera, which is successfully broadcast worldwide, is chosen. Although there are multiple reasons to justify this choice, the most important ones are: both dubbed and subtitled versions have been done in Persian, it is public and suitable for all ages and all episodes include humorous and cultural elements.

Three episodes from different seasons are randomly selected. The reason for this selection is that these episodes would reflect the logical evolution of the series in the course of not merely one year, but over the seven years of its running time.

#### Instrumentation

At this stage of study the only effective method seems to be the previously discussed taxonomy which is presented in the charts below. The humorous parts are divided according to their kind of humorous elements. Then they are counted and the status is presented in the charts and diagrams below.

## **Data Collection**

Using available information: the taxonomy used by the researcher in this study is a source of information previously presented in the form of a checklist. The humorous extracts of the soap opera are the source of information specified by the producer of the series.

Observing: it mostly involves watching the whole film and extracting the humorous elements of the series.

Scaling: another data collection technique used in this research is scaling. This technique which is used to classify the humorous loads and their quantity is the best way to categorize the data in this research.

## **Data Analysis**

Data analysis part consists of three separate sub-categories: (1) qualitative data analysis, (2) global quantitative analysis and (3) detailed data analysis.

Qualitative analysis: This analysis is one of the qualitative steps taken separately in this research for each humorous piece. For each humorous part there is a separate chart as follows:

Table 3.1 Check card (Martinez, 2005, p.293)

| Card No.                |                  |  |  |  |
|-------------------------|------------------|--|--|--|
| Film:                   |                  |  |  |  |
| Minute of the Film:     |                  |  |  |  |
| Context:                |                  |  |  |  |
| American Source Version |                  |  |  |  |
| Humorous Load           |                  |  |  |  |
| Persian dubbing:        | Persian dubbing: |  |  |  |
| Load:                   | Load:            |  |  |  |

This is the most suitable and effective qualitative analysis process for this research. According to Eysenck (2004, p.6):

"Qualitative analysis is used when originally qualitative information is reduced to numerical terms. Content analysis started off as a method for analyzing messages in the media, including articles published in newspapers, speeches made by politicians on radio and television, various forms of propaganda, and health records. More recently, the method of content analysis has been applied more widely to almost any form of communication."

# **Quantitative Analysis of Data**

The global quantitative analysis used in this study consists of calculating the percentage and percentile frequency of the types, of humor. They are present in the charts below:

Table 3.2 Humorous element content (Martinez, 2005, p.293)

| Type of element | Original Version | Persian Dubbing | Persian Subtitling |
|-----------------|------------------|-----------------|--------------------|
| V               |                  |                 |                    |
| SHC             |                  |                 |                    |
| CL              |                  |                 |                    |
| L               |                  |                 |                    |
| NM              |                  |                 |                    |
| P               |                  |                 |                    |
| S               |                  |                 |                    |
| G               |                  |                 |                    |
| Total           |                  |                 |                    |

V: Visual Elements

SHC: Community-Sense-of-Humor Elements

CI: Community-and-Institutions Elements

L: Linguistic Elements

P: Paralinguistic Elements

S: Sound Elements G: Graphic Elements

NM: Non-Marked (Humorous) Elements

After the global analysis, there is a part called detailed analysis in which the elements are presented in tables and charts in detail. If the translation of the target text has the same humorous load presented in the source text, the data processed would be presented in the following chart.

Table 3.3 Elements rendered without type change (Martinez, 2005, p.293)

| Type of change    | Original Version | Persian Dubbing | Persian Subtitles |
|-------------------|------------------|-----------------|-------------------|
| $L \rightarrow L$ |                  |                 |                   |
| CI →CL            |                  |                 |                   |
| SHC →SHC          |                  |                 |                   |
| NM →NM            |                  |                 |                   |
| $P \rightarrow P$ |                  |                 |                   |
| $V \rightarrow V$ |                  |                 |                   |

If there is a change in the humorous load of the target text, the data would be presented in the next chart:

Table 3.4 Elements rendered with type change (Jankowsk, 2009, p.6)

| Type of change     | Original Version | Persian Dubbing | Persian Subtitles |
|--------------------|------------------|-----------------|-------------------|
| $L \rightarrow NM$ |                  |                 |                   |
| CI →NM             |                  |                 |                   |
| SHC →NM            |                  |                 |                   |
| $S \rightarrow NM$ |                  |                 |                   |

If the element is lost the data is likely to be presented in the following chart:

Table 3.5 Elements lost in translation (Jankowsk, 2009, p.8)

| Type of change            | Original Version | Persian Dubbing | Persian Subtitling |
|---------------------------|------------------|-----------------|--------------------|
| L→Ø                       |                  |                 |                    |
| CI→Ø                      |                  |                 |                    |
| SHC →Ø                    |                  |                 |                    |
| $P \rightarrow \emptyset$ |                  |                 |                    |
| $S \rightarrow \emptyset$ |                  |                 |                    |

The added elements are presented in table 3.6 below:

Table 3.6 Added elements (Jankowsk, 2009, p.11)

| Type of element | Persian Dubbing | Persian Subtitles |
|-----------------|-----------------|-------------------|
| L               |                 |                   |
| CI              |                 |                   |
| SHC             |                 |                   |

## THE ANALYSIS OF FINDINGS AND RESULTS

The first step of the three-part analysis as mentioned before consists of detecting source humorous elements and their two translations (Persian dubbing and subtitling) and marking them according to their constituents. 393 humorous elements were detected and analyzed in this research. In order to design these cards Jose Martinez Sierra's model (2005, p.293) is adopted and operationalized for the purposes of this research. In the following tables the Persian versions are given according to UN system of transliteration. Due to the space limitations of this article, only six examples have been presented here.

| Card No/ Minute of | 1/ 02:47                                      |     | Humorous load |      |    |          |      |          |   |
|--------------------|---|-----|---------------|------|----|----------|------|----------|---|
| the Film           |   |     |               |      |    |          |      |          |   |
|                    |   | V   | SHC           | CI   | L  | NM       | P    | S        | G |
| American source    | Lois: Listen, pervert, this is the third time |     |               |      |    | <b>✓</b> |      |          |   |
| version            | you've called and I have just about had it    |     |               |      |    |          |      |          |   |
|                    | with  |     |               |      |    |          |      |          |   |
|                    | Stevie: Is Malcolm there?                     |     |               |      |    |          |      |          |   |
|                    | Lois: Oh, hi, Stevie. Sorry.                  |     |               |      |    |          |      |          |   |
| Persian dubbing    | Lois: Bebīn dīvūneh īn sevomīn bāreh ke       |     |               |      |    | <b>√</b> |      | <b>√</b> |   |
|                    | zang mīizanī va man dīgeh dāram jūsh          |     |               |      |    |          |      |          |   |
|                    | mīyāram.                                      |     |               |      |    |          |      |          |   |
|                    | Stevie: Malcolm khūnast?                      |     |               |      |    |          |      |          |   |
|                    | Lois: Oh, salām Stevie, bebakhshīd.           |     |               |      |    |          |      |          |   |
| Persian subtitling | Lois: Gūsh kon avazī, īn sevomīn bārīyeh ke   |     |               |      |    | <b>√</b> |      |          |   |
|                    | zang mīzanī va man dīgeh                      |     |               |      |    |          |      |          |   |
|                    | Stevie: Malcolm hast?                         |     |               |      |    |          |      |          |   |
|                    | Lois: Oh salām Stevie, bebakhshīd.            |     |               |      |    |          |      |          |   |
| Context            | Stevie who has breathing problem calls Malcol | m a | nd his        | moth | er | answe    | ers. |          |   |
|                    |   |     |               |      |    |          |      |          |   |

| Card No/ Minute of      | 2/ 03:04'  |     | Humorous load |    |          |        |   |   |   |
|-------------------------|--|-----|---------------|----|----------|--------|---|---|---|
| the film                |  | V   | SHC           | CI | Τ.       | NM     | Р | S | G |
| American source version | Stevie: You're coming tonight? And sleeping over?  | ,   | BHC           |    | <u>∠</u> | 1 (1/1 | 1 | מ | 0 |
|                         | Malcolm: It's a sleepover. That's what you do.   |     |               |    |          |        |   |   |   |
|                         | Stevie: Emshab mīyāy va shabam<br>mīmūnī?<br>Malcolm: Mehmunīyeh khābe shabe<br>ma'lūmeh mīmūnam.          |     |               |    |          |        |   |   |   |
|                         | Stevie: Mīāyemshab? Shab ro ham<br>mīmūnī?<br>Malcolm: Mehmūnīyeh shabūneh ast.<br>Har kasī bāshe mīmūneh. |     |               |    |          |        |   |   |   |
| Context                 | Malcolm and Stevie are talking on the pho  | ne. |               |    |          |        |   |   |   |

| Card No/ Minute of | 3/ 03:37'                                    | Ηι                | ımorou   | s loa |  |   |   |  |  |
|--------------------|--|-------------------|----------|-------|--|---|---|--|--|
| the film           |  | V SHC CI L NM P S |          |       |  | S | G |  |  |
| American source    | Stanley: forty-three                         | <b>✓</b>          | <b>✓</b> |       |  |   |   |  |  |
| version            | Francis: Okay, stop. I can't do any more.    |                   |          |       |  |   |   |  |  |
|                    | Stanley: You think later on you can          |                   |          |       |  |   |   |  |  |
|                    | manage to stand on my stomach while I        |                   |          |       |  |   |   |  |  |
|                    | do sit-ups?                                  |                   |          |       |  |   |   |  |  |
| Persian dubbing    | Stanley: Chehelow se                         | /                 | <b>/</b> |       |  |   |   |  |  |
|                    | Francis: Basse dīgeh nemītūnam.              |                   |          |       |  |   |   |  |  |
|                    | Stanley: Fekr mīkonī, badan mītūnī           |                   |          |       |  |   |   |  |  |
|                    | ru shekmam vāysī tā man derāz                |                   |          |       |  |   |   |  |  |
|                    | neshat beram?                                |                   |          |       |  |   |   |  |  |
| Persian subtitling | Stanley: Chehelow se                         |                   | <b>/</b> |       |  |   |   |  |  |
|                    | Francis: Kheylī khūbebasse dīgeh             |                   |          |       |  |   |   |  |  |
|                    | dīgeh nemītūnam edāme bedam.                 |                   |          |       |  |   |   |  |  |
|                    | Stanley: Fekr mīkonī badan mītūnī ru         |                   |          |       |  |   |   |  |  |
|                    | shekmam vāysī tā man derāz neshat            |                   |          |       |  |   |   |  |  |
|                    | beram?                                       |                   |          |       |  |   |   |  |  |
| Context            | Francis is in military school with Stanley 6 | exer              | cising.  |       |  |   |   |  |  |

| Card No/ Minute of | 4/18:12'                                  |          | Humorous load |    |   |    |   |   |   |
|--------------------|---|----------|---------------|----|---|----|---|---|---|
| the film           |   | V        | SHC           | CI | L | NM | P | S | G |
| American source    | Rees: Now we are even.                    | <b>✓</b> |               |    |   |    |   |   |   |
| version            | Malcolm: Now we're                        |          |               |    |   |    |   |   |   |
| Persian dubbing    | Rees: Hālā bīhesāb shodīm.                | /        |               |    |   |    |   |   |   |
|                    | Malcolm: Alān shodīm                      |          |               |    |   |    |   |   |   |
| Persian subtitling | Rees: Hālā bīhesāb shodīm.                | <b>✓</b> |               |    |   |    |   |   |   |
|                    | Malcolm: Alān shodīm                      |          |               |    |   |    |   |   |   |
| Context            | Malcolm and Rees start taking it out from | eacl     | h other.      | •  |   |    |   |   | • |

| Card No/ Minute of | 5/ 00:13'                                    |              | Humorous load |       |   |    |              |   |   |
|--------------------|--|--------------|---------------|-------|---|----|--------------|---|---|
| the film           |  |              |               |       |   |    |              |   |   |
|                    |  | V            | SH            | CI    | L | NM | P            | S | G |
|                    |  |              | C             |       |   |    |              |   |   |
| American source    | Malcolm: Wait for it Oh, screw it.           | $\checkmark$ |               |       |   |    | $\checkmark$ |   |   |
| version            | Reese: Oh, man.                              |              |               |       |   |    |              |   | 1 |
|                    | Malcolm: What's wrong, Reese?                |              |               |       |   |    |              |   | 1 |
|                    | Reese: Nothing! Just-Just shut up and go to  |              |               |       |   |    |              |   |   |
|                    | sleep, okay? Malcolm: It's good to be alive! |              |               |       |   |    |              |   |   |
| Persian dubbing    | Malcolm: Hālā vāysā ye zareh dīgeh           | $\checkmark$ | <b>√</b>      |       |   |    |              |   |   |
|                    | Ahā dorost shod.                             |              |               |       |   |    |              |   |   |
|                    | Reese: Vāy khodā.                            |              |               |       |   |    |              |   |   |
|                    | Malcolm: Chī shodeh, Reese?                  |              |               |       |   |    |              |   | 1 |
|                    | Reese: Hīchī! Faqat sāket sho va begīr       |              |               |       |   |    |              |   | 1 |
|                    | bekhāb, khob?                                |              |               |       |   |    |              |   |   |
|                    | Malcolm: Zendegiyeh kheyli khubeh!           |              |               |       |   |    |              |   |   |
| Persian subtitling | Malcolm: Sab kon oh bīkhīyālesh.             | <b>_</b>     | <b>✓</b>      |       |   |    |              |   |   |
| _                  | Reese: Oh mard.                              |              |               |       |   |    |              |   |   |
|                    | Malcolm: Chī shodeh, Reese?                  |              |               |       |   |    |              |   |   |
|                    | Reese: Hīchī! Faqat dahaneto bebando         |              |               |       |   |    |              |   |   |
|                    | bekhāb, khob?                                |              |               |       |   |    |              |   |   |
|                    | Malcolm: Zendeh budan khubeh!                |              |               |       |   |    |              |   |   |
| Context            | Malcolm is tricking Reese to show that he ha | as w         | et him        | self. |   |    |              |   |   |

| Card No/ Minute of the  | 6/14:42'   | Hu       | morous | s load | l        |    |   |   |   |
|-------------------------|--|----------|--------|--------|----------|----|---|---|---|
| film                    |  | V        | SHC    | CI     | L        | NM | P | S | G |
| American source version | Commander: But since you seem to be motivated more by losing I'm going to beat you at your own game. Francis: Huh? Commander: I'm going down, cadet. I'm going down hard                         | <b>✓</b> |        |        | <b>√</b> |    |   |   |   |
| Persian dubbing         | Farmāndeh: Amā chon be nazar mīyād vāse<br>bākhtan bīshtar angīzeh dārī, mīkhām tu bāzīye<br>khodet azat bebaram.<br>Francis: Chī?<br>Farmāndeh: Dāram mīyām pāyīn pesar. Hesābī<br>mīyām pāyīn. | <b>✓</b> |        |        | <b>√</b> |    |   |   |   |
| Persian subtitling      | Farmāndeh: Chon be nazar mīyād bīshtar be<br>bākhtan 'alāqe dārī, mīkhām be ravīyeyeh<br>khodet bāzī konam.<br>Francis: Chī?<br>Farmāndeh: Mīkhām bebāzam afsar. Mīkhām be<br>sheddat bebāzam.   | <b>✓</b> |        |        |          |    |   |   |   |
| Context                 | The commander is trying to lose the game to Fran   | ncis.    |        | •      |          |    |   |   |   |

As mentioned before, the quantitative analysis alone does not present a full picture of the differences in humor transfer in dubbing and subtitling. As Sierra-Martinez (2005, p. 292) notices, "Humorous pieces after their translation can suffer not only from a quantitative but also qualitative losses or changes". This basically means that not all the elements are rendered on the one to one basis. For example the fact that the target text contains i.e. twelve linguistic elements and the source text sixteen does not simply mean that these twelve elements were translated and the remaining four were lost. As Martinez observes (2005, p. 292), humorous elements can also change type or even can be added. This is the reason for presenting the parts on global analysis and detailed analysis in the following parts.

# **Global Quantitative Analysis**

As mentioned before, the qualitative analysis alone does not present a full picture of the differences in humor transfer in dubbing and subtitling mostly because the lack of one to one relationship between the rendered elements. In this part the data gathered from analyzed humorous element is presented in tables and charts for further discussions about lost, changed or added types of elements.

**Table 4.2 Humorous element content** 

| Type of element | Original Version | Persian Dubbing | Persian Subtitling |
|-----------------|------------------|-----------------|--------------------|
| V               | 48               | 46              | 48                 |
| SHC             | 23               | 15              | 11                 |
| CI              | 16               | 9               | 5                  |
| L               | 19               | 9               | 10                 |
| NM              | 25               | 27              | 25                 |
| P               | 23               | 12              | 2                  |
| S               | 7                | 4               | 7                  |
| G               | 2                | 0               | 0                  |
| Total           | 163              | 122             | 108                |

V: Visual Elements

SHC: Community-Sense-of-Humor Elements CI: Community-and-Institutions Elements

L: Linguistic Elements

NM: Non-Marked (Humorous) Elements

P: Paralinguistic Elements

S: Sound Elements
G: Graphic Elements

**Table 4.3 Humorous element content** 

| Type of element | Original Version | Persian Dubbing | Persian Subtitling |
|-----------------|------------------|-----------------|--------------------|
|                 |                  | Percentage      | Percentage         |
| V               | 48               | 95.83%          | 100%               |
| SHC             | 23               | 65.21%          | 47.8%              |
| CI              | 16               | 56.25%          | 31.25%             |
| L               | 10               | 47.36%          | 52.63%             |
| NM              | 25               | 108%            | 100%               |
| P               | 23               | 52.17%          | 8.7%               |
| S               | 7                | 57.14%          | 100%               |
| G               | 2                | 0%              | 0%                 |
| Total           | 163              | 74.85%          | 66.25%             |

Judging from the global quantitative analysis, it can be said that the target texts tend to contain less humorous elements than the source texts. The proportional loss of the humorous elements is almost 25% in dubbing and 36% in subtitling.

It is also clear that the translations had the weakest performance in the rendition of the graphic and paralinguistic elements. According to the table (4.3) the graphic elements \_ although small in number\_ are not rendered at all. About the paralinguistic elements, according to the same sources, although 57% of the elements are dubbed which is not fundamentally lower than other humorous loads, but only 8% of them are subtitled into Persian.

Both translations had the strongest performance in rendering of the visual and non-marked elements. In normal situations visual element are expected to be rendered 100% in both methods but here some scenes are censored from the dubbed version and made the rendition rate of Persian dubbing 95%. In translating non-marked elements it seems that they outnumber the original text (The dubbed version contains 108% of non-marked rendered elements), but this is mostly because of the added or changed elements which are discussed in the next parts.

In linguistic and sound elements there is a little change of behavior. The dubbed version of linguistic elements (47%) is slightly lower than the Persian subtitle version (52%). The gap between the two translated versions of sound elements is even greater. Comparing 57% of Persian dubbed version with the 100% of subtitled version shows that the sound elements are not presented in the dubbed version in a perfect manner.

The rendered community sense of humor and community and institutions elements follow the normal behavior but they are still very low in number. According to the table 4.2 only 65% and 47% of community sense of humor elements are dubbed and subtitled. About the community and institutions elements the same thing happens. Only 56% and 31% of them are dubbed and subtitled.

As mentioned before the results of the global quantitative analysis does not presents a full picture of the differences in humor transfer in dubbing and subtitling. So the next part provides the reader with the closer analysis of data gathered in the qualitative part.

# **Detailed Analysis**

In this part the data gathered from Global quantitative analysis is discussed in detail. The following table shows the elements rendered without type change.

Table 4.4 Elements rendered without type change

| Type of change    | Original Version | Persian Dubbing | Persian Subtitles |
|-------------------|------------------|-----------------|-------------------|
| $L \rightarrow L$ | 19               | 8               | 9                 |
| CI →CI            | 16               | 8               | 5                 |
| SHC→ SHC          | 23               | 14              | 11                |
| NM →NM            | 25               | 20              | 18                |
| $P \rightarrow P$ | 23               | 12              | 2                 |
| $V \rightarrow V$ | 48               | 46              | 48                |

 $L \rightarrow L$ : linguistic to linguistic

CI → CI: community and institutions to community and institutions

SHC → SHC: community sense of humor to community sense of humor

NM  $\rightarrow$ NM: non-marked to non-marked P  $\rightarrow$  P: paralinguistic to paralinguistic

 $V \rightarrow V$ : visual to visual

Table 4.5 Percentage of elements rendered without type change

| Type of change        | Original Version | Persian Dubbing | Persian Subtitles |
|-----------------------|------------------|-----------------|-------------------|
| $L \to L$             | 19               | 42.10%          | 7.36%             |
| CI→ CI                | 16               | 50%             | 31.25%            |
| $SHC \rightarrow SHC$ | 23               | 60.86%          | 47.82%            |
| $NM \rightarrow NM$   | 25               | 80%             | 72%               |
|                       |                  |                 |                   |
| $P \rightarrow P$     | 23               | 52.17%          | 8.70%             |
| $V \rightarrow V$     | 48               | 95.83%          | 100%              |

According to the gathered data presented on table 4.5, the visual element with 95% dubbed and 100% subtitled translations is on the top in the analysis.

The findings also indicate that the linguistic element with 52% dubbed and the paralinguistic element with 8% subtitled translations fall to the lowest place in the analysis.

About the difference between the dubbed and subtitled versions of the humorous pieces, as can be seen on table 4.5, there is a meaningful gap between the two translations of the paralinguistic elements. This happens when some of the subtitles fail to represent the paralinguistic features of the source text (intonation, tone, etc.) in the target language.

The least difference between the two acts of translation happens in the linguistic and non-marked elements. The community sense of humor and communicative and institution elements are at least survived elements without change of type. Among the elements with a change of type during dubbing and subtitling the following figures worth mentioning here in table 4.6.

Table 4.6 Elements rendered with type change

| Type of change     | Original Version | Persian Dubbing | Persian Subtitling |
|--------------------|------------------|-----------------|--------------------|
| $L \rightarrow NM$ | 19               | 1               | 1                  |
| CI →NM             | 16               | 3               | 3                  |
| SHC →NM            | 23               | 3               | 4                  |

Table 4.7 Elements rendered with type change

| Type of change | Original Version | Persian Dubbing | Persian Subtitling |
|----------------|------------------|-----------------|--------------------|
| L →NM          | 19               | 5.26%           | 5.26%              |
| CI →NM         | 16               | 18.75%          | 18.75%             |
| SHC →NM        | 23               | 13.04%          | 17.40%             |

According to the findings the community sense of humor with 18% and 18% and communicative and institution elements with 13% and 17% of dubbed and subtitled translations respectively are the most important changed elements.

The study also showed that some humorous elements are lost in the translation process. The details about of each element loss through dubbing and subtitling are included in table 4.8:

**Table 4.8 Elements lost in translation** 

| Type of change            | Original Version | Persian Dubbing | Persian Subtitling |
|---------------------------|------------------|-----------------|--------------------|
| L→Ø                       | 19               | 7               | 8                  |
| CI →Ø                     | 16               | 5               | 8                  |
| SHC →Ø                    | 23               | 6               | 8                  |
| $P \rightarrow \emptyset$ | 23               | 11              | 21                 |
| V →Ø                      | 48               | 2               | 0                  |
| $S \rightarrow \emptyset$ | 7                | 3               | 0                  |
| NM →Ø                     | 25               | 5               | 8                  |
| G→Ø                       | 2                | 2               | 2                  |

 $\overline{\emptyset}$  = Nothing

Table 4.9 Percentage of lost elements in translation

| Type of change            | Original Version | Persian Dubbing | Persian Subtitles |
|---------------------------|------------------|-----------------|-------------------|
| $L \rightarrow \emptyset$ | 19               | 36.48%          | 42.10%            |
| CI →Ø                     | 16               | 31.25%          | 50%               |
| SHC →Ø                    | 23               | 26.08%          | 34.78%            |
| $P \rightarrow \emptyset$ | 23               | 47.82%          | 91.3%             |
| V→Ø                       | 48               | 4%              | 0%                |
| $S \rightarrow \emptyset$ | 7                | 42.8%           | 0%                |
| NM →Ø                     | 25               | 20%             | 32%               |
| $G \rightarrow \emptyset$ | 2                | 100%            | 100%              |

The findings also show that the Paralinguistic, and communicative and institutions are the most lost elements in number in both translations of this film. The linguistic element with a slight difference falls after the communicative and institution elements. The communicative sense of humor element is in the middle of the spectrum. Apparently the non-marked, visual and sound elements are the least lost elements.

# **Elements Added in Translation**

One of the most interesting features of this study is the fact that in some cases humorous load of the target version increased comparing the original version. Although the figures are too low to be mentioned here, they are presented for the sake of reliability.

**Table 4.10 Added elements** 

| Type of change | Persian Dubbing | Persian Subtitles |
|----------------|-----------------|-------------------|
| L              | 0               | 1                 |
| CI             | 1               | 0                 |
| SHC            | 1               | 0                 |
| P              | 0               | 0                 |
| V              | 0               | 0                 |
| S              | 0               | 0                 |
| NM             | 0               | 0                 |
| G              | 0               | 0                 |

## **CONCLUSION**

In this study the translation of humorous elements through the lens of dubbing and subtitling was investigated. As there has been no such study on humor in audiovisual context in Iran up to this point, first of all the place of humor in socio-cultural system was introduced. Then the two methods under study namely, dubbing and subtitling, were elaborated.

The results obtained from the global and the detailed analysis allows drawing several conclusions regarding the translation of humor in dubbing and subtitling.

First of all, it should be pointed out that regardless of the language or the method of translation, the target texts tend to contain less humorous elements than the source texts. The quantitative loss of the humorous load in the translated texts is 30% in general.

Second it was also made clear that compared to dubbing, the subtitled versions preserve less amount of the original humorous load (the percentage of humorous elements preserved without changing the source elements' type, was significantly lower in subtitling) and contained less humorous elements in general.

Third the categorizations of humorous elements in this study has been proved useful for setting up means for measuring and quantifying the humorous elements, their translations, and their occurrence and nature in both the source and target texts.

## REFERENCES

- Alexander, Richard (1997). Aspects of verbal humor in English. Tubingen: Gunter Narr Verlag.
- Attardo, Salvatore and Jean-Charles Chabanne (1992). Jokes as a text type. In Attardo and Chabanne (eds.) 1992.
- Attardo, Salvatore, and Victor Raskin (1991). Script theory revis(it)ed: joke similarity and joke representation model.
- Attardo, Salvatore (1994). Linguistic theories of humor Berlin: Mouton De Gruyter.
- Gambier, Y. & Gottlieb, H. (2001). Multimedia, Multilingua: Multiple Challenges. In: Y. Gambier& H. Gottlieb, (Multi) media translation: Concepts, practices, and research (pp. vii-xx). Amsterdam/Philadelphia: John Benjamins.
- Halliday, M. A. K (1978). Language as Social Semiotic: The social interpretation of language and meaning. London: Edward Arnold.
- Janko, Richard (1987). Hypothetical reconstruction of Poetics II. In Aristotle Poetics. Indianapolis: Hackett.
- Luyken, George-Michael, Thomas Herbst, Jo Langham-Brown, Helene Reid and Herman Spinhof (1991). Overcoming Language Barriers in Television. Dubbing and Subtitling for the European Audience, Media Monographs no. 13, European Institute for the Media, Manchester.
- Martinez-Sierra, Jose (2005). "Translating Audiovisual Humor. A Case Study", in Henrik Gottlieb (ed.) Perspectives: Studies in Translatology, Copenhagen: Routledge.
- Reich, P. (2006). The film and the book in translation. MA thesis. Masaryk University. Retrieved April 21, 2009, from http://is.muni.cz/th/64544/ff\_m/Diplomova\_prace. doc.
- Williams J. and Chesterman A. (2002j. The Map. A Beginner's Guide to Doing Research in Translation Studies. Manchester, UK; Northampton, *MA*: St. Jerome Pub.

Vol.4, No.4, pp.65-80, June 2016

Published by European Centre for Research Training and Development UK (www.eajournals.org)

Zabalbeascoa Terran, Patrick (2000) "Contenidos para adultos en el genero infantil: el caso del doblaje de Walt Disney", in Veljka Ruzicka, Celia Vazquez and Lourdes Lorenzo (eds.) Literatura infantil y juvenil: tendencias actuates en investigation, Vigo: Universidade deVigo.