

**ORIGINS OF TRANSLATION AND SIMULATION BETWEEN THE THEORY AND PRACTICE (ARABIC TRANSLATION OF MOHAMMED IQBĀL'S POETRY AS AN EXAMPLE)**

**Prof. Dr. Salahuddin Mohd Shamsuddin<sup>1</sup> and Dr. Siti Sara Binti Hj. Ahmad<sup>2</sup>**

<sup>1</sup>Faculty of Arabic Language, Islamic University Sultan Sharif Ali, Brunei Darussalam

<sup>2</sup>Dean, Faculty of Arabic Language, Islamic University Sultan Sharif Ali, Brunei Darussalam

---

**ABSTRACT:** *Development of Arab-Islamic sciences is very important in our time and in every age, so as not to lag behind the procession of civilized time. Therefore, it is necessary that man has to remain in constant contact with what does the human thought offer and stand in the position of criticism and scrutiny, because the authenticity is not when the man remains self-evident, but the originality is when the man renews his thought by the ideas of others. As for the translation, we can say that the translator must know that the function of the symbol differs to the images of metaphors and analogies that are defined by the Arab scholars, are not as a means of embodiment or photography, but a means of expressing the emotional or intellectual content. Translator must know the words and their meanings, and the conditions in which they are used, because the words are merely tools for the writer or interpreter to express the meanings, they are like the colors of the painter and the stone in the hands of the statue maker. Modern Arabic is almost the language of the international journalism. It is difficult to have an alternative for every foreign word in Arabic. There are many words in Arabic also that have no alternatives in the other languages. We should return those words to the language of contemporary journalism to translate them for the soul of our time. There is a soul behind the meaning of every word must be understood. There are many translators and every translator has his own experience. We select an example for the translation of Iqbal's poetry, as some translators have tried to translate his poetry in the form of poetry, but the translation in the form of prose is more accurate to the original text.*

**KEYWORDS:** Origins of Translation, Importance of simulation, Secrets and symbols of the texts, Poetic style of the translation, Examples from Iqbal's translated poetry.

---

## **INTRODUCTION**

### **Translation**

#### **Texts**

When we discuss about the translation, our consideration is based on the texts, and the texts are many: Ancient; modern; long; short; religious; social; political; romantic; realistic; mythological; historical; literary; psychological; symbolic; theoretical; practical; standard; vernacular; rhetorical; philosophical; logical texts, etc.

In fact, the Arab-Islamic sciences with their different names and diversity in their goals seem intellectually as one science tasked to invest the text. Whether it is related to the religious sciences: Such as the interpretation, Hadith, jurisprudence, science of speech or linguistics: Such as the grammar, morphology and rhetoric, the material of research is always the text.

As for the reading of the readable text, must provide an intellectual, social and political environment for the contemporary readers. This reading makes the text a contemporary text to us at the level of understanding and reasonableness, but reading the text in its past period and only for itself, means it is separated from us, and making it a contemporary text means that it links to us. The reading depends on two important methodological steps, the first is reading of the texts in its previous environment and the second is its link to us in the modern age. [1]

The religious texts indicate the presence of many doctrines and word fighting for the truth of everyone in the Arab culture. Therefore, many of the Arab and Muslim scholars in the field of Arab-Islamic sciences: Such as (Grammar, Jurisprudence and Science of Speech) did not hesitate in the declaration that plenty of these doctrines and conflicts are due to interference between the logic of Arabic language and the logic of ancient Greek. [2]

### **Graphic and Symbolic Images**

A translator who wants to translate from European literatures into Arabic, cannot ignore any photographic picture of the expression through the image, this graphic expression was important in the ancient time and it still has its importance in the modern era, because the image of poetic style at the present which is taken from the West, as being the base of theoretical term and Applied Analysis, which is used as a symbol of the poetic expression, we can put the icon of the poetic expression into the linguistic theory of metaphor -as it is known to the Arabs- and taken from the analysis of Aristotle. So "Metaphor in Qur'an" in the theoretical basis, is based on the transfer of the word from one area of the meaning to another on the base of similarities found between both areas.

Ancient Arab-Muslim scientists have analyzed the covering of different types of metaphors. Muḥammad Mandūr says: "We note something similar to the western people use a general theoretical basis for the symbolic poetic expression. We have some beautiful words explained by Baudelaire in his poetry about this theoretical basis, as he says: "The voices, colors and perfumes respond." The interpretation of the poetry is actually the word and its attributes that are related to the world of a particular sense: The world of hearing, sight, touch and smell can be transmitted from an area to another area of common sense, as being a strong expression and imagination." [3]

There is also no difference between the translator and the writer or the literary person in the knowledge of the qualities that are commonly used to distinguish the descriptive noun from the others, especially those qualities that are called by the scientists of linguistic beauty the qualities (of the essence) that highlight the essences of things or especially their characteristics that remain with the nature of things.

There is also no difference between the translator and the writer in the transfer of images to the other souls through the use of tools of expression and photography, except that the translator convey the image of the other existing from the first, and adhere to transfer to the others, and the writer becomes free to transfer that image, which is printed first on the page of his heart, to the others through the embodiment or representation.

### **Words**

When we look at the words, it becomes clear that the phrase and the image is made of these words. Style of a poet, a writer or a literary person who is known with his own especial style, which is attributed to him is created by these words. The verbal music comes out with the

reading of some musical words in the poetry by using some balanced words in the sentences followed by the musical phrases. What does a writer or literary person use? He uses the words to create his literature. He uses some words in the beginning and others in the end; some of them are common nouns and others are proper nouns; some are omitted and some others are mentioned; some are mentioned but by using the pronouns and some are repeated, and so on... Then he creates an image of the beautiful sentence, as required by the scientific grammar, then he gets the success in the setting, eventually he reaches a stage where the writer deserves to be given a virtue, as "Abdul Qāhir al-Jurjānī wrote in his book: "Evidences of Miracle". [4]

The translator or compiler must take into account to choose a single word appropriate to the purpose or theme of the graphic image, due to sensuous beauty of the word. The words must be classified by the matching between words and its required meanings according to the different literary terms and poetic issues.

As Ibn al-Athīr also sets a measure for us about the importance of the words, in his book: "The common examples" in which we can imagine the words and discernment of their descriptions, as he says: "You have to know that the sounds of words in hearing are like the persons, as people feared, as well the word of dignity, and imagination of the kindness for the subjects of humanity and ethics, as you can see the words in the poetry of Abu Tammām like the men rode their horses, with their weapons and ready to attack, and on the other hand you can see the words in the poetry of Al-Buḥturī like the beautiful women in beautiful colored clothes and with various kind of beautiful jewelries". [5]

It means that there is a soul behind every word that must be understood. So it must be in the mind that a single word is light on the tongue during its pronunciation and sweet in hearing. An author must also take into account of this sensuous beauty of words and the system of its formation to speak.

The translators and the writers must avoid the use of vulgar and colloquial phrases that have become as they were used too frequently, just like the old clothes because they have been used too many times, only the community of scholars is a good judge to decide which of the words is the best and standard one, and which is the unsuitable one, because each era has its linguistic lexicon, and each environment has its own dictionary for the common language among its members, and through this environment can be judged to select the suitable and new one, because the writing should be used for the expression written for the time, and those expressions must be translated in a language of the time.

Translator must be fluent in two languages: The language that is being translated by the language that is the goal of the translation, because if he cannot understand the meanings he cannot transfer those meanings to the language, which is the goal language. He must also not ignore the culture, in which those words had been used, and the time in which prepared that text, because the implications of the words – as it is understood - vary from an environment to another environment, and age to age, so the translator always tries to bring the words closer to the accurate meanings, sometimes succeeds and sometimes fails in his attempts.

The cultural or civilizational differences mean that the words that we use them to refer to some general and particular concepts are derived from a specific date related to the specific intellectual development that are still in the minds, and in the light of these concepts, it is very difficult to break the cordon, as they are a part of the Arab cultural configuration. Beside these

concepts there are some other concepts in the modern age that have no equivalents in the classical Arabic language.

### **Synonyms**

As for the synonyms, it has no presence for the interpreter, but only in the lexicon. Many of the scholars think that it is characteristic of the Arabic language. The languages in their essence do not know which is called the synonym, which cannot be understood, because it is unreasonable to believe that the owners of their language have invented more than one word to denote one thing, otherwise, their efforts went in vain, they lost rather than gained, they lost because of the possibility of intellectual confusion. Genius scientists of the language are able to prove that there are some nouns we think that they are "Synonyms", while they were originally used as the adjectives of nouns, then the nouns were dropped by the time, such as the Arabic word "Al-Muhannad" that was used for any sword made in India, but now it is used for any sharp sword, and there are many other words have the same situation.

Including those word that were originally metaphors, then the status of metaphors died, we began to think that they are synonyms, while they are in fact some dead metaphors. It is also possible that some of them return to the non-Arab languages or dialects of the various Arab tribes in the Arabian Peninsula and then they were collected by the writers of dictionaries as the synonyms. The tandem becomes either inducted into the method or in a diversion of thought. There is no tandem, but there is a confusion in the thought and lack of the clarity in seeing the things. [6]

So the writers and translators should not use what is called the tandem, they have to use only one word for one meaning as the requirements of the context. They should choose simple words for the simple phrases.

### **Dictionaries**

It is not necessary that the translator find the meaning of every word in the old dictionary. This is the fact that there is no single dictionary that follows the modern method of translation or to determine the meaning or meanings of the words indicated by the modern foreign dictionaries. This difference must be noted that there is a heretical language: The ancient language and the language of modern age, because the concepts change from time to time and the language that expresses them also changes.

Arabic language has a big problem, because of its long and large heritage and multiple levels, which is commonly known as the problem of duality of the language in every Arab country, which is the duality of classical and colloquial Arabic. The most important feature of classical Arabic language is that it reserves the grammatical and morphological features of heretical Arabic, which requires us to write and be aware of the basic structures of the classical heretical Arabic, so that the texts are published in a correct format in Arabic. The basic structures of classical Arabic are those mentioned in the books of Arabic Grammar. So the translator has to pay attention to this phenomenon that there is a journey from the classical Arabic to the vernacular language, which entered in the language of literature and poetry in the modern era.

We do not want to write a book in the art of translation, but we want to write these instructions that can be useful for those who translate into Arabic, because the translation is an art and a knowledge. This art needs to live up to the texts, practice and hard work, each interpreter has his own experience in the field of translation, which cannot be called the rules or the assets of

translation. The rules of translation are the same linguistic rules that illuminate the path of the interpreter that are written in the books of the linguistic grammar. They are guidelines that must be observed, so that the interpreter cannot mistake in the wording at the time of translation.

### **Rules of Simulations**

We have to know the importance of the translation and simulation and its impact on the transfer of the sciences and literatures to the other languages and literatures.

Simulation is a word means simulating the Latin Greece, along the trail in their desire to Renaissance Latin Literature, and this sense of simulation is different to Greece simulation, which was called by Aristotle, when he wanted to show the link between the art and the nature in general.

Horace says in his book: (Art of the poetry): "Follow the examples of Greeks and study them day and night". In this statement, he confesses that Greek emulation in their literature is fruitful, but it must not erase the poet's originality.

Roman critic (Quintilian) has studied the theory of simulation and taken some extensive steps in his explanation, he established some general rules mentioned as below:

**First:** The simulation of the writers and poets is an indispensable principle of art, which is intended to simulate the course of Latin Greece.

**Second:** The simulation is not easy, it requires a special talent in the writer who wants to emulate, like the simulation of nature.

**Third:** The simulation should not be limited to the words and phrases, because it is for the essence of the literary subject and its approaches.

**Fourth:** Who wants to emulate Greeks has to choose the models that easy for the writer to emulate and has the ability of decision to distinguish between the good and the inferior, then try to simulate well as he can.

**Finally:** He (Quintilian) decided that the simulation itself is not sufficient. It must not impede the creativity of the poet and not prevent his authenticity. [7]

Latin language in the study of Greek literature had been a clear example to indicate that the needy poor language can be established and rich after being affected by the finest and richest one. The languages can be modernized if its ideas and sources of inspiration are renewed. It means that the languages and literatures renew by the renewal of their intellectual sources in the ages of their revivals. Quickly added to the example of Latin another witness, which is the rise of Italian literature in the era of Renaissance after the impact of relation between two literatures: Greek and Latin. A strong hope leagued in the mind of the scholars in France that French language also will follow the example of Latin and Italian, to be advanced by the simulation of the old literatures. [8]

Joachim du Bellay: (1522-1560) sees that "without the simulations of Greeks and Romanians we will not be able to give our language that was the reason of fame of ancient peoples and the brilliance of their Highness." He sees that it is necessary for the poets to refer to the texts of ancient literatures and digest them. (Joachim du Bellay) says: "We have to follow the

methodological approach of Romans to know how they enriched their language through the simulation of Greece people and how they followed Greek characters having killed them in the field of search and knowledge, as they ate them and digested them, then changed them into Romanians flesh and blood.” [9]

The question is now: How do we imitate them by the translating or studying the ancient Greek and Latin languages?

Belter: (1517-1582) who belongs to a literary community sees that the importance of the faithful translation to the original text has (the virtue of enriching the language which is the goal of translation), because it transfers the beautiful phrases and wisdoms that enrich the language. No doubt that (the accurate translation is better than the invention could not get the success.) [10]

The result of this theory is that the absolute originality is impossible, because the most of poets and writers in their authenticity are indebted to their predecessors, and the fruitful simulation is a good way to enrich the languages. So the simulation is not the pure imitation; it is meant to be the original digestion, not the subjugated tradition.

This; not harm a writer - whatever his genius and whatever his art - to be affected by the production of others, conveying it to himself, to produce a product in his own color and nature characterized by his talents. Every valuable idea in the civilized world rooted in the history of human thought, which is the heritage of all the people in general, and the heritage of talented people of them in particular.

Paul Valery Says: “Nothing is better to highlight the originality of the writer and his personality than that he fed the views of others, as the loin is not but only a few sheep digestible”.

The originality of a man is not to live alone depending only upon himself, but the originality is that the man enriches his idea by the ideas of others. By this measure we can distinguish between the original writer and the author depends upon his memory only, the original writer follows the line of his intellectual journey, he does not deviate from the prelude to a witness or to quote or include, but he follows the line of his own original thought, as the inherent does not prevent him from supporting his point of the view that may be against the heritage of those who had good deeds in their past. [11]

After having a look at the theory of simulation and the authenticity of heritage and process of its development, we know that how Muslims and Arabs in the eras of renaissance developed their scientific and literary heritage, through the translation and emulation of arts and sciences of Greek and Persia. Now we have to look at the translation of Urdu and Persian poetry of Muḥammad Iqbāl into Arabic as an example.

### **Translation of Muḥammad Iqbāl's Urdu and Persian Poetry into Arabic**

Someone can wonder that why we cannot find a serious comparison between Iqbāl and the other Arab poets. We think that the translations of Muḥammad Iqbāl's Urdu and Persian Poetry into Arabic that have done in Arab countries emerged late or did not come to the light in its full form. Iqbāl's ideas and literature appeared clearly in the Arab world only belatedly, because of the different language, which precludes the comparative studies. We cannot compare the technical characteristics of poetry in a language with its artistic characteristics in

another language, because the translation works can transfer the meaning of a language to another language, but it cannot translate the technical characteristics of a language into another language. We cannot trust entirely on the translation work only, since it does not dispense with the original text, even if it is a faithful and honest to the translated origin, because there is no way to translate the artistic characteristics. Without these characteristics, the translator's efforts remain entirely unproductive. The original text remains the same, as it was like the sword inside its sheath. Therefore, Joachim du Bellay sees that every translation is as a betrayal of the original text and the worthlessness of its value, but he exaggerated. [12] We do not tend to what he said, but we tend to say that the reliable translation of the original one has (the virtue of enriching the language to be translated) [13], because of the words, phrases and wisdoms transferred to the text through the translation. Sometimes an accurate translation is better than innovation that has no success.

As for the translation of Iqbāl's poetry, there is no doubt that 'Abd al-Wahhāb 'Azzām played an important role in the transfer of Iqbāl's thought and his philosophy into Arabic, and published his ideas in the Arab world, but when we study what 'Azzām has translated and compare to its origin, we find a great magnificence in matching Arabic text with the original in Persian or Urdu. Therefore, the reader is required to read it more than once. 'Azzām's translation is worthy of study because it is the closest poetic translation to the original text. Although the translation referred to him was the spring from which the writers and commentators drew and wrote about Iqbāl, his poetry and message, and it was the wealth that helped then in forming their views in Iqbāl's thought and philosophy. I believe that there is an urgent need to shed more light on his thought and philosophy through the translation.

We must not forget that the other translators such as 'Umar Bahā' al-'Amīrī from Syria, 'Amīra Nūr al-Dīn from Iraq, Al-Şāwy 'Alī Sha'lān from Egypt and 'Amīn al-Zubairī from Yemen have also translated Iqbāl's poetry into the language of poetry in Arabic. Although those translators who mentioned their names did not translate all the books of Iqbāl, but their translations are more successful than 'Azzām's translation technically, they are also worthy of attention and study.

'Amīra Nūr al-Dīn was a young poet when she translated Muḥammad Iqbāl's Urdu poetry into Arabic. She was very successful in conveying the spirit of Iqbāl to the Arab world because she was fluent in Persian, which is a second language in Iraq. Urdu is also more popular in Iraq than the other languages for the visitors. Therefore, she tried to understand the spirit of Iqbāl's poetry in Urdu, and was successful in her attempts when she translated Iqbāl's poetry.

As well as the translations of Al-Şāwy 'Alī Sha'lān are quite successful, even 'Azzām felt that he cannot translate better than what Al-Şāwy 'Alī Sha'lān has translated into Arabic. When 'Azzām translated Muḥammad Iqbāl's poetry: (Secrets and Symbols) into Arabic ignored the testimony of Ḥusain b. 'Alī and title of al-Zahra': Daughter of the Prophet. When he was asked why he ignored to translate these poetic pieces? He said: Al-Şāwy 'Alī Sha'lān has translated it. I left it until I can translate it better than his translation, but I could not translate the remaining pieces of (Secrets and Symbols) with a lot of concerns and the book: (Secrets and Symbols) was printed without completing the translation.

There is no doubt that 'Azzām was quite successful in understanding the meaning of Persian verses, because he was fluent also in Persian, and was very accurate in the translation of meaning, even used the margins to illustrate the concepts and poetic purposes, but he had been mistaken when he decided to present a poetic translation of Iqbāl's poetry, as we see that he

has sometimes violated the weights and rhymes, and often he was not bounded to the text in the translation of poetry in the poetic style. Therefore, the translation lost its beauty and magnificence and the desired impact in the hearts of readers. On the contrary, we see the seriousness in the expression, and the freedom to use the weighted structures in the translations of Baha' al-'Amīrī, Sheikh al-Şāwy 'Alī Sha'lān, and 'Amīra Nūr al-Din who set their initial eyes on the weight and melody; but 'Azzām was a brilliant poet, and fluent in Arabic. We note his ability in the translation of the poem: (Mosque of Cordoba) in which the weights and rhymes were committed fully to each stanza.

### Examples of Iqbāl's Translated Poems

- The succession of day and night, is the architect of events.
- The succession of day and night, is the fountain-head of life and death.
- The succession of day and night, is a two-tone silken twine,
- With which the Divine Essence, prepares its apparel of Attributes.
- The succession of day and night, is the reverberation of the symphony of Creation.
- Through its modulations, the Infinite demonstrates the parameters of possibilities.
- What else is the reality of your days and nights?
- Besides a surge in the river of time, sans day, sans night.
- Annihilation is the end of all beginnings; Annihilation is the end of all ends.
- Extinction, the fate of everything; hidden or manifest, old or new.
- Yet in this very scenario indelible is the stamp of permanence
- On the deeds of the good and godly.
- Deeds of the godly radiate with Love,
- The essence of life, which death is forbidden to touch.
- Fast and free flows the tide of time,
- But Love itself is a tide that stems all tides.
- In the chronicle of Love there are other times, not only the past, present and future;
- Times for which no names have yet been coined.
- Love is the breath of Gabriel. Love is the heart of Holy Prophet.
- Love is the messenger of God. Love is the Word of God.
- Love is the commander of marching troops,
- Love is a wayfarer has thousands station.
- Love is the plectrum that brings the music to the string of life.
- Love is the light of life, Love is the fire of life.
- To Love, you owe your being, O, Harem of Cordoba,
- To Love, that is eternal; never waning, never fading. [14]

The accurate translation to the original text in our opinion was done by 'Abu al-Ḥasan'Alī al-Ḥasanī Al-Nadawī, published in the form of a book entitled (Iqbāl's Masterpieces). Nadawī presented in his book different aspects of Muḥammad Iqbāl's thought in a manner that is consistent with Iqbāl's own feelings.

Thus, Iqbāl came to the Arab countries, and was welcomed by the Arab community. We can learn about his Islamic ideas through these translated verses:

- True love must endure hardships and difficulties, and must take flowers from the fire like Ibrahīm (Khalīl Allah). [15]
- "But the life is just a meaning of harnessing: (harnessing the universe and nature), but only the wishful thinking is a magical key to harnessing. [Means the man must control the universe and nature. The desires must be only to reach the purposes of harnessing]. [16]
- There is a point of light, which is called the self, which is the spark of our lives under our soil. (He means that the self is in our bodies driving our lives). [17]
- The self gets the strength by the love. It becomes more vibrant and more vibrant by the love.
- When the self becomes powerful by the love can put the world under to its orders and actions and then the self will be God's will. The moon can be into pieces as soon as the will wishes.
- Iqbāl addresses the Islamic nation and says: "O You are saving the wisdom of the Holy Qur'an honestly, so you have to recover your lost unity." [18]
- Mirror of our individual is his unity. His mirror is his image.
- The value of individuals is necessary for their religion. The system of nation is based on the individual. [19]
- The believer is from the love (faith) and the love (faith) is from the believer, the love is able to accomplish what cannot be accomplished by our senses and our minds.
- The sword is just to preserve the glory of religion and the purpose of its use is to preserve religious laws.
- Muslim should not prostrate to any Pharaoh, because he is not a servant of anyone except God.
- We can open the world with the strong certainty (faith), hard work and love, because these things are in fact the weapon of men in the struggle for the life.
- The land cannot bound the heart of the Muslim. Nobody can see in his land "how many and how much." [20]
- Muslim does not be confused in the land, but every homeland is confused in his heart and soul.
- I pray to God Almighty to make you face a flood, because waves of your sea do not know any movement.
- There is no limit to the homeland of the believer, because his homeland is everywhere.

- I learned from the Prophet's sky journey that the heavens can be under the world of mankind. [As we see that the man has reached the moon and stars in the contemporary world].
- This idea has emerged from the history of great Islamic nation that you are the leader of the nations in the land of Asia. (He means the eastern Muslims).
- You have to break the racial idols based on the color and blood. You have to lose your existence in the nation, so there is no difference among Iranian, Afghan and the other peoples in the world.
- Who destroyed the tyranny of Caesar and King of Persia? It was the poverty of Abu Dhar, truth of Salmān al-Fārsī and the strength of 'Alī b. 'Abī Ṭālib. [21]

Here is a reference to three qualities if they are found in a nation can get its lofty status, as any other nation cannot overtake it. These qualities were found in the three great men of the companions of the Prophet, namely 'Abu Dhar al-Ghifārī, Salmān al-Fārsī and 'Alī b. 'Abī Ṭālib.

## CONCLUSION

This is the poet, philosopher, thinker and believer Muḥammad Iqbāl who knows the doctrine of Islam and his message, who loved the Holy Qur'an in his whole life and all of his ideas are in the love. He wants to tell Muslims in the East what is the spiritual power of Islam? He wants to see their status very high in the world. He wants to prepare the Muslim to live a happy virtuous life to build a new history, so his literature can be named an Islamic literature: Literature of the life, power and glory.

## REFERENCES

- [1] Al-Jābirī Muḥammad 'Abid. (1986). We and Heritage. Morocco: Arab Cultural Center. pp. 11-12
- [2] Al-Suyūṭī. Jalāl al-Dīn 'Abu al-Faḍl 'Abd al-Raḥmān b. 'Abi Bakr. (1970). Maintenance of logic and talk about the art of logic and speech. Cairo: Dār al-Nahda. vol. 1. p. 47 and Al-Jābirī 'Abid. Heritage and Modernity. p. 149-150
- [3] Mandūr. Muḥammad. (No date). Literature and its arts. Cairo: Renaissance of Egypt for printing and publishing and distribution. p. 38-39
- [4] Al-Jurjani. 'Abd al-Qahir. (No date). Sign of miracles. p. 67
- [5] 'Abu Krisha. Ṭaha Muṣṭafa. (1976). Balance of literary criticism. Cairo: p: 24
- [6] Mandūr. Muḥammad. (No date). Literature and its arts, p. 188
- [7] Muhamad Shams al-Din. Salahaddin. (2009)..Lectures in comparative literature. Jakarta: Solo Press. p. 13-14
- [8] Hilāl. Muḥammad Ghonymi. (1962). Comparative Literature. Cairo: (third edition) Anglo-Egyptian Library p. 24
- [9] Ibid, p. 25
- [10] Ibid, p. 26
- [11] Mandūr. Muḥammad. (No date).Literature and its arts. p. 185
- [12] Hilāl. Muḥammad Ghonymi. (1962). Comparative Literature. p. 25

- [13] Ibid., P. 26
- [14] Muḥammad Iqbāl. Jibril's Wing. Poem: Mosque of Cordoba, p. 84
- [15] Al-Jindī. Anwar: (1977). Iqbāl and contemporary Arab poets (essay). Pakistan: Mah-e-Naw Magazine, special issue for Muḥammad Iqbāl. P. 397
- [16] Ibid. P. 399
- [17] Muḥammad Iqbāl. Divan Farsi: Secrets and Symbols. P. 60
- [18] Muḥammad Iqbāl: Secrets and Symbols. P. 61
- [19] Muḥammad Iqbāl: Secrets and Symbols. P. 81. Divan Farsi: Secrets and Symbols. p: 97-98-99
- [20] Muhamad Shams al-Din. Salahaddin. (1991). Islamic trend in the poetry of Muḥammad Iqbāl. Mumbai - India. P. 63-64
- [21] Al-Jindī. Anwar: (1977). Iqbāl and contemporary Arab poets (essay). Pakistan: Mah - e - Naw Magazine, special issue: Muḥammad Iqbāl. P: 400